

'Maaro! Kaapo! Baalo!'

State, Society, and Communalism in Gujarat

People's Union for Democratic Rights

Delhi

May 2002

PREFACE

Images of corpse filled trains are so potent a symbol in India because they inevitably conjure up the actual and inscribed memories of Partition, when trains from either side of what became India and Pakistan would arrive with dead bodies. The burning of the Sabarmati Express at Godhra on the morning of February 27 is destined to become an intrinsic part of a new 21st century partition narrative, unless something can be done to stop the poison spreading.

The Sabarmati Express had been full of karsevaks on their way back from Ayodhya. They had gone to help construct a Ram temple on the site of the Babri Masjid, which an earlier generation of karsevaks had demolished ten years ago. And now some of them were being brought back dead, burnt alive in a horrifying and gruesome attack, by a Muslim mob just outside Godhra station.

It took a day for organised 'retaliation' to begin. 28 February and 1 March were declared 'Gujarat Bandh' and 'Bharat Bandh' respectively. The Bandh, it turns out, was only for law abiding citizens – VHP and Bajrang Dal mobs had full control over the streets. Rumours and falsities abounded, including some which were given the authority of newspaper headlines. The *Sandesh*, for example, 'reported' on 28 February that the attacking Muslims had abducted Hindu women from the train. A day later, it announced that the raped and mutilated bodies of two of these women had been found in Kalol near Godhra. The VHP and its supporters circulated these newspaper accounts around the state in order to incite and justify one of the worst communal carnages in India's recent history.

Official figures of the dead stand at roughly 950 till early May. These continue to rise as the 'missing' slowly get acknowledged as dead. Unofficial figures stand at over 2000. Death statistics do not take into account those injured, assaulted, those whose houses have been burnt and families affected by the killing of the breadwinner. Attacks on Muslims took place in 19 districts of Gujarat, and were particularly intense in 10 districts along the north east-south west axis. As the still mounting statistics of lost lives and property show, the official use of the word 'riot', evoking images of group clashes, is not just wrong but a deliberate effort to obfuscate the issue. What happened was a systematic effort to terrorise Muslims and reduce them to the status of second class citizens by taking away their lives, livelihood and shelter. It was a genocide that was almost unprecedented in its spread and intensity, the degree of organisation and attention to detail, and the extent to which representatives of the state participated in the attacks.

PUDR sent a fact-finding team in early April 2002 to investigate into the violence in Gujarat and its implications for the rights of citizens. A number of teams had by then already investigated and reported on the

large-scale and brutal massacres of Muslims, particularly in Ahmadabad and Vadodara. Several reports had also covered the Godhra incident. We visited the Godhra Railway Station and the burnt compartment, and spoke to officials and survivors from S6, and also two relief camps in Ahmadabad. However our team chose to concentrate on the rural areas and small towns in six affected districts which had been relatively less investigated. We met a cross section of victims in 21 relief camps in the districts of Panchmahals, Dahod, Mahesana, Sabarkantha, Anand, Kheda, Ahmadabad (city), and also visited villages where attacks had occurred in some areas. In Ahmadabad city and Gandhinagar, we briefly visited a few camps and met officials, journalists, lawyers. The team interviewed many officials – Secretary Revenue (in charge of relief and rehabilitation), Gujarat; the DGP, Gujarat; the SPs of Panchmahals, Kheda and Sabarkantha; the Collectors of Anand, Sabarkantha and Panchmahals; the Station Superintendent, Godhra and many local police and revenue officials. The team also met people from various walks of life, representatives of traders associations and the chambers of commerce, representatives of the VHP and Jamiat-e-Ulema Hind and the NGOs assisting in relief work.

As we go to press, the focus of national attention has shifted away from Gujarat to the possibility of war with Pakistan. Yet, the situation in Gujarat continues to be tense, with sporadic reports of communal violence coming in. Religious communities are completely polarized. More importantly, Muslims in Gujarat live in a continuing state of fear, with none of their basic rights as citizens or humans met. This report is an attempt to understand and explain how some of these basic rights have been violated and to highlight not just the role of communal organizations like the RSS, VHP, Bajrang Dal and BJP, but the fundamentally discriminatory nature of state action both at the time and after.

Contents

I. The Attack on the Sabarmati Express at Godhra: The Immediate Spark	5
II. Attacks on Muslims: A Sample of Incidents	7
III. What the Incidents tell us: Emerging Patterns	27
IV. Role of the State	34
V. Relief and Rehabilitation	39
VI. Conclusion	48
<i>Annexures</i>	
1. Short accounts of incidents not included in Chapter II	50
2. List of accused	55
3. List of Dead (comparing official and unofficial figures)	59
4. A Running FIR	61
5. Socio-economic factsheet on Gujarat	62
6. RSS Ideology and Agenda in Gujarat	63
7. The Immediate National Context: <i>preparations for temple construction at 'Ramjanmabhoomi'/Babri Masjid</i>	65
8. A brief background to the rise of communalism in Gujarat	66
9. 1969 Riots in Ahmadabad	67

I.

The Immediate Spark

Attack on the Sabarmati Express at Godhra

Our team began the fact finding with a visit to Godhra. We met the station-master at Godhra, the S.P Panchmahals, and two survivors of the S6 compartment of the Sabarmati Express. We also visited the bogies lying on a siding at Godhra railway station. Mr. Jaisinh Katija, the Godhra Station Superintendent, told us that the karsevaks had been going to Ayodhya from early February. Various BJP MLAs had been arranging for the tickets of the karsevaks from the special quota allotted to them, while many others travelled ticketless. A Faizabad newspaper, *Jan Morcha*, reported on 25 February that Bajrang Dal workers travelling to Ayodhya on the Sabarmati Express had attacked Muslim passengers with iron rods and trishuls, pulled off women's burqas and forced them to say Jai Shri Ram. A youth who protested against this behaviour was thrown off the train between Patranga and Rojagaon stations and Muslim men were assaulted at Rudauli station.

The attack at Godhra happened when a batch of karsevaks was returning from Ayodhya. According to Jyoti Punwani (*The Hindu*, April 15) and Teesta Setalvad (*Communalism Combat*, March-April 2002, No. 77-78) both of whom interviewed eyewitnesses and survivors, the Sabarmati Express arrived at Godhra station almost five hours late, at 7.43 am instead of its scheduled time of 2.55 am. Some karsevaks had an altercation with Muslim tea vendors at the station over non-payment, and pulled the beard of one such vendor, Siddique Bakr. A 17 year old girl, Sophiya Khan, who was standing on the platform with her mother and sister was pulled towards the train by a karsevak, but ultimately released when she cried out. Less than a km away from the station, someone pulled the chain of the train, which stopped just in front of Signal faliya, a Muslim Ghanchi dominated locality. A mob of anywhere between 500 to 2000 gathered and began to throw stones at the train.

One specific compartment S6 was targeted. By 8.30 a.m. S6 had gone up in flames and 58 people were burnt dead, including 26 women and 12 children. 1 died later in hospital, taking the total toll to 59. It is not clear how many of them were karsevaks.

By afternoon, the train minus two bogies (S6 and S5) was on its way to Ahmadabad. The bodies of the victims were brought to Ahmadabad Civil Hospital in the early hours of the 28 morning (2.30 am) where a crowd of some 500 people, including BJP Ministers, was waiting for them.

We met Gayatri Panchal in Ahmadabad. Gayatri is a student of class 11, who lost her parents and two sisters in the train carnage. She said that there was intense stone throwing followed by burning rags being thrown into the train. She and a friend of her sister's, both of whom were also in the S6 compartment managed to survive by escaping from the window, the bars of which had been loosened by the stone-pelting and the fire. They then crawled under the compartment to the other side where the attackers were fewer in number. They were able to defend themselves by throwing stones etc. along with other karsevaks till the fire brigade and the police arrived. We also met VHP activist Rakesh Kumar Kantilal Patel, cable TV operator. While he survived the attack, his friend, 21 year old Chirag, a factory worker and Bajrang Dal activist died when he went back into the train to save some people. Rakesh spoke of how there had been some stone-pelting on the train in Godhra station itself and how they had responded in self defence. He also stated that the passengers had closed the vestibule door because they feared the attackers would be able to board the train easily through it. He helped pull out Gayatri and others from the mob and got away on the other side.

Initially, the Gujarat government announced a cash compensation of Rs. 2 lakh for

the victims of the train attack and Rs. 1 lakh for the victims of subsequent violence. Following public outcry, compensation was scaled down to a uniform Rs. 1 lakh (Rs. 40,000/- in cash and Rs. 60,000/- in Narmada Sriniddhi Bonds). While the BJP government has reduced compensation, the VHP has been making political capital out of the pain of the victims' families. It wanted to carry the ashes of the dead around the country in an *asthi yatra* in order to whip up passions, but following protest by some NDA allies, made do with glossy pamphlets carrying photos of half burnt naked bodies. These are also up on display in the Ahmadabad city VHP office. The karsevaks' families have been given large, colourful, portrait photographs of the family members killed, with their names inscribed below.

Chief Minister Narendra Modi described the attack as a "pre-planned, violent act of terrorism" (PTI, 28 February) and Home Minister Advani was quick to claim it was ISI sponsored. The Railway Police, on the other hand, indicate that it was a spontaneous combustion, and they had no inkling of any large gathering prior to the attack. According to the Godhra Station Master, there had been special police arrangements when the karsevaks had boarded the train to go to Ayodhya in early February, especially at Godhra station, seen by all authorities as a communally sensitive area. On 27 February, however, extra police force was not provided and at the time of the attack there were only three policemen on the platform, as it was the time for changing duty. The station Master also remarked that the Bajrang Dal/VHP should have remembered that Godhra was a sensitive area before indulging in provocative acts. The Police Superintendent of Panchmahals verified to us that the rumours of Hindu women being dragged off the train and raped were completely false.

On 6 March the one-member Justice K.G Shah Commission of Inquiry was set up to probe the course of incidents leading up to the Sabarmati Express fire, the question of

preplanning etc. It was only after public protest that the subsequent violence in the state was added on to this primary brief. The Commission has not had a single sitting till date and has recently extended the date for receipt of applications. On 21 May, the Commission was expanded to include Justice Nanavati.

Investigation of the Sabarmati Express incident at Godhra is being conducted by the state CID and the Anti-Terrorist Squad (ATS). Till 8 April, 19 bodies had still not been identified, and evidence had been sent for DNA and other forensic testing. Compartment S6 is totally burnt out, while only the connecting vestibule of Compartment S5 is burnt. Curiously, however, for a piece of such vital evidence the bogies were lying unattended. People are free to walk into the compartment, put in and remove things as they please. If the investigating agencies were serious about the investigation, such crucial forensic evidence should have been sealed, as was done in the case of the World Trade Centre in New York. Judging by the conversation of the policeman who showed us the way there, the burnt compartment is also rapidly becoming a pilgrimage site and could be used to incite further tension. We saw two pictures of Hindu gods carefully placed side by side on a seat, with only the edges burnt, and a slightly burnt Hanuman chalisa just near the entrance. Both of these items were at variance with the state of the rest of the burnt bogey.

Curfew was declared in Godhra within hours of the attack on the train. The police arrested about 62 Muslims including seven minor boys in combing operations launched in Signal faliya. They were booked under POTO (Prevention of Terrorism Ordinance), but following a story in the Indian Express on biased use of POTO against Muslims just before it was enacted as law in parliament, this particular charge was dropped. However, all 62 continue in jail. Among those accused are Godhra Municipal Councillors Mohammad Hussain Kalota, Abdul Dhantiya and Salim Shaik. Further arrests were also made. On 23

May, chargesheets were filed against 68 accused.

In the midst of the curfew on 28 February, the district collector ordered the demolition of some 250-300 Muslim cabins/shops in Signal faliya and later, in Polan bazaar on March 3 and 4. This included two cabins that had a high court stay against demolition. The Collector said that the 28 February demolitions were done because of complaints from the railway authorities of the threat posed by these shops, and the possibility of future attacks. The later demolitions were done as an anti-encroachment drive to help the army move through these areas. The move is widely perceived, however, as an anti-Muslim measure, especially because it involved a large number of police personnel and vehicles and happened at a time when the relief camp organizers were pleading for vehicles and security to help them rescue Muslim villagers being attacked by mobs. They were told that the administration did not have sufficient manpower for this.

The Godhra train incident was indeed horrible and condemnable. For the BJP, how-

ever, it has become merely an excuse to justify the genocide which followed. (According to Chief Minister Modi, quoted in *Times of India*, March 2, 2002, "Every action has an equal and opposite reaction"). Our investigations make clear, however, that while Godhra may have been the trigger, there was nothing spontaneous about the systematic manner in which mobs led by the Vishwa Hindu Parishad, Bajrang Dal and BJP went about killing Muslims in Gujarat. Hatred against and victimization of the minorities has been built up for several years now (see Annexure 6). In 2000, a bandh called by the BJP to protest against the killing of Amarnath pilgrims in Kashmir had similar consequences for Gujarati Muslims, albeit on a much lesser scale. The Gujarat government must have known that the VHP bandh to protest the train attack in Godhra would have even more serious consequences. That they chose to support the bandh anyway is evidence of state complicity right at the start. In short, this kind of carnage would have been impossible without the leadership provided by the sangh parivar and the sanction provided by the state.

II. Attacks on Muslims

A Sample of Incidents

We collected accounts of approximately 100 incidents, which occurred in 76 places. In this section we describe what happened in a sample of such incidents. These have been chosen to provide a sense of both the most horrific massacres and the pattern of killings and property destruction in different districts: Panchmahals, Dahod, Mahesana, Sabarkantha, Anand, Kheda, Ahmadabad and Gandhinagar. The names of those accused and some of those killed in these incidents are incorporated in Annexures 2 and 3. Some details of all the places covered by the team, including those which are not listed below, are presented in Annexure 1.

District Panchmahals

Pandarwada, Taluka Khanpur

TRUST BETRAYED; 38 KNOWN DEAD

Pandarwada village has 500 to 600 Hindu families and about 70 to 80 Muslim families. The Hindus are Brahmans, Patels and Vanias who are prosperous wholesale traders and own cloth and grocery shops in the village. The Muslims are largely agricultural labourers and small peasants, some of whom own land on both sides of the canal that flows by the village. This land is fertile and according to the

victims some of the village Hindus want to acquire control over it. Some of the Muslims are also daily wage labourers with Hindu shop owners. The Hindu leaders of the village have served as sarpanch and taluka members and include professionals like a doctor, a lawyer, school teachers and the principal of the local high school. Several of them have been active in organizing VHP meetings for over a decade. The main chowk (square) of the village where Hindu and Muslim festivals were held together earlier was named 'Ayodhya chowk' after 6 December 1992 and Muslims stopped using it since then. In the past six months several VHP meetings were held where Bajrang Dal activists were also called. These activists wrote anti-Muslim slogans on the public walls glorifying the Hindus and asking the Muslims to go to Pakistan. At a meeting held about 15 days before the ghastly massacres took place in the village on 1 March, provocative statements were made by BJP/VHP/Bajrang Dal leaders from loud-speakers to frighten Muslims and to instigate the Hindus to arm themselves to confront the Muslims. The meeting was attended by nearly 400 men and women from Pandarwada and nearby villages.

The killings in Pandarwada were organized in amazing detail. The local Hindu leaders had mobilized a mammoth 15,000 strong mob of Bhils of nearby villages who came on 28 February and again on 1 March when they went on a rampage for nearly the whole day. The mob looted the goods and took away Muslims livestock, destroyed and set fire to their houses and killed several of them as they ran to save their lives. It is said that they were offered Rs. 50,000 for every Muslim killed. One of the leaders of the mob was the franchisee of the ration shop, Jaswant Patel, who is also taluka up-pramukh. He had not given any kerosene to the Muslim villagers since Id, and this very kerosene was then given to the attackers.

In two major incidents during the attack on 1 March in Pandarwada, local leaders deliberately deceived the Muslims by offering

to shelter them. Mahendra Vakil told one group of some 150 Muslims, to hide in his old house, while Jaswant Patel told another large group, to take shelter in his wheat fields. According to the survivors they trusted these men because they were their neighbours. Mahendra Vakil told the Muslims to take in the wood lying outside his house so that the mob would not use it to set the house on fire. Then he led the mob attack and burnt the house down. Jaswant Patel similarly led the mob in attacking, hacking and burning those who took shelter in his fields. At least 38 Muslims, including several children, were killed in these several attacks. Some of them were guests from outside who were part of a wedding party. During the attack, eyewitnesses state that a Bajrang Dal leader drove through the village on his motorcycle to see that Muslims did not run away and were executed according to their plans. Similarly, a Tata Sumo with men wearing saffron dupattas, went through the village to supervise the killings. Even the Mamlatdar (Taluka Development Officer, TDO) and the police were present, silently watching the massacre. Many of those who managed to escape were badly beaten up, stabbed with swords incurring severe injuries. Some had their heads pierced through with sharp iron rods (gupti). Some of them are still in critical condition in hospitals in Godhra and Lunawada. All the survivors of the attack including women and small children, fled from the village and hid wherever they could, in the hills and jungle, some for 3 to 4 long days, without food or water, young children chewing the leaves of the trees to survive. Each had to run and hide from violent mobs waiting for them on all roads, and run a little more, and hide again, to save his or her life. In the process family members got separated from one another. Women saw their husbands hacked and burnt before their eyes. One found her 3 year old son sitting next to the body of her husband, whose face had been so badly dismembered that only his adam's apple was left. According to the survivors a large number of people from the village are still missing, and

the number of people killed is much higher than the officially recognized number.

Today, with their houses completely destroyed, their property looted and animals taken away, their mosque and dargah burnt, there are no Muslims in Pandarwada. They are staying in camps at Godhra and Lunawada. Some of the widows are several months pregnant and have no families who can take care of them and their children. When two women went back to the village recently, to see their houses, the police asked them if they had gone there to die. None of the Muslims in the two camps have the courage ever to return to their village. Little Noorunnisa, ten years old, her fingers cut, huddled up in Godhra camp, still dreams of becoming a doctor. Miles away, in Lunawada camp, 21 year old Maksuda Salim who had been married only a year and a half tells us shyly but persistently to write down her husband's exact age, in the hope that she will get justice.

The PSI Khanpur has filed an official FIR and made some arrests, but nothing that inspires confidence in their impartiality. An Indian Express report of May 6 lists various conditions imposed by the Hindus before they will allow their Muslim neighbours to return, including that a Muslim doctor who owned a computer be expelled, on the grounds that he used it to keep in touch with the ISI in Pakistan. Their hatred is evidently well infused with paranoia.

Anjanwa, Taluka Santrampur:

WOMEN AND CHILDREN THROWN INTO WELLS;
11 KNOWN DEAD

Anjanwa is a village with 39 Muslim and about 500 other families. All except 3 Muslim families have about 2 to 3 acres of land in the village. The Hindus (all backward caste, mostly Baria) and the adivasis also have land. Muslims have lived in this village since Santrampur was a princely state. The settlement is scattered with each family having a house on their own agricultural land. The

Muslim houses are in fact two kilometres away from the main road. There are no newspapers, television or telephones in the village. Vehicles can go only up to a point on the undulating kuchha road in the village. The houses are accessible only on foot. The sprawling village is surrounded by hills on all sides.

With no communication facilities Anjanwa had no news of the Godhra incident. On March 2, two Muslim shops belonging to Idris Abdul Sheikh and Burhan Abdul Sheikh were burnt. The owners used to commute from Lunawada so were not there at the time. On 3 March, a mob of 500 men came in the morning from the east, armed with weapons and beating drums. They burnt the mosque and then the Muslim houses. Then they went off at 3 pm and came back again at 6 p.m. again with the frightening beating of drums and shouting 'Maaro! Kaapo! Baalo!' (Kill! Hack! Burn!) and stayed till the early hours of the next morning. According to the sarpanch, one of the attackers was wearing a helmet, and some others had covered their faces. They were dressed in shirts, trousers, boots, socks, and one of them was carrying a camera bag.

The Muslims who had been hiding in the hills during the attack, returned after the mob left, in the early hours of March 4. They asked the sarpanch to call for police protection. According to the sarpanch he called the Congress MLA (an adivasi) of the area on morning of 4 March, who in turn told the police. The police said they would send a force. When it did not arrive he tried the police again and was passed between the Mamlatdar and the PSI, each of whom said it was the other person's responsibility. The police van finally did arrive at around 7.30-8.00 p.m. on 4 March. However, some villagers told them that nothing was wrong, and unable to see signs of the attack from the main road, the police returned to Santrampur. On the 5th morning the sarpanch once again made frantic phone calls to the Santrampur police station, and was told that a van would come to collect the villagers. He asked the Muslims to collect in the village high

school so that they could leave immediately when the police came.

In the evening two sets of mobs came from opposite directions and attacked the waiting Muslims. As the Muslims ran to save themselves in different directions, sections of the mob followed them. 42-year-old Rukaiya Gafur and her two daughters were not able to run fast enough. They were surrounded by the mob at one end of the village. Rukaiya was brutally hacked to death with swords. Her body was thrown into a dry well (known as Wazir Amdu's well). Her two daughters, 13 and one and a half years old respectively were also attacked, but managed to survive. Two men, one over 75 years old and moving slowly with difficulty and another too sick to run were also caught by the mob. They were burnt alive in the fields. The bodies of Rukaiya and the two men were recovered on 6 March when the collector and SP visited the village.

Some women and small children who were unable to escape were gheraoed by a section of the mob near the sarpanch's well. They were attacked with swords and dharias, and eleven of them were thrown into the well. Three women managed to survive in the crevices of the well and were pulled out later by the army, which arrived on the 5th evening. Eight others who had been hacked and thrown died, including four children. Their bodies were pulled out on 6 March.

The army took the survivors to Godhra and Lunawada camps on 5 March. Some people who had hidden in the fields and hills around Anjanwa were rescued on 6 March. The survivors have identified 27 men of their own village and of the surrounding villages who led the mob. The Muslim fields are now deserted, their houses burnt. Their cattle roam stray, at least those which have not yet been taken away by other villagers. The survivors, like those in Pandarwada, are unwilling to return with many of the killers at large. Two FIRs were lodged in the case and some arrests have been made on the basis of the names of accused given by the survivors.

Mora-Suliath, taluka Morvad-Hadap

FROM REEL TO REAL LIFE CHAUVINISM;
SAVED BY THE ARMY; NO DEATHS.

Mora and Suliath are two villages, 1 km apart and are commonly referred to as Mora-Suliath. Mora has a total of 300-400 houses, of which 50 are Muslim houses. The rest are Rabaris, Soni, Panchal, Harijan and Bhoi. Suliath consists entirely of Bhil adivasis. There are two faliyas in Mora where Muslims mainly live: masjid faliya and bus stand faliya.

The villagers heard that two Sindhis from Godhra had come to Mora in jeeps on the night of 28 February and given money and liquor to adivasis to kill Muslims. They also held meetings in Methral and Suliath to plan attacks. As a result of this planning, a mob of about 1000-1500 adivasis from nearby villages - Methral (10 km away from Mora), Vadodar (10 km), Dauli (6 km), Navagam (5 km), Sagwada (5 km), Bhata (4-5 km), Anjanwa (10 km), Godhar (15 km) - came to Mora village on the 1st around 2.00 pm. About a hundred Muslim men and boys confronted them with stones and there was stone throwing on both sides for a while. Then the adivasis ran away. At night they went around in lashkaris (intervillage/city mini vans) and tempos and collected adivasis from surrounding villages. They surrounded Mora at 9 pm and started burning outlying houses, continuing till 3-4 am. 25-30 houses were burnt that night. The masjid faliya people were all gathered in the masjid at this time, but the bus station faliya people were in their houses.

The next morning on 2 March, a much bigger crowd of 10-15,000 adivasis and Hindus came at 10.00 am and started burning and looting houses. The crowd surrounded the masjid with burning tyres and wood and set fire to it. There were 150 people trapped inside the masjid for two hours. All the people from the bus stand faliya - again about 150 - were gathered in the house of Haji Isak Abdul Majeed, and this house was also surrounded and set on fire. The mob was shouting, "We don't want Muslims, kill them." At 5 p.m. the

military came from Godhra and fired on the mob, who eventually dispersed, and rescued the trapped Muslims. Had the army arrived even half an hour later, the Muslims would all have died of asphyxiation. Given the crowd, the army told them that they must choose between lives and valuables, so people got into the trucks without any thing at all. Inevitably, it was all then looted.

The masjid has been badly desecrated and destroyed – the mob wrote ‘Bhattiji Maharaj ki Jai, and ‘Jai Shri Ram’ on the walls, and initially put up a saffron flag on it. If evidence was needed of the kind of mental framework that Bollywood jingoism reflects and produces, one need look no further than the lines lifted from *Maa Tujhe Salaam* and scripted on the masjid walls: *Dudh Mango to kheer denge, Mora (Kashmir) mango to chir denge*. People from Mora have now returned to their village at the Collector’s instance.

Delol, taluka Kalol:

CONVERSION THROUGH CREMATION;
24 KNOWN DEAD, 13 YEAR OLD RAPED

Delol village is located at a distance of about 5 km from Kalol taluka town. It had about 60 Muslim households and about 500-600 Hindu households. On 28 February, the day of the Gujarat bandh, a crowd of about 2000-3000 (mostly outsiders) came at about 10 a.m. and attacked, looted, burnt and destroyed the mosque, shops and establishments of the Muslims and left at 4 p.m. Later at night Ismailbhai was dragged out of his house by a crowd which included people from his own village, made to go through the village twice with a garland of shoes and asked to say ‘Jai Shri Ram’. When he refused to say this, he was doused with kerosene and burnt to death in the early hours of the morning.

At 10 a.m. on 1 March, a larger mob of about 3000 to 4000 came to the village shouting, “Today is Bharat Bandh – drive the Muslims out, hack them, kill them.” A local BJP MLA Prabhasingh Chouhan was involved in the attack. In the late afternoon, a group of

about 50-60 Muslims who had taken shelter with the Hindus in the village were chased by a large group of attackers to the main road and from there to the fields. The fleeing Muslims knew many of the members of the mob, but disregarding all their pleas, 8 of them were killed. In another incident on the 1st morning, a family of 11 members who had hidden in a Hindu house on the night before was attacked. They first ran towards the Delol bus stand, chased by attackers who hit them with dharias and sticks, many of whom were known to the fleeing Muslims. They then ran towards the dry bed of the river Goma, and managed to hide under a tree all day. At night a crowd of 500 to 700 people surrounded them, comprising people from Delol as well as surrounding villages. First they told the petrified Muslims that they would not kill them and gave them water to drink. Then they asked them to leave. Just as they started to leave, they attacked them from behind and hacked and burnt 10 people. According to one account, 13 year old Yasmeen, the daughter of Mohd. Ibrahim was gang raped before she was killed. In a symbolic act of conversion, the dead were put into a pile and set on fire. Ten and twelve year old Hameed and Aijaz, the sons of Kulsum Ayyub (who was also killed) were made to go around the pyre and shout ‘Jai Shree Ram’. They were then shoved into the fire. Only one survivor, Javed, managed to reach the main road, where someone he knew helped him to reach Kalol.

The victims have filed complaints with the Kalol PS on 16 and 18 March, and say they can and will return to the village only if the action is taken against the guilty. The culprits continue to threaten the victims.

From Delol to Kalol, taluka Kalol:

ATTACKS ON THE HIGHWAY; 13 DEAD, 2 RAPED

At about 4 p.m. on 1 March one tempo driven by Firoz Rasulbhai Shaikh, filled with about 20 men, 11 women and 11 children, all Muslims from Delol, fleeing towards Kalol were attacked by a large Hindu mob near Ambika Society, on the outskirts of Kalol. The

mob had blocked the road using barrels, stones, heaps of sand and a car. In attempting to escape, the tempo skidded and overturned. As people fell out of the tempo, 13 of them (5 women and 8 men including the driver) were killed by the mob with swords and dharias amidst shouts of "Maaro! Kaapo! Baalo!" (Kill! Hack! Burn!). The mob then burnt the dead bodies along with the tempo. The rest of the Muslim men on the tempo managed to escape. The children begged the mob to spare their lives by falling at their feet. The children and the surviving 6 women then ran on the road towards the Goma river, with a part of the crowd following them.

The fleeing women all got sword injuries as the 15 odd attackers swung their swords at them. While the other women were able to run some distance further, the attackers caught hold of Sultana (age 22 w/o Firoz, the tempo driver) who was also carrying her three-year-old son with her. Her son fell down and watched, crying loudly, while his mother was stripped naked and raped. Sultana lost consciousness after she was raped and cut with a sword on her left leg. The men then left her for dead. Sultana's aunt Haleema Reshma Abdul, was hiding in the bushes nearby and is an eyewitness to these happenings. When Sultana regained consciousness she was left with only the top of her salwar-kurta. Sultana, her aunt and her son then moved towards Delol. They went to a Hindu's (Baria) house where her husband had left their 11 month old daughter earlier while fleeing. He got Sultana a salwar for her to wear from her house. Sultana, Haleema and Sultana's two children, remained in hiding in the fields for two days. Then on Monday, 4 March they managed to reach the Kalol camp. No medical examination was possible in the circumstances, and none was conducted. Eyewitnesses state that Mumtaz, another woman from Delol, who died in the attack was raped before being killed as she was fleeing from the tempo.

Survivors recognise some of the attackers and have named them in their complaints submitted to the Kalol PS. The Manager of Peo-

ples Bank J.P.Shah, owner of Vijay talkies, Jaggubhai were amongst the attackers. The incident of the burning of a tempo near Ambika Society, near Kalol, is part of a combined FIR in which three other incidents have been clubbed together. The FIR mentions only 10 killed while according to eyewitnesses at least 13 persons were killed and two were raped, with one rape victim surviving. No crime of rape is registered with the police despite written complaints and it does not even find mention in the combined FIR. Two persons have been arrested in connection with the tempo attack. None of the main accused have been arrested.

Eral, taluka Kalol:

MOB TOOK MONEY TO SAVE LIVES AND THEN KILLED; 7 KILLED, 2 RAPED

On 28 February, mobs began to attack Muslims in Eral and villages around. People started to flee from the villages. However, in village Eral, Madina's family (husband, children, brother in law's family etc.) hid in the fields and temporary huts made by farmers to keep watch on their crops. The maize crop was standing in the fields. The mob found them on 3 March. About 150 people surrounded their group of 12 people. The attackers included some persons from their own village. They were carrying swords, guptis etc. The Muslim family then gave the attackers all the money they had - about Rs. 10,000 and begged them not to kill them. The mob took the money, then launched their attack. Madina survived because she managed to hide in the fields of standing maize and could not be seen by the attackers. She saw them kill 7 people in front of her and also chop off a two-year-old child Taufiq's thumb. From where she hid, she also saw them rape her own daughter Shabana, and cut off her breast before killing her. Shabana was about 15 feet away from her. She continuously heard the desperate cries for mercy uttered by the members of her family. The entire attack took half an hour. After raping and killing, the attackers set fire to the bodies. Madina hid in the fields for one hour

after the attackers left. Child witnesses, Taufiq (2years old), Khushboo (3years old) and Heena (7years old) have also corroborated this account and also indicate that one other woman Rukaiya (sister in law of Madina) was probably also raped.

The police arrived one and a half hours after the incident. Post mortem examination was conducted on the spot by doctors from Malav Primary Health Centre and the bodies were not handed over to the family. Madina has named several accused in the FIR lodged on the basis of her complaint in Kalol PS. (FIR no.41/2002). Some arrests have taken place. Charges of rape have not been included in the complaint.

They have so far been given Rs. 1200/- odd rupees as compensation for household goods.

Boru, taluka Kalol:

POLICE CAN'T FIND THE VICTIMS THOUGH THEY LIVE ACROSS THE ROAD; 1 KNOWN DEAD.

Boru is about 5 km from Kalol. It has about 165 Sunni Muslim households and an equal number of Hindu households. It is the only village in its immediate neighbourhood with any Muslim houses. Among Hindus, Barias are the largest in number with about 70 households, followed by Christian Vankars (50 households). There are also sizeable numbers of Harijans, Banjaras, Bharots, Bharwads, Naiks, and a few households of Brahmans, Sutars and Solankis. About one-fourth of the Muslims have some land, while another fourth are agricultural labours. The rest run small shops or are engaged in trades like autorickshaw driving and masonry. Some of them have menial jobs in Gujarat Industrial Development Corporation (GIDC). All the Hindus have agricultural land. One of the leaders of the attacking mob, Shankar Sinh Chandrasinh has 40 acres, a tractor, tubewell etc. He lost the panchayat elections to a Congress sarpanch. He blamed Muslims for supporting his opponent, and is said to have gone around villages mobilising people to attack in revenge.

When we visited the village, it was eerie – rows of burnt houses filled with rubble. The shells of the few pukka houses were still standing but everything else had gone. We also saw twisted burnt autos and the desecrated mosque. The Kamal Baba Dargah, some distance away is broken and villagers say that a photo of Hanuman was initially installed. That has now been taken out, but Jai Hanuman and Ram are still written across it. An annual mela is held at the Dargah where both Muslims and Hindus from as far away as Bombay congregate. Traders (including Hindus) do business of approximately 1 lakh at this mela every year. All this is affected.

On the night of 27 February, a meeting was held at Chatra Singh Khatubhai's house to plan attacks on Muslims. The attack started on 28 February at 9 p.m. when people from neighbouring villages around Boru came and burnt a paan-beedi cabin. They saw the Muslims patrolling the masjid so they went away. On 1 March at about 6.30 pm, a mob of about 6000-7000 men from the neighbouring villages of Bhadruli Buzrak, Bakrol, Kalol, and Boru ki Muvadi came to Boru and were joined by residents of Boru village. The mob first looted and then burnt Muslim houses as well as the masjid and madrassa, shouting 'Maaro, Kaapo, Baalo' all the while. The Muslims fled to the fields, where they stayed all night and all day till the 2nd evening. Noor Mohammad managed to flee to Kalol with his family and informed the Kalol Muslim Panch. They in turn reported the happenings to the Kalol police station on the 2nd morning. 1 police truck, 2 trucks and 6 tempos organised by the Kalol Muslim Panch visited Boru at 5 p.m and brought approximately 1000 people to Kalol camp.

A group of 40-45 people were left behind in the fields. The next day at 10 am, a few of them went to the Sarpanch, Raju Baria's house to ask him to phone Halol. When they went back to the fields, they were followed by a group of 30-40 people. While running, Shamsuddin Majeed Bhai Belim fell down and was killed

with swords and dharias. The others managed to run away, and reached Kalol through a circuitous route. The rest hiding in the fields were rescued by the army on 3 March.

On 5 March the Boru Muslims filed one common complaint with all their signatures, but the police refused to accept this. The complaint was then sent by registered post. They have not got a copy of the FIR. The police at Kalol police station claim that they have been unable to meet the victims, even though the station is just across the road from the refugee camp.

District Dahod

Randhikpur, taluka Limkheda:

WHERE INTER-RELIGIOUS MARRIAGE IS A
CRIME, BUT INTER-RELIGIOUS RAPE IS FINE;
20 KNOWN DEAD, RAPE OF PREGNANT WOMEN

Randhikpur is a small village with 60 to 70 Muslim families who are poor agricultural labourers. Some have a few bighas of land, some keep cattle, and some have petty shops of kabadi etc. The village witnessed communal tensions in 1998 following inter-religious marriages, when the VHP had alleged that Hindu girls were abducted by Muslim boys. Some Muslim houses were burnt, and goods and animals looted. The Muslims migrated to Baria for 3 months, but were called back by the Hindus who said that they would repay the damages. When they returned to the village, however, they discovered that all the Hindus wanted was their votes in the local panchayat elections. There is an RSS shakha in the village. The local Hindu leaders, Vanias and Brahmans, have incorporated lower caste men of blacksmith and barber communities as well as some adivasis into their fold. The present sarpanch is PA to the local BJP MLA who is an adivasi. The Muslims have largely voted for the Congress in elections.

This time the devastation was of a different order altogether. On the morning of 28

February thousands of adivasis came from outside villages and started setting fire to the Muslim houses. Even as the local villagers assured the Muslims that nothing would happen to them, some among them led the attack. All the Muslim houses, in three separate mohallas of the village, were burnt and razed to the ground by the mob. The village is surrounded by hills on all sides. The attackers had blocked all the roads. The Muslim men, women, some pregnant, and children ran in different directions to save their lives. About 100 to 150 women and children, ran and took shelter at the adivasi sarpanch's house in neighbouring Jhamri village for 3 days. During the day they would run to the hills and hide themselves. In Randhikpur, one Chamra Magan sheltered some 5 women and children, before they were all finally rescued by the police. A group of 17 ran from village to village (Chundagi to Khudra to Chaparwad). One of them, Shamim, delivered a baby girl at a mosque where they were taking shelter for the night. The next morning she again set out with the baby in her arms. Her clothes were soiled, and she was hardly able to walk. At Khudra, they stayed with adivasis who protected them and gave Shamim clothes to change, but they had to leave again. As they were going from Chaparwad to Panivel, village men from Randhikpur and Chaparwad came in two cars, gang raped the women and then killed them. Shamim who had delivered a day before and her child were also killed. Bilkees, a five month pregnant young woman was gang raped by three men from her village. Her three-year-old daughter was snatched away from her and killed in front of her. The only survivor of this group of 17, she spent a day and a night alone in the hills and then was brought to the Godhra camp by the Limkheda police on March 5 where the rest of the Randhikpur victims are staying. No traces of the remains of the dead bodies, not even the ashes of the people burnt alive, are left behind for the relatives to recover. The victims allege that the police was present in the village but they did nothing. Indian Express (May 6) reports that

the Hindu leaders will only allow Muslims back if they drop rape charges.

Sanjeli, taluka Jhalod:

ADIVASI MOBILISATION, STONING OF POLICE CONVOY ESCORTING MUSLIMS;16 KNOWN DEAD

Sanjeli is a large village with about 700-800 houses. About 50 percent of the population is Muslim. This includes about 65 Bohra families who are mainly shopkeepers and traders. It has a police outpost with 5 policemen.

On 28 February a group of *adivasi* youth on their way home after a wedding party stoned some Muslim houses in Nani Sanjeli. There was some retaliatory firing, in which 8 *adivasi* boys were injured, 2 requiring minor surgery. They were taken to hospital in Limkheda and a complaint and FIR lodged by Dalsukh Maharaj, a local VHP *adivasi* activist. He used this incident, however, to go around villages telling people that 70-80 boys had been injured in Muslim firing and that the bodies of 8 girls had been found in the Sanjeli masjid. He distributed boxes of bangles to the sarpanchs of villages to incite them to send their people.

Owing to this and other VHP mobilisation a crowd of about 2500-3000 people came to the village on 1 March afternoon at around 3 pm and started throwing glass and burning the outlying houses in Oli faliya, Jhalod road, Navi Vasahat, Mandli road etc. About a hundred or 150 houses were burnt that day, and their residents fled to the masjid. The mob stayed outside the village all night, throwing stones, shouting and shooting arrows.

Next morning on 2 March, a Peace Committee rally was called at the village center by the VHP/Bajrang Dal leaders to which some Muslim elders also went. After the meeting, the VHP leaders went around neighbouring villages ostensibly to spread the peace message, but actually it turns out in hindsight, to mobilize crowds. Soon after, a mob estimated anywhere between 8-15,000 descended from neighbouring villages up to a distance of 10 km away (Methan, Vandeli, Mander etc.),

armed not only with bows and arrows and catapults, but also with private guns, shouting Bolo Jai Shri Ram. The mob had come in jeeps and Tata Sumos.

According to the ex-ruler of Sanjeli estate, Kalika Kumar, who witnessed the entire attack, the crowd stood outside the village for a while waiting for a signal. The first charge was then led by 10 or 12 villages from the Limkheda side, including the SRP jawans who had been assigned to Jivabhai Damor, BJP MLA for his personal security. They had automatic rifles. Most of those who had arms came from Methan and Vandeli village as there are many ex-servicemen in that area. Ilyas bhai Tura, a young driver in the PWD, was shot in the chest at close range by Bhaktabhai Salubhai Khant of Methan village. His widow with 4 young children to support has got a miserable compensation of Rs. 40,000. Seventy year old Zubeida bibi and 65 year old Morawala Salam Mohammad were also shot dead. Some others were injured by gun shot in the chest and legs.

The crowd started burning houses again. The majority of the Muslim houses were torched on 2nd and 3rd after being looted. However some looting went on for 5-6 days. Totally 600 shops and houses were burnt. A church in Sanjeli was also burnt and the local pastor badly beaten up when he tried to stop the mobs from attacking Muslims.

The local police did nothing. Both on the 1 and 2 March, when Muslim villagers appealed to the police, they said they had orders only to shoot Muslims who violated curfew, not Hindus, and chased them away.

All this while, the Muslims were sheltering in their respective mosques (Sunni and Bohra), or with some dalit families. The DSP Jadeja arrived at Sanjeli at about 5-5.30 p.m on 2 March with a posse of policemen and did some effective firing. On seeing him the mob moved away from the 'central' area. The DSP did not have enough vehicles to transport everyone to Dahod, but there were some 8 large Muslims vehicles still intact and Kalika

Kumar also helped by arranging two trucks from Hindus. There were road blocks consisting of electric poles and nails and large mobs all along the way. The SP sent advance parties to check which roads were blocked, and took the vehicles by a longer circuitous route on smaller roads to try and avoid some of these. Stone throwing continued as people were going away in trucks – Kadar Mohammad Bhatiyara, a tailor, had his jaw dislocated by a heavy stone. At least six children ranging from the ages of 2-6, and one middle aged woman, were stoned to death en route from Sanjeli to Dahod.

One Tempo (709) containing some 80-100 people had a puncture a km out of Sanjeli, caused by the large nails on the roads, and then another puncture 8 km away near village Rainiya. At Rainiya, they were attacked by a Tata Sumo containing 9 men equipped with swords, stones and iron pipes. Four people who had got down, all Bohras were killed and burnt. Two women – Zainab ben Burhanbhai Mulla Meetha, and Fatima Murtaza Gadbawala – were also raped before being killed. The killers included leaders of the VHP and Bajrang Dal and were identified by some six people hiding in the bushes, who managed to get away and walked to Sukhsar police station. A seventy year old man and his 65 year old wife were chased and killed with stones at Rainiya.

The rest managed to clamber on the tempo which got away. A few km on, it had to be abandoned entirely because of road blocks. Fortunately, everyone managed to escape on foot. The remaining ten vehicles reached Dahod safely. The majority of Sanjeli refugees were at Dahod but by 24 April were made to go back and camp in their burnt houses. Compensation of Rs 1,00,000 (Rs 40,000 in cash and Rs 60,000 in fixed deposits) had been paid only to the kin of three deceased persons as of 7 April.

An FIR dated 5/3/2002 has been lodged by Rahimbhai Sattarbhai Seth of Sanjeli into the incident of 2 March in Jhalod PS. Initially the

police were reluctant to even take this FIR but were forced to when their lawyer said he would send the complaint directly to the magistrate. The names of the accused have not been incorporated in the FIR. The victims of Sanjeli have named almost 150 persons who were leading the mob that attacked them. No action has been taken against the accused. When Rahimbhai went to take a copy of his FIR he found that the police had (illegally) incorporated a statement to the effect that the Muslims had fired upon the *adivasis* on 28 February and the mob had attacked the Muslims in response to this provocation. He has filed an affidavit to rectify this.

District Sabarkantha

Kidiyad, taluka Modasa:

8 'OFFICIALLY' DEAD, 67 'UNOFFICIALLY' DEAD,
BURNT ALIVE IN A TEMPO

Kidiyad village has about 45 households of Muslims and 200 of Harijans, Bharwads and Thakars. On 28 February and 1 March, reports about burning of houses in neighbouring villages like Haloder started pouring in and tension kept increasing. When they asked for police protection, PSI Mukesh Patel of Malpur PS sent only 1 policeman to supposedly provide effective police protection. On 2 March the mobile police armed with 303 rifles came to the village at about 3 p.m. and told the Muslims to run to save their lives as they would not be able to provide protection. The sarpanch requested the police to escort them till Malpur but the police refused.

The scared Muslims then started trying to cross the rivers Eru and Vatrak across the dryer parts of the river-bed. After trying for almost an hour, they returned to the village by 3.45 p.m. or so where they were confronted by a mob of about 400-500 people from their own village and outside, shouting "Kill them! Hack them! Don't let them go!" The mob was carrying dharias, swords and trishuls. There were 224 Muslims in the village at the time,

as well as 20 guests from outside. Desperate to flee, 118 of these boarded two tempos and set off. Those who could not do so, hid in the fields around the village.

About 34 people had boarded the first tempo (GJ 17 T 9283) which left at about 4 p.m. to try to make its way towards Modasa. Zakirbhai Shamsuddin Sindhi was driving this tempo. The sarpanch of Kidiyad, Saleembhai Jamubhai Sindhi was also there on this tempo. They reached the Godhra - Modasa highway and found their road blocked at Malpur with stones and about a 1000 people all around who stoned the tempo, breaking windows and injuring the people inside. However, the tempo managed to turn towards Lunawada, and crossed Limbadiya Chowkri in Panchmahals district. On the way, from Naroda village near Limbadiya, a jeep and a motorcycle (with 3 riders) started following them. One of the pillion riders had a sword in his hand and the other had a dharia. The road was blocked at various places by large trees and the tempo had to take various twists and turns. As they passed through villages the tempo was stoned sporadically. Finally between Sanparia and

Badesara villages the motorcycle overtook the tempo and forced it to stop. As those in the tempo tried to jump off and escape, they were attacked by the men on the motorcycle. As the driver, Zakirbhai Shamsuddin Sindhi, was attacked, his 4-month-old son Mohsin fell from his hands and died. He picked up his dead child and ran. The people ran towards Kaaranta village across the Bhadrod river nearby, hoping to take shelter in the dargah there. The Patels of Sanparia, however, came out in support of the attackers and killed 6 people. One woman, Sarabibi, who is an eye-witness to the murders, was able to hide beneath a tarpaulin sheet in a shed behind a Patel house. In fact the Patel's wife gave her shelter till the police arrived to take her to the Modasa relief camp 2 days later. Other survivors somehow managed to reach the security of the Kaaranta dargah. The driver, Zakir Mian finally buried his dead child there. The survivors complained to the police when they reached the relief camp at Modasa 10 days later.

The second tempo (no. GJ 9T 6439) left Kidiyad at about 4.15 p.m. in order to try to

DALSUKH MAHARAJ:

A Case Study of 'Vanvasi' mobilisation

We met Dulsukh Maharaj, at his ashram in Sanjeli. Dalsukh is an ayurvedic vaidya, runs a hostel for school children and is a member of the Akhil Bharaitya Sant samiti and the VHP Margdarshak Mandal.

Maharaj, a Bhil himself, was of the view that, 'Bhils are Hindus from the beginning'. He asserted that the attack by the Bhils/vanvasis on Sanjeli was "swaymbhu" (spontaneous-on their own) as they had been oppressed for ages and have now risen. Like a text book case illustrating the role of propaganda and rumour with respect to women in mobilizing people, Maharaj asserted that, 'Muslims took "our" women and have "violated" at least 100 Bhil-vanvasi women in Sanjeli alone'. "Muslims consider "our" widows to be everyone's property". In Godhra Urdu School, "they" sent the Muslim teachers and students away and killed two Hindu women teachers and put iron rods in their vaginas

Maharaj also spouted axioms about the character of Islam and Muslims: "In the Quran, it is written, Work for four months and cut up kafirs for eight months in a year". He also stated that 80,000/- rupees had been collected from Sanjeli alone to plan for the train attack at Godhra and claimed there are receipts. Needless to say, not one name of the 100 women violated in Sanjeli was given, not one receipt of the 80,000/- supposedly collected was produced and no verifiable details of the alleged killing of two Hindu women teachers supplied.

reach Modasa. 84 people, including a large number of women and 32 children, were packed tightly into the cramped tempo. Heavy stone pelting started from village Punjarani Muvadi. When the tempo reached Choriwad Crossing, a crowd of about one thousand was standing there. All other roads were blocked. In desperation, Ayub Mian, the driver turned the tempo towards Lunawada, Panchmahals district. From Babaliya four motorcycles, a jeep, a truck and a tempo (No. GJ7Y 2131) started chasing the tempo. On one of the four motorcycles was Naresh Bhai, a resident of Gogawada. As soon the tempo reached Limbadiya Chowkri, about 15 km from Lunawada, the motorcyclists overtook the tempo and fired at the front tyre, which burst bringing the tempo to a standstill.

A large armed crowd which had been alerted by the passing of the first tempo a little while earlier, surrounded the tempo along with the pursuers. The attackers were wielding dharias, trishuls, swords, as well as guns. About 16 people including the driver of the tempo managed to run away. These were mostly men with the exception of one woman and two small children. They hid in the fields and saw what followed. After hacking at those who remained on the tempo with swords, the attackers threw tyres on them, poured petrol and set the tempo on fire. Eight people who tried to jump off were fired at and hacked to death. One woman, Arzoo Bibi Ayub Mian Sindhi, sitting in the driver's cabin was also attacked when she jumped off but she survived albeit with severe injuries by pretending to be dead. Those inside the tempo were completely burnt to ashes, as the fire raged for over two hours.

According to the S.P (Panchmahals) only 8 deaths have been registered in the case as only the bodies of those killed while trying to jump off have been found in a half burnt condition. In fact Arzoo Bibi was told to identify these bodies and could only identify 1 of the 8 bodies as that of Pirzada Gulabuddin Imam Mian, a resident of Karanta (80 years old) who had

come to Kidiyad on 27 February to offer Friday prayers. The other 7 bodies were charred beyond recognition. Yet there are eyewitnesses who state categorically that 59 other people were charred to death, bringing the total to 67. The dead included 37 women and 30 men, of whom 15 were boys below 12 years. 4 infants less than a year old perished in the attack. The eyewitnesses have also identified the accused.

Complaints have been given to all authorities by survivors and also to the Khanpur PS investigating the case. The driver of the tempo Ayubhai Subha Mian Sindhi is the main complainant. In the absence of any concerted effort to collect evidence and locate bone fragments if any, the huge disparity between eyewitness accounts and the official story remains.

District Headquarters Himmatnagar:

BURNING BY THE LIST,
NO MATTER IF ITS OUTDATED

The Godhra incident occurred on 27 February. By 9 a.m. on the morning of 28 February, VHP/BJP leaders with lists of Muslim owned establishments had arrived all the way from Bhavnagar, a six hour journey from Himmatnagar. A large mob was organised and it systematically went about looting and burning Muslim shops, factories and showrooms, all of which were closed for the bandh. 232 establishments were burnt in Himmatnagar town. Eyewitnesses state that most of the main perpetrators of the arson were outsiders, though local VHP members did participate in the attacks. The shops burnt included the grand showroom of Harsoliya Motors owned by Bohras who have been in Himmatnagar for 9 generations. This is the first time that they have faced such an attack.

The attackers were intent on following quite literally the directions that they had been given – for instance, Raj Auto Traders on Dahod Road owned by a Hindu from Godhra was set on fire since a Muslim partner was mentioned in the list. They did not

listen to onlookers who pleaded that it was indeed Hindu owned. Similarly, a soft drink factory earlier owned by a Muslim, Saleembhai, but recently bought by a Kutchi Patel was burnt down, despite the owner's pleas, since the factory was marked as Muslim-owned.

Some of the Muslim shop and factory owners who suffered losses have gone to court to get their own complaints filed as FIRs. The police have not yet complied with the court directions to do so.

By mid March, just as the communal tension was beginning to ebb, the following incident led to an escalation of tension in the entire region. On 19 or 20 March, Kamlesh Patel, a local youth, parked his scooter outside a Bohra shop, went to the market, and then simply disappeared. His body was found on 21 March a short distance away from Himmatnagar. The Bohra shop owner was picked up for questioning and wild rumours that Muslims had killed Kamlesh started circulating. The VHP made this into a big issue, held many meetings, and fanned communal tensions. Several prominent Muslims in the town wanted a thorough investigation to get to the root of the matter. This was, however, not done and rumours and communal tensions continue to fester. Beginning from early March, the VHP continues to distribute leaflets advocating boycott of Muslims.

Madhopur Kampa, taluka Bayad:

TRUCKS AND TRUCK DRIVERS BURNT,
SADGAL VILLAGE HINDUS HELP THE VICTIMS;
5 DEAD

On 28 February at about 9.30 a.m. several trucks were stopped on the Godhra-Modasa highway by a mob of 2-3000 people at Madhopur Kampa near Bayad taluka town in Sabarkantha. The Gujarat Bandh was observed on this stretch of the highway by burning 5 truck drivers alive and setting 20 trucks on fire. Kasimbhai, the driver of one of the trucks (GJ 9V 1654) owned by G.A. Suthar of Modasa, was first badly beaten by the mob as

he got down from the truck. He managed to escape and drag himself behind the wall of a nearby petrol pump. He was injured and lay down in a daze. The Hindus from nearby Sadgal village who came to loot from the trucks happened to know him and helped to revive him. He came to the petrol pump and saw the burning vehicles. Unthinkingly he shouted out to the mob to let his truck be. The mob then dragged him out and threw him into the blazing truck. The driver's helper, Hanif, and another person traveling in the truck at the time it was attacked, managed to escape. Both of them were assisted by the Sadgal villagers who also dropped them to the relief camp at Modasa.

The 3 drivers from Modasa killed at Madhopur Kampa were Kasimbhai, Anwar and Gaina. Of the other 2 drivers killed, one belonged to Rajasthan and the other to Mewat, Haryana.

The Bayad PS refused to lodge an FIR into the incident, despite Hanif's statement naming some members of the mob he was able to identify with the assistance of the Sadgal villagers.

Town Talod, taluka Talod:

DARBARS SHELTERED THE MUSLIMS, AND
RABARIS SAVED THEM

Talod is a taluka town in Sabarkantha district. On Thursday, 28 February, the day of the Gujarat Bandh a crowd of about 150-200 persons took out a rally in the town terminating at the temple. Then on 1 March at 12.30 p.m. a mob of 4-5000 people gathered in the town and started attacking the 80 odd Muslim households which lived scattered in different mohallas all over Talod town. The Muslims took shelter in the houses of their darbar neighbours. When they too were threatened by the mobs the Muslims went back to some of their still intact houses. On 2 March a mob of 500 people came again to destroy the remaining houses of the Muslims. The mob looted the houses and the Muslims managed to escape through the fields. They

were trying to reach Harsol, a neighbouring village with a large Muslim population. After running for about 7 km they reached a place near Salatpur, where this group of about 50 fleeing Muslims (including several old people and 20 children) was surrounded and attacked by a mob of about 150 people carrying arms and kerosene. An old woman Bashiran Shamsuben Lohar was injured on her head and arm by a dharia. The attackers then stacked dried thorn bushes around the group of Muslims, shouting that they would light a 'Holi' around the Muslims. They had just sprinkled kerosene on the dried thorn scrub and lit it, and started stripping the women, when at that moment, a group of 20-25 Rabaris from nearby Khokhra Kesarpur ran forward to the defense of the Muslims. It was because of their intervention that the Talod Muslims were able to escape. After going back to Talod and staying in hiding that night and facing one more attack they finally took refuge in the police station. The police then dropped them to Harsol where they stayed for 10 days and came to the Panpur relief camp just outside Himmatnagar. Bashiran Shamsuben was refused treatment at Talod civil hospital, and had to be taken to a hospital in Modasa for treatment.

This group of Muslims from Talod were unable to recognize the attackers. They have not complained to the police. They have not gone back to Talod since the attack.

District Gandhinagar

Por, taluka Gandhinagar:

ACCUSED POLICEMAN IN CHARGE OF
INVESTIGATIONS; FLEEING MUSLIMS DIE OF
SUFFOCATION, 6 DEAD

Por village had about 70 Muslim families and about 500 – 600 families of Thakur, Patels, Harijans, Bagri, Raval and Chamar. The deputy sarpanch in the village was a Muslim and the Muslims had supported Thakurs in the last panchayat election. The Sarpanch told

the Muslims of the village that they need not worry, nothing will happen to their village. On 1 March, at about 2.15 p.m., just as the afternoon namaz was over, a large mob including villagers from Por and at least nine neighbouring villages led by Patels from Por attacked the village. They were armed with kerosene, diesel and gas cylinders. They destroyed and burnt Muslim houses, a mosque as well as the dargah. A bore well which was the only source of water for the Muslim houses and fields was completely destroyed. The mob also attacked and injured a number of persons, such as Shakinaben, Hanifbhai, Fatimabibi, Farooq Rahimbhai, and Mariambibi. Village shopkeepers provided kerosene to the attackers and the Patels of the village including women pelted stones on the fleeing Muslims. The attackers caught hold of the maulana and beat him up. The Police Inspector from Adalaj PS, PI Jhala reached the village, shortly after the mob arrived, but instead of helping the local Muslims ordered them to leave immediately.

The Collector I.S.Haider and the DDO Mr.Brahmbhatt reached the village as the attack was continuing. They offered protection to the Muslims to help them escape from the village. All the Muslims of the village tried to escape by getting on to the 3 tempos (407) owned by the Muslim villagers themselves. However, the third tempo did not start. In panic people got down from that tempo and clambered on to the other two. Altogether there were now 200 people crammed into 2 tempos. Three women, who had already sustained injuries during the attack and 3 children died due to suffocation. They were dead by the time the tempos reached the Adalaj PS.

There is only one FIR lodged in the Por incident (no. 44/2002 in Adalaj P.S u/s 147/148/149/436/395/135 Bombay Police Act). This FIR was lodged by the same PI Jhala who did nothing to prevent the attack and the victims can hardly hope for an unbiased investigation as he is also the Investigating Officer into the incident. The FIR did not contain the names of the attackers. Later, the witnesses named

95 Patels in the 4 complaints they gave to the PS and other authorities. In spite of this not a single Patel was arrested till mid April. There have been at least 23 arrests in the case but all of lower caste Thakkars, Vaghris, and Rawals involved in the looting after the Muslims had fled and not the actual attackers. The villagers have also sent complaints and appealed to numerous higher authorities but have not received any response.

The displaced victims are now staying in Mandali relief camp and with their relatives at various other places. The Police inspector PI Jhala has connived with the attackers by not taking action at the time of attack, by not including their names in the FIR and has now joined them to pressurize the victims to withdraw their complaint.

District Mahesana

Kadi town, taluka Kadi:

REVIVAL OF TENSIONS AT THE END OF MARCH,
1 KNOWN DEAD

Kadi town is one of the taluk headquarters of Mahesana district situated about 50 kilometres from Ahmadabad. The town has approximately 35% Muslim residents. 28 February witnessed mobs attacking different Muslim inhabited areas and Muslim commercial establishments in the town. On that day 56 shops were set afire, four dargahs damaged and one mosque was destroyed. The police registered 18 FIRs covering the different incidents in the town. In one of the FIRs, prominent persons of Kadi including Ramesh Bachhubhai Patel, a municipal councilor, were named as accused. All the 13 named accused were arrested on 25 March. The next day the District Superintendent of Police was transferred. It was alleged that the transfers was punitive since he had refused to toe the government line. The Chief Minister refuted these allegations and justified the transfer as a promotion. However, the same day the 13 accused were released from custody.

28 March witnessed re-escalation of tension in Kadi when the released persons led a victory procession 'shobha yatra' through the town accompanied by the beating of drums. Next evening a small mob set afire a kiosk owned by a Muslim and pelted stones at Muslim properties. By 10 p.m. a large mob of 5000 people started an attack near Kinara talkies. Another mob numbering 500 attacked the shops owned by Bohra Muslims in the Vorvad area. The Bohras turned up to repulse the attack and stone pelting between the two continued for some time. A police party fired teargas shells at the Bohras to disperse them. Through the night 45 people from among the Bohras and 25 Muslims from the Kasba area were arrested.

Muslim women staged a demonstration outside the police station early on the morning of 30 March demanding release of those arrested. The women continued the protest despite lathicharge and use of teargas by the police. Finally the 70 arrested people were released.

Following the violent incidents of the previous night, a BSF party arrived at Kadi in the morning. Both the S.P. and the Collector were present in the town when mob attacks resumed at 10.30 a.m. Till 1 p.m. different groups of attackers targeted different Muslim settlements. The major attack occurred at Kalalwas, a locality inhabited by a hundred Muslim Ghanchi families and 300 Patel Hindu families. The mob came armed with firearms, explosives, swords and dharias. A police posse of 8 policemen posted at Kalalwas remained mute spectators.

At 11 a.m. Razak Vazir Kalal, a fruit seller, received four gun shot wounds. He managed to reach medical help and survived. His statement to the police identified one Amrit alias Dada as the one who opened fire and others at the forefront of the mob. All the Muslim residents of Kalalwas tried to escape to other localities. Mohammad Javed who worked as a cleaner was leaving with others when stones were pelted at them. He was trying to avoid

being hit when a bomb was hurled. He tried to stop it with his hand just when it exploded. His hand was cut off at the wrist. The residents kept making desperate phone calls to the SP and the BSF commandant but to no avail.

Curfew was declared at 1 p.m. but by then 36 houses in Kalalwas were destroyed by fire and the rest had suffered looting and damage. Around 3 p.m. one house was set on fire in the Sadhwasi locality. Two hours later the house owner, 70 year old Ismail Ghanchi went to see the damage. He was attacked and killed on the way. The eye-witness who had accompanied Ismail identified the attackers including the local President of the Bajrang Dal.

The BSF, which was deployed by the district administration at 5 p.m., staged a flag march and violent incidents ceased. In all, 36 houses in Kalalwas were destroyed by fire and the rest suffered looting and damage. The victims in their complaints to the police identify over 125 persons from the mob. Only one FIR was registered for the entire period and covers all the different incidents listed above.

Visnagar town, taluka Visnagar:

11 MEMBERS OF A FAMILY BRUTALLY KILLED,
BJP MEMBERS IDENTIFIED AS LEADING THE
ATTACKS, 14 KNOWN DEAD

Visnagar Town has about 2-3000 Patel families, 1200 houses Thakur families, 600-700 families of Rabaris; 1000 Harijan families, and about 100 Muslim families. The Muslims here suffered substantial devastation and casualties. A violent Hindu mob of about 10-12,000 people attacked the various Muslim clusters on the afternoon of 28 February. The attackers were armed with swords, dharias, sticks, acid, petrol, lighters and country made bombs. About 1200 victims of the town have been staying in a relief camp in village Sawala since the incident. They recognize some of the attackers who were all Patels. According to them even Patel women participated in the attack by throwing stones on the Muslims from the roof top.

In one of the Hindu localities Deepda Darwaza there were ten shacks/huts belonging to really poor Muslims. Some of these Muslims were labourers, others ran a pan shop, a cycle repair shop or pulled a hand cart. The attackers surrounded their houses, put petrol and burnt them. Eleven people belonging to the families of two brothers were hacked and burnt to death, leaving just three survivors - Yusufbhai, his 13 year old nephew Pathan Arif Khan Yakub Khan, and his eleven year old niece Noorjahan Yakub Khan. Those killed included 5 women, 1 man and 5 children. One of the children was just 6 months old. These two children saw their family members being hacked and burnt with their own eyes. With a deep sense of hurt and pain Yusuf bhai tells every one that even till the last minute he believed that the attackers were all neighbours and would not kill his family.

The attackers took the bodies, cut and packed them in sacks and dumped the sacks in a pond on Kada Road. The bodies were later recovered by the police. While the attack started at around 2.30 p.m., and the police were called repeatedly, they finally came only at 5 p.m.. The trapped Muslim residents were rescued only after that. The survivors have named 60 people in their complaint to police. Police have arrested 18 persons. However, according to Yusufbhai they were arrested in connection with earlier smaller offences. DSP Gehlot (now transferred) has sent body remains of those killed for examination to the Central Forensic Science Laboratory.

In another area in the town called Kaziwada one Ashrafbhai was attacked by the mob and struck with a sword. His sister Zainabibi and his neighbours Hanifbhai and Yunusbhai Mansuri took him in a hand cart to the Civil Hospital, Visnagar. The attackers caught them in the Civil Hospital. Yunusbhai escaped and has not been seen since. Zainabibi, Hanif and Ashrafbhai were taken to the third floor of the hospital and thrown down from there. While Ashraf and Hanif died, Zainabibi did not die the first time round so

she was dragged up the stairs and thrown again. Then acid was thrown on the bodies, and they were also slashed with swords. One woman Noor Jehan who is an eyewitness, was in the hospital when this happened. According to her all the attackers were outsiders and there were 50-60 attackers who entered the hospital and killed the three.

In another locality, Khada Darwaza, about 15- 20 Muslim men and children were injured in an attack. As the mob approached this locality, about 100 women hid in a house, while the men tried to resist the attack by throwing back stones. The confrontation continued for about 2-3 hours.

According to the survivors the local MLA Pahladbhai Mohan Lal Patel Ghosa was the main instigator. He organized meetings in the town and had been heard announcing a reward of Rs. 5 lakhs for killing one Muslim and guaranteeing that there would be no case or imprisonment.

Muslims from Visnagar who have fled to Sawala are too scared to go back. 84 auto rickshaws stand forlornly as it is dangerous for the drivers to ply them. School students who attempted to go to school continue to be threatened by groups of 10-15 people. Numerous isolated incidents of attacks on Muslims continue to take place.

Sardarpura, taluka Vijapur:

ELIMINATION BY ELECTROCUTION;

33 KNOWN DEAD

33 Muslims in village Sardarpura were killed on 1 March, 29 of them in a single attack. Several survivors of the village are now residing with their relatives in village Sawala.

Muslims constituted about 10% of the total population of the village, which included about 25 families of Pathans, 20 of Sheikhs (Ghanchis) and about 20 families of Mansuri Muslims.

On 28 February, at about 9 p.m. several kiosks owned by Muslims, Harijans and Rawals were burnt by a mob comprised of

Sardarpura Hindus. Though the police were called the attack continued despite their presence, and even after they left.

Fearing further attack the following day the Muslims again called the police. Two jeeps with policemen arrived led by two Sub Inspectors. The idea of forming a peace committee was also mooted and names of people from various communities were short-listed. A meeting was fixed for 4 p.m. Apart from the sarpanch and an ex-sarpanch (both Patels), representatives from Harijans, Rawals, Prajapati and Muslims reached the venue but the Patels did not come. The sarpanch left the venue shortly making the excuse that he would try to get the Patels. He did not return.

Strangely, the streetlights of the village, which were not working for about a month prior to the incident, were suddenly repaired by the Hindu electrician that evening. A halogen light was installed near the colony of the Sheikhs and a long wire and a metal conductor were connected to it. The sarpanch took away the key to the bore well from a Muslim bore operator. By 9.30 p.m. a Hindu mob from 8-10 villages started collecting in Sardarpura. All the three localities of the Muslims (of Pathans, Sheikhs and Memons) were simultaneously attacked. While shops were being burnt in the localities of the Memons and the Sheikhs, houses of the Pathans were attacked by stone throwing.

The two sub-inspectors were still in the village when the mob attack started. By making excuses about going to the other end of the village to stop the attack on the Memon shops they probably made their getaway. They gave wrong messages to the DSP that every thing was all right in the village.

In the Sheikh locality a two-year-old girl child was thrown and killed by the mob. Some of the Muslims ran to Rawals' houses for shelter and together with Rawals then ran away through the fields. One person saved himself by hiding in a grave.

31 people, mostly women and children had taken shelter in a house in the Sheikh locality. The mob surrounded the house, locked them into a room, and threw acid at them through openings in the room. The metal conductor, an iron rod attached by a wire to the newly installed halogen light was shoved inside the room packed with Muslims and electric current passed through it. The device was moved around in the room and used to electrocute 29 persons to death. Two children who fell beneath the pile of bodies of the dead survived the attack.

Finally after receiving the desperate pleas of the trapped Muslims on phone, the DSP Ashok Gehlot reached the village with two vehicles at about 2-30 a.m. The Sardarpura survivors were rescued and taken to Sawala village. The police found that the roads out of Sardarpura were blocked at frequent intervals till Ladol, 9 km away, to prevent the Muslims from escaping.

An FIR was lodged and 28 persons named by survivors. One of the chief accused Bajrang Dal activist Chandra Kant has not been arrested yet.

District Ahmadabad

Kuha, taluka Daskroi:

'LET BYGONES BE BYGONES'

The first instance of communal attack on the 50-odd families of Muslims in the village occurred in 1992. There was stone pelting on them and they were forced to leave the village. The 300 families of Patels were in the forefront of the attack. Most of the Muslims had worked as labourers and some 4-5 families own a small patch of land. But over time some of them have started small kiosks and others earn a living as drivers.

On 28 February, around 1 p.m. a mob led by the husband of the sarpanch, a Patel, attacked the Muslim houses. The other major caste in the village is Thakor, which did not

participate in the attack. As the attack started, most Muslims fled into the fields while some others took refuge in the house of one of the panchayat members, Laxmiben Dabhi. Ahmed Hussain Sayyed was unable to flee in time and therefore hid in his house. He was thus witness to all that happened. 19 houses were burnt and belongings looted from the rest.

For 9 days Muslims stayed in the fields and through these days Laxmiben organised food for them. Once it was safe to move from there, people organised two vehicles and with one police vehicle escorting, the people reached the relief camp at Bapunagar in Ahmadabad city.

A complaint was given to the police but a received copy was not provided. No copy of the panchnama has been provided. Ahmed Hussain and his two brothers used the opportunity of the NHRC team visit to get their complaint filed.

On 13 April, Laxmiben came to the Bapunagar relief camp as an emissary of the Hindus of the village to make a deal with the Muslim families. They should withdraw the complaint and only then are welcome to come back to reside in the village. However the three brothers who had officially complained are not permitted into the village. Ahmed Hussain wishes to bring the guilty to justice but feels that he will withdraw the complaint if the other displaced people feel he should.

Abbasana, taluka Detroj:

**SOLE MUSLIM FAMILY KILLED IN APRIL BY
HINDUS OF THE VILLAGE, 5 KNOWN DEAD**

Abbasana has about 300 households of which only 3 are of Muslims. All 3 households are part of one extended family of three brothers. This Ghanchi Muslim family owns some land and have lived in the village for over 300 years. Of the Hindus, a few are Brahmans, several Patels and Darbars, and some Vaghris and Harijans. The Muslim houses are right in the middle of the village, surrounded on one side by the Brahman, Patel and Darbar faliyas, and on the other by the Harijans and Vaghris.

The Muslims have lived together with others without any communal tensions all these years. When a daughter of the family got married recently, they had fed the entire village. A woman member of the Muslim family was elected as a member of the village panchayat.

On the run

Noor Mohammad Rasool Bhai Vora had been living in Naroda Patiya for the last 12 years. He operated a handcart selling goods in the colonies. 1992 was the first time that disturbances happened at Naroda Patiya. At that time he hid in Naroda itself. But nothing serious happened.

This time trouble started on 1 March when the Congress office was burnt. Noor Mohammad lived as a tenant in a house owned by a person belonging to the Darbar caste. The landlord told him that mobs might attack and therefore he should take refuge in a back room of the landlord's house. At 2 a.m. that night a group of people came demanding that the tenant be handed over to them. The landlord told the mobs that he did not know the whereabouts of the tenant. The mob left. The landlord feared that he may be unable to protect his tenant in the future and therefore asked Noor Mohammad and his family to leave.

At 9 a.m. on 2 March the family of five dressed as Hindus. The wife wore a saree and applied a bindi on the forehead. They then paid Rs. 100 to a rickshaw puller to take them a distance of 5 kilometres. From there they walked 15 km to Kathalwara road and continued walking through the fields and small roads towards a village in Nadiad taluka, Kheda district. For 5 days they stayed in Umreth with his brother. On 6 April, similar attacks on Muslims started in Umreth. The next day both the families left. They walked to Anand. The relief camp there was very crowded. Noor Mohammad had little children and food was scarce and they were able to get their night meal as late as 2 a.m. Therefore the family moved to Mehlaj and are staying there since.

His brother's house has been looted and even the handcart that was his means of livelihood is gone.

Nothing happened till April. A little after midnight on 2 April, two groups of 10 to 15 Hindus from the village attacked the Muslim houses and hacked 5 of them to death and seriously injured 7. Their houses were burnt and destroyed. The other Muslims ran to the temple, and a few took shelter in the barber's house. They later ran to the house of another villager from where they were taken early in the morning to Civil Hospital, Ahmadabad by the police.

A total of 23 accused have been named in the FIR. They were arrested and in judicial custody when we met the victims in mid April.

Similar attacks were carried out in other villages like Chandikheda, Nani Kadi, Vidaj and Kansar with just 2 or 3 Muslim households. According to survivors it is the consequence of VHP mobilisation inciting Hindus to finish off even the few Muslims in their villages.

District Kheda

Kanij, taluka Mehemdabad:

‘COME BACK TO THE VILLAGE, BUT ON ONE CONDITION ...’; 3 KNOWN DEAD

Kheda is often cited as an example of the situation returning to normal: of Hindus making the effort to bring Muslims back to the villages. This myth was reflected in the press and through official pronouncements, during the visit of the team and later.

Kanij is a 500-year-old village, with a population of about 10,000 including 125 Muslim families. The Muslims mainly belong to the Malik and Pathan castes. Amongst the Hindus the main castes are Patels, Rabari, Darbar, Harijans and Thakur.

On 1 March at around 7.00 p.m., when the Muslims were getting ready for dinner, they were attacked by a 2000-3000 strong mob. All the Muslims fled to the fields of Nainpur village situated 3-4 km away. They hid in the

fields till the morning of 3 March and got food from neighbouring villages and passers-by. On returning on 3 March, they found 106 houses completely burnt and all the goods stolen. The rest 19 houses built adjacent to Hindu houses were looted but were spared the burning. These included the kuchha jhuggis of the poor, and one three-storeyed house. The losses included household goods, agricultural implements, and cattle.

An hour after returning, a mob collected and attacked again. 22 year old Zakir Mian Rasul Mian Khokar fell into the hands of the mob and was killed while others ran to save their lives. They ran once again towards Nainpur and decided to proceed from there to Mehlaj (district Kheda). After a 6-7 kilometre walk they were attacked once again by a mob near Shahdara village. Sakir Mian Rasool Mian Sheikh (18) and Shafi Mian Mirsab Mian Sheikh (20) were surrounded by the mob and killed and their bodies burnt. The rest found shelter in relief camps at Mehemdabad and Mehlaj.

On 19 March Vikram Singh Darbar, a rich landowner of Kanij, sent tractors to bring the Muslims back to the village. Most families came back and were provided food by Vikram Singh for over two weeks.

Who were the attackers? The victims publicly deny recognising any of them, maintaining they came from other villages. The fact is that the mob was mainly organised from Kanij itself. The reason for the Muslim silence is that most Muslims are landowners and their livelihood is tied to the village. They also have little faith that the state will apprehend and punish those responsible for the killings and destruction. Therefore the FIRs filed do not include names of the attackers. No one has been arrested.

The same Darbar community that is now being advertised as the messiah had led the attack. The deal with the attackers includes non-identification of the accused as a specific condition. Speaking to the victims told us that

the new equilibrium is far from stable. How can they ever feel safe or think of living with the people who have destroyed them completely?

We also gathered that the larger communally surcharged atmosphere was actually used to settle village level scores. It seems that the Darbars (Rajputs) had dominated the village panchayat for 4-5 decades and in the recent panchayat elections, a Patel became the sarpanch due to support from the Muslims, and a Muslim became the deputy sarpanch. The attack was aimed at teaching the Muslims a lesson.

III. What The Incidents Tell Us

Emerging Patterns

As narrative after narrative makes evident, there is a chilling monotony in each account of killing, burning, arson, raping, maiming, looting. A drab sameness in the cries of 'Maaro, kaapo, baalo!' (Kill! Hack! Burn!) shouted by Hindu mobs, in the accounts of police inaction, in the peculiar mixture of bewilderment, anger, fear and hopelessness in the eyes of victims in relief camps across the districts we visited. Accounts of incidents occurring in places far apart bear a frightening resemblance to each other in the brutality of the massacres of Muslim men, women and children and the participation of their own Hindu neighbours in these attacks. Yet in each district the pattern and object of attacks and their timing was different in crucial ways, owing to the nature of local political and socio-economic factors.

Organisation and Mobilisation

One feature which has been strikingly visible in the entire region has been the organisational activity of the Bajrang Dal/VHP/RSS especially among groups like the *adivasis*. Muslim refugees from Pandarwada (Panchmahals) Randhikpur (Dahod), Sanjeli (Dahod), Por (Gandhinagar) and several others reported the steady build up of such activity through meetings, leaflets etc. over the last decade and more intensively over the last couple of years. Anti-Muslim propaganda has been the central plank of this build up. 'Kodar Doctor', one of the chief accused of Pandarwada would tell the Muslim villagers that Pandarwada was the land of the five *pandavas*, and Muslims were not wanted, and they should go to Pakistan.

A further increase in the tempo of communal mobilisation is reported in a number of villages from around 6 months ago, when the planning for the *shilapujan* to build the Ramjanmabhoomi temple began. *Trishul-*

diksha programmes, where *trishuls* were distributed to large gatherings were organised in a number of areas beginning from around this period. Prantij (Sabarkantha), Sanjeli, Pandarwada and in fact villages across Khanpur taluka (Panchmahals) reported such meetings. These meetings were only held in villages where there were Muslims, and publicly issuing threats against the community appeared to be one of the objectives. In Pandarwada, people from 50-60 neighbouring villages are said to have come to the meeting at Ayodhya Chowk held only about a fortnight before the fatal attack on Muslims. Faiz Mohammad Ahmadbhai recalled,

Nearly 300 to 400 people from nearby villages, men and women, had collected at the meeting. There were VHP leaders, sadhus and others. The entire meeting was broadcast on the loudspeakers, provided by Anil Modi. One leader said, 'there were 2-3 households of Muslims earlier. Now they have 100-125 houses. The Muslim population is increasing. We must do something now. We have no arms. In Muslim houses arms are ready for use. We must prepare to fight them. The Principal of Shri K.M. Doshi High school, Kantibhai Ambalal Pandya, who chaired the meeting said, 'We must give serious thought to what the speakers have said today; and we must prepare ourselves so that we can confront them.' The Muslims don't believe in family planning so their population increases. Let our population also increase.....'.

Finally in almost all the villages affected, meetings were held on the evening of 27 February or on 28 February to plan the attacks. With prior preparation, availability of weapons, gas cylinders and incendiary materials, these meetings were aimed at organising and operationalising the exact details of the attacks and targets in each village. Some of the places where such meetings were held are:

village Leach (Mahesana), village Motera (Gandhi Nagar), village Prantij (Sabarkantha) and village Sanjeli (Dahod) among others. These meetings were described in some places as 'Shanti Samiti' meetings, but curiously participants in these so called 'peace meetings' led the attacks the following day (as in Sanjeli). In Piplod (Dahod) the attack was launched on 28 February at 4 p.m. after a meeting of the attackers and main leaders in the adivasi ashram shala in the 'phaatak-paar' area of the town from 12 noon onwards. They began their attack immediately after leaving the meeting, destroying the handful of Muslim houses in the area.

It was partly this organisational base built upon the targeted deployment of hate that enabled the assembly of mobs as large as 7-10,000 or even more. Dalsukh Maharaj of Sanjeli, for example, tapped into a combination of existing organisation and the immediate local issue of an adivasi wedding party being fired upon to mobilise a mammoth crowd of 30-35,000 people, mostly *adivasi* to slaughter the Sanjeli Muslims, burn and loot their houses. "Adivasi women abducted by Muslim men", "Muslims as traders and exploiters", certain catch-phrases repeated in identical ways across the region indicate some of the strategies of *Hindutva* mobilisation among Bhils and other tribals. Similarly, sustained propaganda of rumours and myths about "alarming increase in Muslim population", "Hindu women being violated by Muslims", "more Hindus than Muslims killed in all earlier riots", "Muslims collecting weapons to attack Hindus" were used throughout Gujarat to mobilize mobs to attack Muslims.

Money, in several instances, was an added factor in mobilising mobs. In many villages in Panchmahals and Dahod monetary incentives and liquor were offered to *adivasis* to kill Muslims.

Informants from Mora said that two Sindhis from Godhra had come to Mora on the 28 night and given money and liquor to *adivasis* to kill Muslims. The mob collected

only after they came. They also held meetings in Methral and Suliath to plan attacks.

While Godhra provided the occasion, it was prior mobilisation and organisation that made possible the systematic and calculated preparations that preceded many of the massacres - such as the repair of the electric line in Sardarpura (Mahesana) used to electrocute 29 persons to death, the knowledge of exactly how to torch the fire proof showroom of Harsoliya Motors (Sabarkantha), or what kind of blasting devices and detonators were required to destroy Muslim owned factories and establishments in the GIDC area in Modasa (Sabarkantha) while the area was under curfew (from 1 to 3 March).

To reiterate, all these point to an organised massacre and economic destruction of Muslims resulting from a history of focussed anti-Muslim mobilisation among different social groups in which the party in power and the state machinery also participated. In the face of such widespread evidence of prior organisation the spontaneous '*pratikriya*' or 'reaction' explanation for the post Godhra violence favoured by officials and political leaders is hopelessly inadequate.

Method of attacks

Distinct patterns have emerged in the methods of attack across the area. For instance, weapons used in the attack such as swords were of the same brand and distributed in advance across large tracts. The large-scale use of gas cylinders to blast houses and commercial establishments especially in urban areas like Ode (Kheda) or Himmatnagar, a district town, is a common pattern. Perhaps the single most common method used to destroy property and lives has been burning. Whether as a gruesome echo of the Godhra train incident or the easiest method of destroying evidence, or as the most comprehensive way of destroying property, both rural and urban areas saw large scale arson, and numerous incidents of torching people alive, raping and burning, hacking and burning large

Interdependence vs. Competition

Political economy explanations for the violence have limited use value as a master explanation in this context. Economic factors work both ways with interdependence tending towards the need to limit attacks and competition in certain sectors fuelling the communal mobilization. For instance, Palanpuri Muslims monopolise a chain of vegetarian restaurants. But the main suppliers of basic items such as atta, milk, vegetables, spices, and so on are Hindus. Most of the workers are also Hindus. In Ahmadabad, Italian Bakery, owned by a Muslim, depends on a large number of Hindu agents to sell its products. Many hawkers of the products (e.g. bread, cakes, biscuits) are also Hindu.

In spite of the many instances of economic inter-dependence between the two communities, however, each may pursue an independent trajectory to outdo the other in the world of competition. In this connection caste ties could function as important factors in the development of economic enterprise. This is evident in the critical area of finance capital. The functioning of two cooperative banks in Modasa (Sabarkantha) may be cited as an example. The elected members of the management of one of them, Nagarik Sahakari Bank (NSB), are all Hindus, while those of the other, Sarvodaya Sahakari Bank (SSB), are all Muslim. The rules provide for only a token representation of the other community — the elected members of the management may nominate one person of the other community.

One of the reasons advanced for setting up NSB was that its counterpart was biased against Hindu clients. While it is difficult to substantiate such statements, the dominant perception is that support can be obtained only from an institution constituted by the members of one's own community. The development of the trucking business in Modasa is a case in point. The business is operated by a cooperative called Modasa Road Transport Cooperative Society. It has about 3,800 members and covers four talukas, comprising half the district. Muslims dominate the membership, Hindus constituting only about 20 per cent of the members. The latter include Patels and Banias, while the former include Ghanchis, Bohras, and Sepahis. Among the Muslims, the Ghanchis played a leading role in the development of the trucking business. As a former chairman of the cooperative told us, the transportation of goods was one of the traditional occupations of the caste, and hence it was 'in their blood' (the other traditional occupation was oil pressing). The community was extremely successful in adapting their skills to handling modern forms of road transport.

Till the 1960s Ghanchi truckers borrowed from private sources dominated by Patels, paying huge amounts as interest (at 3% per month). Following the nationalisation of banks in 1965 the trucking business in the district received a boost, because loans for the purchase of trucks could be obtained on an interest of 12% per annum. However, it was the establishment of SSB around the same time that proved to be a landmark in the development of the business. Unlike nationalised banks, which provided up to 10% support for purchasing a truck, the cooperative bank advanced up to 90% of the cost. Thus, even a person having about Rs. 10,000/= could become a truck owner in the late 1960s, as the price of a truck at that time was only approximately Rs. 60,000/-. The period witnessed a fantastic expansion in the trucking business in the Modasa region, the Ghanchis being among the main beneficiaries.

One of our informants believed that the prosperity of the Muslims of the area aroused the envy of the Patels and Banias, and ironically communalised the atmosphere in the town. When riots last occurred in 2000, about 60 business establishments belonging to Muslims had been damaged. The fact that the victims found succour only from their own community added to the polarisation between Hindus and Muslims. For instance, following these riots, the governing body of SSB decided to advance loans to those who had suffered damages, offering a rebate of 50% on the normal rate of interest.

One consistent pattern seems to be the specific targeting of the economic basis of the Muslims, be it shops, implements, trucks, autorickshaws and other means of livelihood. 85 auto rickshaws driven by Muslims lie idle in Sawala, Mahesana, as the situation in neighbouring Visnagar where they used to ply is too tense and unsafe for them to go. 65 trucks owned by Modasa based Muslims alone were burnt (as in the case of the Bayad incident cited) on the Godhra Modasa highway during this communal carnage.

groups of terrified Muslims on the run. The destruction of evidence by burning of dead bodies aided by cylinders and petrol etc. whether at Ode or Limbadiya Chowkri or in several other places across the state has left the survivors without access to the dead bodies of their loved ones. The lack of bodies has also made it easier for the state to minimise the death toll, and thus avoid paying compensation.

The horror of such deaths is still reflected in the eyes of survivors- men, women and even small children, in relief camps, left with just a few brittle charred bones. Odd things remembered by survivors bring out the pathetic nature of these deaths - in Modasa where remains of the truck drivers killed at Madhopur Kampa were handed over to the Transporters Cooperative, all that remained of each man fit into small cardboard cartons.

Another pattern that has emerged throughout the region is that the Muslims in a number of places trusted their attackers. In Por Hindu attackers, mostly Patels, had eaten a meal in the house of their Muslim victims on the occasion of Id on 23 February. The victims of Por, who are not being allowed to go back to their village unless they withdraw the names of the accused, could hardly believe that their fellow villagers had turned attackers. In Abbasana the 3 families of Muslims trusted the Hindus with whom their families had lived for generations. Their sense of betrayal and grief when the same neighbours attacked and killed 5 men of the village on 2 April was immense. In Pandarwada too attackers like Jaswant Patel offered protection to the Muslims and asked them to take shelter in his fields. He then directed and led the mob against them killing 8 people. Another leader Mahendra Vakil offered them protection in a house and told them to put inside the firewood lying outside the house to 'prevent the attackers from setting the house on fire.' He then locked the doors and led the mob against the Muslims in the house. It is such total and deliberate betrayal of trust after pretending to

save them that will leave the deepest and most permanent scars.

In a number of places attacks on Muslims took place inside public buildings and institutions like government hospitals as in Kalol and Visnagar on 28 February where mobs entered the premises to kill and injure 1 and 3 persons respectively. Another pattern we came across in some rural areas in Panchmahals was of the *same* mob roaming about the countryside with impunity, telling victims that they would come back later, going from place to place over days, led by prominent people from the rural areas- such as in the case of the mob attacks on Mora Suliyath and Anjanwa in Panchmahals.

Media

The role of one of the most widely circulated daily newspapers *Sandesh* has been mentioned earlier in this report. Particularly in Panchmahals, within a 50-km radius of Godhra and around Kalol and Delol, the *Sandesh's* entirely concocted stories of finding bodies of Hindu women fuelled the attacks leading to over 200 killings and large number of rapes and gangrapes of Muslims in this district alone. According to Kalol camp inmates the correspondent who filed the story also led mobs in Kalol on 28 February. The story was used by attackers in the other districts as well. Later in Prantij, we met a correspondent of the same paper in the house of his close friend and associate who was also the VHP district chief. The correspondent spoke passionately about the threat to the majority, and how their voice was never heard- at a time when this 'voiceless', 'non-violent' majority had already slaughtered over 2000 members of the minority community.

The subsequent articles and reportage of at least the leading Gujarati dailies *Sandesh* and *Gujarat Samachar* continued to show this bias.

In its report to the NHRC the Gujarat state government noted that " while the vernacular press has been *very balanced in their report-*

ing the English language press has gone overboard in criticising the government ... (emphasis ours)". The orientation of the government is clear from the fact that the state government which responded and refuted most of the critical articles that appeared in the English media, refused to even recognise, criticise or respond to the *Sandesh* report. Such reporting amounts to a criminal offence. Praising such reporting as 'balanced' makes the government a co-conspirator.

Rape and Sexual Assault

While rumours about Hindu women being abducted from the train incited many attacks against Muslims real incidents of rape and severe sexual assault - in Panchmahals and Dahod as well as in cities like Ahmadabad and Baroda - remain largely undocumented. Sultana's rape near Kalol is not recorded in the FIR and Shabana and Rukaiya's rapes in Eral before they were killed do not find place in the FIR of the incident. Those accused in Bilkees's rape case have not yet been apprehended. In fact Bilkees and others from her village (Randhikpur) are being pressurised to withdraw her accusation and names as a precondition for going back. Several incidents of raping followed by burning of victims, as also breast cutting (as in Shabana's case, Eral) have been reported. However it is possible that owing to community pressures, several such offences have gone unreported. Yet in all the above cases, the victims or their relatives have disregarded social stigma and are in fact dauntlessly trying till date, almost 90 days after the incidents, to get their complaints registered.

Destruction of Mosques

Very often mosques and dargahs were attacked first. In Vasad (Anand district) a mosque and a dargah were flattened with a bulldozer. In Sanjeli (Dahod) the mosque was broken, set on fire, and abusive anti Muslim slogans were written all over the walls. Saffron flags and Hanuman images in mosques

and dargahs are routine sights in urban and rural areas. In Boru (Panchmahals), a dargah which Hindus from distant places also visited has been desecrated. Symbolic desecration of mosques and *qurans* followed by their actual destruction and burning of Muslim houses in village after village shows the systematic attempt to stamp out the cultural identity of Muslims. Threats issued to many Muslims trying to go back to their villages hinge upon their stopping the use of cultural symbols, even caps and beards for men and salwar kameez for women.

Bohra Losses in Panchmahals and Dahod

The Dawoodi Bohra Jamat Anjuman-e-Mohammedi Masjid estimates that Bohras of 54 villages in Panchmahals and Dahod districts have been affected. This amounts to 850 families, or 3500-4000 people. 7 Bohras have died, 150 have been injured and property loss is estimated at Rs. 70-75 crores.

The Bohras dominate trade in and around Dahod, and almost all of them also have land. The Bohras are concentrated in hardware, wholesale grain and pulses trade and rice mills. Three large industries – Raj Foods, which makes cornflakes, 2 pulse mills and 1 plastic drum manufacturing unit have been completely destroyed. According to the Syedna, this is the first time there has been such a major attack, though there have been minor incidents before. Before the 1990s Ramjanmabhoomi movement, the attacks were economic in nature – with adivasis looting Bohra shops. In 1990, during Advani's Rath yatra, 6 Bohra shops were burnt in Mullahji bazaar and Hanuman Bazaar in Dahod. Among villages Kua Jalgam, Mora, Rampur Kishenpur and Morwa-Hadap were badly affected, with 36 houses and shops looted. In 1992, again there was looting in Mullahji bazaar.

The Bohras differentiate themselves from Ghanchis by insisting that they are peace loving and don't want to file FIRs. According to the Bohras, they have good relations with the adivasis who are dependent on them for credit.

The role of local factors

While certain common patterns do emerge from the incidents, local factors - politics, history, caste configurations - add a specific edge and dimension to attacks in particular villages. For instance, in several villages tensions between social groups stemming from the recently held panchayat elections contributed to the attacks on Muslims. In Kanij (Kheda) the Muslims had supported the *Patel* candidates in the panchayat elections, so the *Darbars* (*Rajputs*) took this opportunity to attack the Muslims, killing 3, and burning their houses and property. People in Boru (Panchmahals) and other places argued that even before the Ramsevaks started going to Ayodhya, the atmosphere in their villages had been vitiated by a Congress victory in the panchayat elections in December 2001. The BJP perceived Muslims as responsible and determined to take revenge. Derol Railway Station village (Panchmahals) also saw similar tensions. Here, the wife of Vinot Barot (he is one of the accused) supported by the BJP, was defeated in the panchayat elections by Saraswati Ratilal Rana (supported by Congress) who won with Muslim support. Vinod Barot also has a brick kiln in competition with Isak Bhai of the same village. Isak Bhai attributed the violence in Derol Railway Station village to a mixture of 'competition and election'. In Kidiyad (Sabarkantha) too the Muslim sarpanch Saleembhai elected recently (on 23 December 2001) stated that the arson and looting of Muslim property in the village on 2/3/2002 was spearheaded by his opponent who lost the elections. The attack forced the Muslims to flee in two tempos.

In Anjanwa village we were told about an old land dispute between one Muslim family and one adivasi family which possibly added to the brutality of the attack in this village. In Sanjeli village mobilisation by Dalsukh Maharaj on the basis of the Godhra incident, the rumoured 'attack on Hindu women' there and the 'attack on adivasis' in the village on

28 February led to the assembly of a giant mob and widespread arson and killing.

It must be reiterated though that local dynamics only contributed a specific dimension to the attacks on particular villages- they operated within the larger context of political mobilisation of adivasis, Thakurs, Patels or others by Hindu communal organisations with their sinister agenda on minorities. The well organised attacks were primarily the result of such communal mobilisation, and they merely provided an opportunity to settle a range of other scores against local Muslims.

Adivasi Involvement

There is a widely held view that violence by *adivasis* in Panchmahals, Dahod, Sabarkantha, Chota Udepur, was caused primarily by *adivasi* resentment against Muslim exploiters. Curiously, however, apart from some big traders and transporters, the majority of the victims in these districts as we discovered in the course of our factfinding are poor peasants, agricultural labourers, small *kirana* shopowners, tailors, autorickshaw drivers, etc. It is the *Bohras* who constitute the bigger shopowners and money lenders. While they were also attacked- the total *Bohra* loss in Dahod district alone is estimated at Rs. 37,000 crores- many of them seem to have been able to go back to the villages and restart businesses (The Indian Express, 4/5/2002), unlike the large numbers of Ghanchis, Pathans, and Memons affected who are still forced to live in relief camps. Whether or not a certain section of the Muslims were 'exploiters' of the adivasis, it is very clear that this interpretation has been cynically used by the leaders of the RSS/VHP/Bajrang Dal, to mobilise *adivasi* support against all Muslims in the area. This propaganda is helped along by Hindu bania keen to destroy competition by Muslim moneylenders.

Gender is another ploy used by the Sangh Parivar to mobilise the *adivasis*. In the areas we visited, orchestrated obsessive paranoia that "Adivasi women are being abducted by Muslim men" is widely projected by the likes

of Dalsukh in Sanjeli and non tribal VHP leaders elsewhere. Villagers in remote Anjanwa (Panchmahals) articulated the same fears. On being asked to provide instances of such abduction, they could only recall a 20 year old case of an *adivasi* woman marrying a Muslim man. In the Sanjeli-Randhikpur region of Dahod district, however the issue of a Muslim youth marrying an *adivasi* woman was used to stir up communal frenzy in 1998 by Hindu communal leaders. Sanjeli was tense for days, and there was some arson and looting of Muslim shops. Hindu communal leaders of the mobilisation campaigns in the *adivasi* areas have been successful in part in presenting attacks on Muslims to the tribal populace as a necessity to 'save *adivasi* women' and 'recover tribal honour'.

However, the reach and success of such propaganda is finally limited. In many cases (e.g. Mora, Anjanwa) *adivasis* were paid money and liquor by VHP/BJP/Bajrang dal leaders to attack Muslims. We have also been told of cases of *adivasis* like other individual Hindus giving Muslims shelter. For instance, an *adivasi* family gave clothes to Shamim after she delivered her baby while fleeing from Randhikpur. The *adivasi* family also sheltered a group of women for two days; another *adivasi* showed a different group of women from Randhikpur the way out of the forest and the *adivasi* sarpanch of Jhamri sheltered them for two days. In Katwara village, Dahod district, the Muslims sheltered with Chamar families and the *adivasi* sarpanch is asking them to come back.

Role of Elected Representatives

Even a cursory reading of the accounts exposes the role of the state, particularly the police and the elected representatives of the ruling party in dealing with the attacks on Muslims since 28 February.

The involvement of local councilors in the communal carnage is widely known. In Kadi, Mahesana as well as in Visnagar the local municipal councilors were directly involved in

inciting the mobs. According to eyewitnesses, in Kadi it was the Municipal Council member Sachin Bachubhai Patel, while in Visnagar it was MLA Prahladbhai Mohanbhai Gosa Patel (BJP) and Nayabhai Tribhuvandas Patel, deputy chief of the Municipal Corporation. In Kadi this was the reason why whenever the Muslims would call for the fire tender it would not arrive leading to very widespread arson and burning. In Kalol (Panchmahals) the involvement of the BJP MLA belonging to that area, Prabhasingh Chouhan and his son was seen by many eyewitnesses.

Elected sarpanches and their deputies have incited and led mobs against Muslims or colluded silently by not responding to their desperate pleas. Obvious examples are, for instance, sarpanches in Kuha (Ahmadabad), or Sardarpura (Mahesana). In most instances, no action has been taken against any of these elected representatives. This is in stark contrast to investigation and prosecution in the case of the Godhra carnage, where action has been promptly taken against the municipal councilors indicted.

What do these patterns then portend? What are their deeper implications? The following chapters discuss these questions vis a vis the role of the state and its agencies during the attacks and their immediate aftermath – in investigating and prosecuting the guilty and providing relief and rehabilitation to the victims.

IV.

Role Of The Police

How The Carnage Continued Without Hindrance

During the course of the carnage the role of the police, or rather, its absence has been most noticeable. It was so conspicuous because the police was the one actor during the carnage which departed significantly and consistently from its assigned role.

In most places the police was seen hand in glove with the mobs. It was overtly so in Kalol town where the ASI Uday Singh Parmar was seen actively participating in the destruction and burning of Muslim shops, houses and vehicles on 28 February. More common was the police seen as silent spectators while the mobs went on the rampage. In Randhikpur, a police party arrived when the mob was setting houses on fire and stayed there till the mob had completed the destruction. In Pandarwada, four policemen were present when the mob was chasing and killing Muslims. In Kadi town, during the second phase of rioting at the end of March, a BSF party and large numbers of police personnel including the SP were available when the mobs attacked. While the police took no action to combat rioters, the Collector gave the mobs two and a half hours before declaring curfew and refused to deploy the BSF for another four hours. In Sardarpura two PSIs who were present in the village 'disappeared' when the attack was taking place. They kept on giving wrong messages to the DGP that every thing was all right in the village.

Those escaping from mobs were also refused help in reaching safety. Muslims fleeing from Delol to Kalol at night (see account) saw many police vehicles along the way but not one was willing to stop and take them to safety. In Por, the police posted at the village took no action to counter the killer mobs and instead, told the Muslims to flee. Even in this, they provided no help, so the entire Muslim population of the village habitation had to

cram themselves into the two tempos available with them. Six of them died of suffocation. In Anjanwa, the police were called on the morning of the 4th but help eventually arrived only on the evening of the 5th. In the meantime 11 people had been killed.

In most cases, the police had prior knowledge of oncoming attacks. This did not, however, translate into any preventive measures. Preventive arrests did take place but these arrests do not seem to have made any difference to the number or intensity of mob attacks. One of the reasons is available in the figures of these arrests given in the table below:

Preventive Arrests			
<i>for the six districts visited</i>			
District	Hindu	Muslim	Total
Anand	20	4	24
Dahod	0	0	0
Panchmahals	NA	NA	115
Kheda	499	260	759
Mahesana	NA	NA	248
Sabarkantha	160	10	170

Source: Gujarat Government's Submission to NHRC. Figures for Kheda are for the period upto 2 April; for other districts upto 25 March.

There is a tendency in the police (or part of their training) to maintain a semblance of balance in the number of people of each religious group arrested preventively in a situation of communal rioting. This is probably meant to show an unbiased police force. In the current situation, where attacks were so one sided, and were organised by the ruling party and its associate organizations like the VHP and Bajrang Dal, the same practice makes preventive arrests by the police communally biased actions.

A second reason why the preventive arrests made little difference is because they did not

target the main leaders. As is clear in one incident after another, mobs were led by known elected representatives or functionaries of the ruling party and its associates. In Delol, the BJP MLA Prabhasingh Chouhan was leading the mob while in Randhikpur, the leaders were known RSS functionaries. In Pandarwada, the mob was led by the Taluk pramukh, sarpanch, ex-sarpanch and known local leaders of the VHP and BJP. In Visnagar, BJP MLA Prahladbhai Mohan Lal Patel Ghosa was seen instigating the mob.

Given that the preventive arrests were not meant to have practical value, they become solely an alibi to later proclaim that the government wanted to control the riots. That prevention of escalation was not on the agenda is also clear from the happenings of 27 February. When the Sabarmati Express continued onwards to Ahmadabad after the Godhra attack, no measures were taken to prevent a violent buildup. Attacks by the passengers occurred at every railway station enroute except for Kheda district where the SP ordered the removal of every Muslim vendor from the railway platforms.

Apart from preventive arrests, BJP leaders (like Chief Minister Narendra Modi and Union Minister Arun Jaitley speaking on television) as well as individual police officers (in conversations with our team) flaunt the number of people killed in police firing as evidence of the administration's efficiency in maintaining law and order. What perhaps is being forgotten is that the taking of life is permissible only as per procedure established by law. Even in cases of violent mobs about to commit heinous crimes, water cannons, tear-gas shells, lathi-charge and rubber bullets have to be first used to disperse the mob. The police appear to have interpreted the continuing communal violence as giving them a free rein to fire straight away.

Even more problematically, in a number of cases under the cover of controlling mobs, the police has shot Muslims who were being

attacked, rather than their Hindu attackers. The numbers killed tell their own story.

Killings In Police Firings

District	Hindu	Muslim	Total
Anand	5	1	6
Dahod	2	0	2
Panchmahals	4	3	7
Kheda	7	4	11
Mahesana	3	0	3
Sabarkantha	4	5	9
Total for Gujarat	66	57	123

Source: Gujarat Government's Submission to NHRC. Figures provided are for the period 27 February to 25 March 2002.

There is no other explanation except that the police firings were communally motivated. Even in the instances where there was no overt communal bias there was a tendency to view the attacking mobs and the attacked people attempting to protect their lives and homes with the same yardstick, as criminals on an equal footing. The impact of this is equally apparent in the registration of crimes and subsequent arrests (see following section). As per routine practice, a magisterial inquiry is carried out in cases of police firing. In the present surcharged atmosphere, an impartial judicial inquiry must be conducted, to ascertain the justification or otherwise, into each and every case of police firing in the state.

In short, police action has ranged from active collusion with the mobs to silent inaction in the face of cognizable and serious offences; from state apathy towards formulating and executing preventive measures to the unjustified and frequently biased resort to gunfire. What stands out conspicuously is the total lack of criminal, disciplinary, departmental or any other action against the personnel whose behavior was found to be contrary to established law, service rules or the constitution. Dismissals, suspensions, or even transfers as

a punitive measure against erring officials have been completely lacking.

Officials certainly faced transfers but that seemed to be aimed not at erring against law, but for 'erring' against the government in power. Twenty seven civil servants including 10 IPS officials were transferred on 25 March. These included officers who had taken measures to prevent and curtail the violence in their areas and had won acclaim for it.

How The Guilty Escape Prosecution

In dealing with situations of communal violence, the record of the criminal justice system in our country is far from enviable. The guilty, as a rule, have been acquitted by the courts – either due to defective investigation or else retraction by intimidated witnesses or a combination of the two. The groundwork for this final outcome is laid in the immediate aftermath of the violent incidents.

In Gujarat this process is even more blatant and suggests a pre-existing plan. Its implications become visible from the recording of the crime. The first document through which a crime is cognised is the First Information Report (FIR). Its contents form the basis for subsequent investigation. Discrepancies in the recording of this document can lead to improper investigation and later to acquittal of the guilty.

The single major shortcoming is the grouping together of a number of unrelated crimes into one FIR. These are being referred to by the state administration as 'Running FIRs'. The official justification for this is that each violent mob indulged in a number of crimes when it attacked people and properties of a certain locality. The reality, however, is a far cry from this kind of situation. Different incidents separated over days, concerning different crimes, committed by different groups of people and with different set of victims are clubbed together in one FIR. One example is the clubbing together of separate incidents of arson, looting, stone throwing and killing in

different localities of Kadi town by different unlawful assemblies from the evening of 29 March till the evening of 30 March (see account). Another glaring example is FIR 36/2002 of P.S. Kalol, Panchmahals (see annexure 4). This FIR strings together a.) one incident of a 5000 strong Hindu mob confronting a 2000 strong Muslim mob at 4 p.m. on 28 February at Rabbani Masjid, b.) an incident on 1 March in a hospital compound in which one Muslim was killed by a different mob, c.) the killing of 10 Muslims fleeing from Delol by a large Hindu mob at Ambika society on 1 March, and d.) arson and attack in Boru village on 1 March.

Yet another aspect is the deliberate distortion in the FIRs. To facilitate this, the informant for the recording of the FIR is a member of the police force. If the contents of the FIRs are to be believed, it must be assumed that the policeman is guilty of serious dereliction of duty since the only function he performed was to observe the killings and destruction indulged in by the mobs without either taking preventive or protective actions or even organising help for the victims. To top it all, the informant's vision was able to estimate the numerical strength of the mobs but was incapable of identifying even a single person, considering that many among the attackers were elected representatives or were known functionaries of the ruling party.

This distortion could only be intentional since survivors were easily available to provide an eye-witness account of the happenings. Survivors had taken refuge in relief camps whose location was not unknown to the police. In Kalol, the refugee camp is across the road from the police station, yet the police claim they have not been able to meet the victims to take their statement. The real intention becomes clear once the victims themselves approach the police for the registration of FIRs. Here the existing FIR comes as a handy alibi to deny the survivors the right to file their own FIRs. Their accounts are merely added as statements to the existing FIRs, if at all.

This does not give them the same sort of legal rights that an FIR does, such as the right to a copy of the FIR, or the right to intervene in the court when criminal prosecution is being debated. In relief camps across the state – Godhra, Kalol, Mehemdabad, Kadi, Anand, - survivors neither know of the contents of the existing FIR nor do they know whether their complaints have been incorporated in it. In some cases, the police has been willing to accept statements only if they are not accompanied by names of the accused.

In an attempt to ensure that they are heard, most survivors have been sending their complaints by registered post to the SP and the Collector. They have not received any information from either of the two offices that their statements/complaints have been received and whether they are being entertained. A majority of the FIRs continue to remain without named accused.

Some survivors have also tried to approach the High Court to get their complaints registered. In Himmatnagar 137 victims filed a petition that their shops and business establishments were looted during the time curfew was in force. This has not been translated into an FIR and a panchnama has not been prepared. The Addl. Advocate General appearing for the state agreed to record the statement of the victims. The High Court did not pass an order nor did it chastise the state for failing in its duty and behaving contrary to the provisions of the Cr.P.C. Similar petitions are in court from Radhanpur village in Patan district where one person was burnt alive and the eye-witness identifies the BJP MLA, Shankar Singh Chaudhary among the attackers; and from Kalol in Mahesana district demanding registration of an FIR and recovery of looted goods. This avenue remains limited since few have access to such resources and channels. In these matters the High Court had the possibility to frame guidelines and monitor the implementation of procedure laid down by law. But the High Court has not applied its mind in this direction.

In some cases where the police has refused to register FIRs, victims have filed applications before the Chief Judicial Magistrate to get FIRs registered. In the attack at Gazipurwada (see below), mob firing led to injuries to two women in the leg and the shoulder. They were not allowed admission by the civil hospital at Nadiad town. Having obtained private treatment at Surabhi hospital, the attending doctors told the police to record the women's statements. They recognize the accused but the police was reluctant to take the statement. Finally the women filed a private complaint in the court of the Chief Judicial Magistrate (court enquiry no. 35/2002). The court has accepted the case as a private complaint under S. 202 Cr.P.C. In a private complaint, the onus of investigation is on the complainant. Unlike the police, however, a private citizen has no powers to investigate. In such instances, the case will in all probability linger in the court for years as a civil matter.

Another form of distortion in the FIRs and arrests is where Muslims have tried to resist the attacking mobs. In such cases a single FIR records that a large mob of Hindus (all unidentified) attacked homes, shops and religious places belonging to Muslims. A group of Muslims (some named) pelted stones at the Hindus. The crimes registered pertain to rioting, looting, arson, and desecration/destruction of place of worship. The accused include identified Muslims and an unidentified Hindu mob. The Muslims are arrested for charges of burning their own homes and shops, looting their own belongings and desecrating their places of worship. FIR No. 134/2002 Town P.S. Nadiad is one such case. Between 10 p.m. and midnight on 29 March, a 1000-1500 strong mob attacked Muslim properties in the Gazipurwada area of Nadiad town. Muslims tried in vain to protect their houses. The mob looted and torched the houses and some persons in the mob also opened fire. 15 houses were totally destroyed. The FIR records this, but 65 Muslims were arrested by the police from the spot while no one in the mob was

named. They are arrested for rioting, attempt to murder and dacoity. FIR No. Cr.16/2002 of Vaso P.S., Nadiad records that a Hindu mob of 250-300 people attacked Muslim houses at Palana village on 3 March. One Muslim resident opened fire with a licenced weapon to defend the properties. Nobody was hurt. The FIR registers crimes of attempt to murder and arson to houses. 18 Muslims were arrested. On 28 February in Saraspur area of Ahmadabad, a mob of 5-6000 thousand attacked the Muslim basti, there was also a police firing in which eight persons were killed and about 15-20 were injured. They were all Muslims. FIR No.54/2002 was registered at P.S. Gomtipur and 27 Muslims have been arrested in the matter.

The attack by a Hindu mob at Umeta village in Borsad Taluka on 30 March is recorded in FIR No. 45/2002 Anklav PS. The attack which took place at 3.45 p.m. led to arson and looting of houses and destruction of a masjid. Both Hindus and Muslims are recorded as accused.

The evolving situation is one in which arrests have become a method of intimidating the Muslims, or at least are perceived as such (see table). Moreover, compared to the size of mobs and the offences recorded in the FIRs, arrests of Hindus are, by and large, negligible.

Arrests under Criminal Charges

District	Hindus	Muslims
Anand	284	53
Dahod	41	7
Panchmahals	222	51
Kheda	423	153
Mahesana	190	44
Sabarkantha	161	16

Source: Gujarat Government's submission to NHRC.

In any case, the number arrested does not reflect the number actually in jail. That figure is far lower. While the government refuses to share such statistics, our team found that most of those arrested were released on bail soon after. In Kadi, bail was provided within four days of the arrest, allowing the accused to organise mobs for renewed attacks. In Mehemdabad 17 attackers were arrested from the scene of the crime along with the weapons of assault on 2 March. They were charged under sections relating to murder, arson, dacoity and rioting. They were released on bail since the public prosecutor did not oppose it. In the case of the 22 arrested for the Ode killings, the court disallowed police remand and provided interim bail on the grounds that the accused needed to celebrate shivratri. It is good to see that courts feel that police remand is another word for torture and that the accused have rights including the right to bail. But this has not been the practice in any court of our country. Would the judges do the same for other cases in the future?

The unwillingness to investigate and punish the Hindu attackers is visible in a variety of other ways. The possession of looted goods is potentially a crucial piece of evidence that could have been used to identify and implicate the attackers. Over a period of time, however, these goods find their way into markets and the evidence is lost. This is what has happened in Gujarat. The lack of timely state investigation into this aspect has not only protected the accused against prosecution but has also created an incentive to participate in such attacks in future.

Leave alone investigating the guilty, the state even refuses to investigate the innocent dead. There is a large discrepancy in the number of people officially declared killed and the number killed according to eyewitness accounts (see annexure 3). One of the reasons is the absence of dead bodies and the lack of any attempt by the government to collect physical evidence of these. In Ode village in Anand district, 22 Muslims were locked and burnt alive

in a room. Eyewitnesses say all the 22 people were killed and the dead bodies were reduced to ashes. The police have only registered 2 deaths for that incident. At Limbadiya Chowkri in Panchmahals (see account of Kidiyad village, Sabarkantha), eyewitnesses saw 67 people, including many women and small children, burnt alive in a tempo. Only eight half burnt corpses were discovered. Ergo, only 8 are dead, according to the police. In sharp contrast, after the Godhra train attack, forensic experts were put on the task of collecting the ashes and whatever bone fragments remain for DNA analysis in order to ascertain the number and identity of those killed. The same could have been done for the Kidiyad villagers. In Ode, remains were collected 13 days after the killing. The non-recording of the deaths is convenient for the government in power since it underestimates the gravity of the carnage. For the survivors it implies that they would be denied the compensation to be paid in cases of death.

Given the refusal to register FIRs, the refusal to include names of those accused, the fact that many of those arrested are out on bail - the only option left for many victims is to work out a truce with those responsible for killing and plunder. The problem is particularly grave in the rural areas where the victims owning land have no choice but to return. In many villages, like Kanij (Kheda district), Por (Gandhinagar), Kuha (Ahmadabad), Randhikpur (Dahod), Muslims are being told they can come back only on condition that they keep silent and withdraw the names of the accused from their complaints or FIRs. This is particularly so, where the attackers were influential village leaders. In Por, the accused Patels have even informed the District Development Officer and the panchayat of their ultimatum, but no action has been taken against those who have issued these threats. Justice has obviously gone into hiding.

V. Relief and Rehabilitation

During the course of the investigation the fact-finding team visited 21 relief camps – in Ahmadabad city, in district headquarters, taluk towns and villages. The people sheltering in these camps belong to both urban and rural areas. People are often found in camps far away from their homes; villages and even families have been scattered between camps. The number of people living in the camps fluctuates as people move from the houses of their relatives to the relief camps and back. Some people's attempt to return to their houses also adds to the instability in numbers – few of them are successful and most come back. In some instances, their Hindu neighbours inform the victims that the atmosphere is not conducive to return, in others there is an active opposition to their return accompanied by threats and even more violence. The number of people found in the camps also depends on

the time of day with some residents trying to find work in safe areas close to the relief camps.

Nobody, it seems, has a complete list of the relief camps functioning in the state. District authorities lack a comprehensive list of camps located within a district, and only recognise some camps. A random sampling of camps by our team revealed a consistent pattern across districts – among other things, of the near absence of any government provision. In order to get the government point of view on these patterns, and to lodge complaints regarding the abysmal living conditions we found in many camps, the team spoke to the authorities responsible for relief and rehabilitation – the Revenue Secretary, Government of Gujarat, and the Collectors of Panchmahals, Anand and Sabarkantha districts. We give below our observations regarding the provi-

sion of relief and rehabilitation. It is clear from the official resolution and our conversations with officials that the state does not wish to undertake the responsibility and incur the costs of proper relief measures.

Setting up of Relief Camps

1. Government Refuses to Organise Safe Locations

The Gujarat government did not set up a single relief camp. As the attacks on Muslims continued and spanned virtually the entire state, they fled from their houses in search of refuge. It took the victims in the rural areas a long time to find safe and secure shelters, in some cases over a week. Many of them hid as best as they could in the fields, hills and forests for days together and then traveled long distances in different directions in an atmosphere full of terror and risk. Some found temporary refuge in neighbouring villages, while others tried to return hoping that the attacks would have ceased. Some were killed along the way. Those who managed to reach safety informed the police about others still hiding in the fields. In some cases police rescued the Muslims and brought them to the camps or other safe places such as residences of relatives, or mosques and madrassas in villages and towns with substantial Muslim populations. Sometimes even presumed safe locations turned unsafe, as happened in Nadiad town, which housed many displaced people from villages near and far.

The state administration failed totally in providing safe locations of its own and relied wholly on the existence of certain villages or towns where attacks were less probable. The displaced too did not expect the state to provide shelter especially after its role discussed in the previous chapter. The only refuges available were those set up by Muslim dominated panchayats and/or Muslim/Hindu religio-political organisations, who took upon themselves the task of providing protection, feeding and housing the victims. Dead bodies, as and when they were discovered, were also

brought by the police to these locations. For a whole week after the violence started, provision of relief was neither conducted nor contemplated by the administration.

On 6 March the state government came out with its policy resolution regarding the provisions for relief (Resolution No. RHL 232 002/513/(3) S-4). The resolution glosses over the government's bounden responsibility to provide safe and sanitised shelters for victims. District Collectors (e.g in Anand, Panchmahals) interpreted the lack of orders to organise relief camps as specific orders not to organise them. The Revenue Secretary at the state capital confirmed to us that this is indeed what had been intended.

The Revenue Secretary's explanation is revealing – "in the scenario of ongoing communal attacks victims would feel secure only with their own communities". This is a telling comment (albeit unintended) on the administration's own performance. Victims did approach the police and district administration on innumerable occasions for help and safety. In many cases help was not forthcoming, in others police connived with the mobs or at best watched the killings, in still others the Muslims were saved and left at the charity of Muslim residents in other villages.

When questioned why operation of the camps was not later taken over, the reasoning was equally facile: that the state could not provide security; that it could not set up separate Hindu and Muslim camps; that there was nothing wrong with registered NGOs coming to the aid of the administration. If the state cannot provide security with its monopoly over arms, how does it expect NGOs or camp organisers to do so? What the government is unwilling to admit is that these NGOs are really religious organisations or trusts. The government failure to provide relief thereby pushing people into the fold of various religious trusts will only have the effect it officially deplores – of further communalising society, and forcing different religious groups to arm themselves for self defence.

2. Camps to be recognised subject to certain conditions

The resolution stated that the district administration would provide assistance upto 31 May only to those camps that satisfy a number of conditions. These stipulate that the organisers should be a registered society or trust except those already running camps in which case they need special permission. The camp should have at least 100 inmates. The camp should be located in a clean area, have toilet facilities, medical care, drinking water, and a clean and healthy kitchen. In addition, the camp organisers are to maintain a register recording details of all inmates, the losses and injuries suffered, their time of arrival, departure and place of departure. Violation of any of these conditions can lead to closure of the camp.

Yet there is no clause specifying what happens to the inmates in the case of closure, or in cases where the administration refuses to provide registration to the camp. Where medical, sanitation, water and toilet facilities are lacking, the administration does not take the responsibility of providing this. The role of the administration is restricted to providing a liaison officer and a medical officer to inspect the camp.

The outcome of such a policy is not difficult to imagine. A substantial number of camps in every district have not been recognised by the administration, such as the camps at Kadi (Mahesana district), Mehemdabad, Kesra and Mehraj (all in Kheda district). Not surprisingly therefore, while the number of camps in the official list was 95 as on 13 April, unofficial sources at the time put it at 146 camps in the entire state. While the revenue secretary claimed that there were 6 camps in the whole of Anand district, we found seven camps in Anand town itself and in all, 17 camps in the district. In village Mehraj about 500 people from 22 villages have taken shelter, but when the village panchayat asked for government aid, the response it received was that because no one in the village had been affected by the

Without Comment

The Sarpanch of Mehraj village of Matar taluka wrote to the Taluka Development Officer (Mamlatdar) asking for governmental support to the relief camp at the village.

A translation of the reply is printed below:

To
The Sarpanch
Mehraj village

Subject: Regarding relief for the people affected by communal trouble and taking refuge in Mehraj village

Sir,

With reference to your application dated 14.3.2002 you are informed of the following:

For the people affected by communal trouble and those whose property has been damaged and those who are having difficulty in getting a place to live and food to eat, there is provision for relief to such people.

In this village there are no people of such category therefore we are not sending relief.

sd/-

Mamlatdar, Matar

riots, no aid could be given (see box 1). At this camp grain is being sent by an organisation Jan Kalyan. Similarly when the panchayat at Matar in Kheda district applied for registration of the camp at village Matar in the beginning of April they were told that it was time to wind up the camps and hence new camps could not be registered at this stage.

Some camps that were initially recognized have been subsequently derecognized since they did not meet the stipulated requirements. The relief camp at Jinjer in Kheda district is a glaring example. 200-250 residents continue to stay in the camp as the government refuses to make any provisions for them.

Given the scale of displacement it is impractical to expect any private organisation to deliver. For the state to then penalise them

by withholding recognition without making any alternative provision is criminal. Evidently the state neither wants to help victims itself nor enable others to do so.

Running of the Camps

1. Provision of Food

The camps recognized by the government are not in much better shape either. The only help accorded to the inmates of these camps is a food ration amounting to 500 gm of cereal and 50 gm. each of pulses edible oil, sugar and milk, and a dole of Rs. 5 per person per day. The supplies are supposed to be made on a weekly basis.

At some of the recognised camps that the team visited, supply of rations was irregular and far short of the slated amount. The Kohinoor Rahat Camp in Anand town, for example, started functioning from 3 March when displaced people started arriving. With 700 people, the camp got a week's ration on 6 March. The next week's ration did not arrive. Over the fortnight the number of inmates had grown to 1155 people from 378 families belonging to 95 villages. The next ration on 2 April was sanctioned for 247 people and the amount supplied was even lesser than that sanctioned. Pleas for more supplies fell on deaf ears. The Collector of the district had little to say except that the camp organisers are required to supply accurate figures. What the liaison officer was doing or meant to do is thus unclear. With the exception of the camps at Ahmadabad city, the team could not find the existence of a liaison or medical officer in any of the camps.

One explanation given by a local official was that the control room for relief and rehabilitation is located at Gandhinagar which has to keep track of the migration to and from the camps everyday. There is a lot of migration both ways: in Mehmedabad the inmates numbered 1984 on 3 March and had come down to 732 by 11 April. Of these 534 had left for their village while 718 had gone to stay with relatives. In the Shah Alam camp at Ahmadabad

the inmates numbered 10,537 on 3 March and grew to 13,500 by 16 April. For some inexplicable reason the authorities have only kept track of the number of people going out of the camp and not those coming in. The figures of inmates available with the government are bound to be serious underestimates. The Collector at Anand informed the team that there is no mechanism to sort this out. The decision of the government is final. In effect, then, a system is in place aimed to deny relief: through non-registration of the camps, through faulty recording of the number of inmates and through the lack of a system of redress.

2. Lack of Basic amenities

Except for a few camps in Ahmadabad, basic amenities such as clean drinking water, shelter from the elements, medical and sanitation facilities are completely absent in virtually all the camps in the rural areas and taluk towns.

Santrampur and Kalol relief camps are glaring examples of the total lack of drainage and sanitation, and are sitting ducks for the outbreak of epidemics. The government refuses to provide alternate arrangements, and even the essential food ration. Recent reports suggest incidence of measles, typhoid, gastroenteritis have been on the increase in the camps. In Godhra alone, 60 cases of measles have been reported by doctors doing voluntary work in the camps. On 18 April the Union Health Minister C.P. Thakur admitted that cases of measles had been detected yet restricted the figure to 8 in five camps!

The issue of providing drinking water, sanitation and medical facilities is one of immediate importance with the growing summer heat and fear of heat related illnesses ranging from heat stroke to diarrhoea and cholera. The impending monsoons within a month will make things worse. The Collector of Panchmahals, where some of the worst camps like Kalol and Santrampur are located, washed her hands off the problem by saying that the policy had no provisions for tents and toilets. Given the ab-

sence of rehabilitation and the continuing rioting and tension, relief camps will need to continue for a long time. Government initiatives need to improve substantially in both quantity and quality.

Schooling has practically come to a standstill, apart from religious classes in some of the camps. The government has made no provision for this. There is a need to initiate some income generating schemes for the camp inmates. Many inmates of camps presently lack every sort of personal belonging that is considered necessary for day-to-day life. Many do not have a single change of clothes or even a bit of money in the pocket.

Rehabilitation

Proper rehabilitation of victims involves a number of aspects. First and foremost is an environment free from fear, which at the very least demands that the identified attackers should be absent from the victims' surroundings. Secondly it requires the existence of a house to live in with the belongings necessary to run a household. Third is a means to earn a livelihood: be it employment, or the tools and means to carry on a trade or profession. Where earning members are killed or disabled, sufficient ex-gratia assistance is required to enable families to support themselves.

1. Ex-gratia payments for loss of life and injury

The governmental response to loss of lives and injury is available from three resolutions issued by the revenue department. The first dated 28 February (No. RHL/232002/513/S-4) provides for an ex-gratia payment of Rs. 2 lakh for those killed and injured (mostly Hindu) in the train burning at Godhra. A resolution of 2 March fixed the ex-gratia payment for lives lost in the post-Godhra carnage (mostly Muslim) at Rs. 1 lakh. Following press reports and a public outcry at the discrimination even in death, by a resolution of 9 March, the government chose to bring down the compensation for the Godhra victims to Rs. 1 lakh. This is evidence not just of how cussed the govern-

ment is against Muslims, but how little it cares even for Hindus. The sensible thing to do would have been to have uniformly increased it to at least Rs. 2 lakhs for everyone. By the second week of April compensation had been paid for about 450 deaths. Only recognised deaths (i.e. those on the official list) are being compensated – the death toll in fact is much higher.

This assistance amount in case of death is among the lowest paid to the victims of any communal killings in the recent past. In the Bhopal riots of December 1992, ex-gratia amount was Rs. 2.2 lakh. Since the prices have approximately doubled since then, the equivalent amount today is around Rs. 4.4 lakh. In Bhagalpur in October-November 1989 the amount paid was Rs. 1 lakh, its present day equivalent is 2.8 lakh. In the Congress organised carnage of Sikhs in Delhi in 1984, which is being compared to the present carnage both in the public sphere as well as by the government in Parliament, the amount paid was Rs. 2 lakh. Initially the government ordered Rs. 10,000 as compensation which was increased to Rs. 20,000 by the R.N. Mishra Commission of enquiry. In 1997 the High Court awarded a total of Rs. 2 lakh as compensation with additional interest payable from October 1984 till the date of payment. The amount worked out to Rs. 6.9 lakhs in 1997. Its present-day equivalent is over Rs. 9 lakhs. It should also be noted that the state of Gujarat has among the highest per capita GDP and therefore has a responsibility to provide better ex-gratia assistance, taking into account both the level and cost of living of the people and the ability of the state government to pay.

Even in terms of injuries sustained, the government has been both miserly and blatantly discriminatory between the Godhra victims and others. The 28 February resolution fixed an ex-gratia payment of Rs. 5000-50,000 for permanent disability and Rs. 1000-5000 for temporary disabilities. For the predominantly Muslim victims of the subsequent genocide, a 2 March resolution (RHL/232002/513/(2)/S-4)

provides no payment for temporary disabilities at all. Even for permanent disabilities, the amount has been substantially scaled down: Rs. 2,000 for disability upto 10%, Rs. 3,000 for disability between 10% and 30%, Rs. 5,000 between 30% and 40% and Rs. 50,000 for above 40% disability. These figures were based on a 1992 valuation and not upgraded. In this petty valuation whether the government assesses an injury as 10% or 40% becomes finally immaterial. For some like Mohammad Javed from Kadi village whose hand was blown off by a bomb, the loss of a hand also means the loss of livelihood. He can no longer perform the work of cleaning he used to do.

The procedure for obtaining assistance for medical expenditures of those who were treated privately is designed to deprive them of it. Firstly, the onus is on the victims to obtain a disability certificate from the doctor, obtain a counter signature from the civil surgeon and produce all this before the Collector. Victims who suffer injuries that do not cause permanent disability are denied even this paltry medical assistance.

2. Assistance for damage to property

The single most striking feature of the attacks was destruction and looting of houses and property. It was far more generalized than killing. In village after village, houses, shops and kiosks were torched or demolished. In Kheda district alone, over 3000 residential houses have been completely destroyed, according to official figures. This looting, arson and destruction has affected people cutting across classes, from landless casual laborers and middle class people to rich traders and land owners. The losses suffered by the rich are enormous and decades will be required to make up for what has been lost. For instance, Bohra trader Kasimbhai lost a rice mill in Mehmedabad which is estimated at Rs. 30 lakhs. The losses of the poor may be small in absolute terms but represent everything they have. Making up the loss is harder and they are likely to be pushed further to destitution. People have lost everything from utensils, beds

and bedding, clothes, cash and valuables to houses, tools, implements, means of livelihood and grain stocks.

The assistance for damages to houses, property and household belongings is dealt with through four resolutions. The first dated 5 March provides for cash doles and assistance for household kits. The cash dole is fixed at Rs. 15 per person per day, for a family of a maximum of 5 persons, for a maximum period of 15 days. Though basically a relief measure for those displaced, this has been linked to a more than 50% damage to the dwelling place. Thus people whose dwellings are not substantially damaged and have been forced out because of threats to life are not eligible. It is also not payable to those residing in relief camps. The period of payment of the dole has not been extended even though return is not a possibility, over two months since the displacement. The assistance for household kits is a one-time payment of Rs. 1,250 per family for those whose household goods have suffered damage of more than this amount. Both these payments are dependent on a survey by the administration. As far as the team could ascertain, the administration did not inform or otherwise enable the victims to be present during this survey to explain their loss.

Assistance for movable and earning assets has been fixed at the actual loss with an upper limit of Rs. 10,000 through another resolution dated 11 March 2002. This resolution is based on earlier such resolutions framed in 1986 and 1989. While the 1986 resolution fixed the government assistance limit at 5000, the 1989 resolution had raised it to Rs. 10,000. However, while framing the current resolution it did not occur to the government that 13 years had elapsed and there was a need to change the ceiling limit to at least compensate for higher prices. The eligibility criterion for availing of this assistance requires that the affected person should not have participated in the communal disturbance and should not be named in any criminal complaint. As noted

earlier a number of FIRs concerning attacks by Hindu mobs have falsely named Muslims as accused. This criterion would further victimize those falsely implicated.

A resolution dated 20 March 2002 has fixed the compensation amount for houses lost between Rs. 5,000 and Rs. 50,000 – the same as that fixed in 1992. The process of assessing house damages was begun when the displaced people were too scared to venture out of the relief camps. Thus the assessment of damage to the house - whether damaged, burnt or demolished - was done without an inkling of the original structure. In Kanij village of Khera district where victims have gone back to their houses, compensation received for burnt and destroyed houses ranges from Rs. 1000 to Rs. 25,000. It is not surprising therefore that people continue to stay in canvas shelters outside their burnt houses – the assistance paid to them is insufficient even to repair some of the houses which are partially damaged. About 50 victims of Kadi in Mahesana district have got cash varying from Rs. 200 to Rs. 10,000 for burnt houses or shops. In Mehmedabad camp we heard that a large number of villagers and juggi dwellers of the town have been given Rs. 1700, probably for damaged houses.

The final resolution dated 16 March 2002 fixes the assistance for industries, shops and self-employed people. Here the government provides a 4% interest subsidy for three years on loans of upto Rs. 1 lakh sanctioned by banks and financial institutions. Apart from this, payments of sales tax can be deferred for 5 years and of electricity duty for one year. This again is an exact replica of the policy framed in 1992.

The entire rehabilitation package is seriously flawed. It refuses to recognize the norms set throughout the country for compensation of damages. It relies on policies drafted a decade or more ago without even taking the bother of inflating the amounts specified by the price index. It is insensitive to the problems of the poor. There is no compensation, for example, for the loss of belongings, loss of

days of work, loss of the crop, cattle and grain stocks. The meager compensation being doled out by the government may help some victims tide over their immediate consumption needs. To call it rehabilitation, however, is a fraud.

The Prime Minister visited the devastated state on 4 April, over a month after the trouble began. He announced an additional compensation of Rs. 1 lakh for those killed, rehabilitation of widows and orphaned children, textbooks and school uniforms for children, improvements in the living conditions of relief camps, 35 kg of food grains to victims below the poverty line, and Rs. 50,000 for destroyed houses and Rs. 15,000 for those partially damaged. None of this has been disbursed and, given the complete silence on this count since that date, in all likelihood it will never be. When the government was in a fix in Parliament over the question of dismissing the Narendra Modi government, the Prime Minister declared the release of Rs. 150 crores from the Center on 1 May. The amounts quoted and the schemes declared are meagre in the face of the destruction and killing. But that is the smaller worry. The real issue is whether compensation, relief and rehabilitation are rights of the citizens and their provision is a duty and responsibility of the state. Or will populist slogans and political expediency determine peoples' lives and livelihood?

3. *Alternative livelihoods?*

The effect of the genocide on livelihoods will be a long term one. Several have been rendered unemployed or destituted - Ghaffarbhai of Limkheda, a bidi maker has not been able to return to his village for 2 months, or get work; several young men of Sawala have been unable to drive their autorickshaws and earn a rupee in two months, because it is not safe to pass through Hindu areas. The government's meagre and partisan policy of rehabilitation does not even begin to address the magnitude of the issue.

Several of those now living in camps used to work as agricultural labour in fields belong-

ing to Hindus (e.g. in the fields of the Patels of Sardarpura) or as workers in Hindu owned workshops, brick kilns or factories. They will obviously be unable to find employment there again. While on occasion, the VHP and Bajrang Dal leaders threatened the owners with dire consequences if they continued to employ Muslims, in some instances the Hindu owner of an establishment deliberately re-trenched the Muslim workers. This was the consequence of a systematic campaign of economic boycott of Muslims undertaken by the VHP and Bajrang Dal through leaflets and meetings from 1 March. Casual workers in big and small cities continue to be particularly targeted by the campaign. The looting and/or burning of Muslim hotels, restaurants, trucks and factories also mean loss of employment-not just for the owners and managers but also for the employees of these establishments, both Hindu and Muslim.

Given that till date the state has failed to provide even the basic security for Muslims to reach their places of work - 2 Muslim workers in Ahmadabad were killed enroute to work in early May - or create any alternative sources of livelihood, economic rehabilitation of the victims is obviously last on the government's agenda.

4. The return to 'normalcy': closure of Relief Camps

The government did not set up relief camps. When organisations did, in a number of cases the government refused to recognise these. In those that did receive the state government's tardy, grudging 'recognition' the food supply, and resources disbursed were meager to begin with and did not increase commensurate with the increase in refugees. Security of the victims in camps was left almost entirely in the hands of the 'community'. And when the pressure started building on the state government to restore 'normalcy', in the Gujarat government's dictionary, it was defined by 'the winding up of relief camps'. A curious conundrum emerges- the camps are to be closed down because normalcy has to be

Of Fact and Fiction

For the whole State:

Official figure: 1,11,414 persons or 1.1 lakh

Figures given by NGOs working in relief camps: 1.75 lakhs in relief camps, 30,000-40,000 with relatives, i.e. a total of over 2 lakhs.

For Anand district:

Official figure: 1254 persons in camps

Actual number at Kohinoor Camp, Anand town: 1155 persons

There are 17 camps in the district !

established. And of course, for the rest of the country, normalcy has been established because the camps have been closed down.

The government resolution (RHL 232 002/ 513/(3) C.4) had granted permission for running relief camps up to 31 May. This resolution was passed on 6 March, 2002 long before the fact of continued communal violence in the area became apparent. For many living in relief camps across the state this deadline is far too soon.

At least 3 state ministers (Civil Supplies Minister Bharat Barot, Urban Development Minister IK Jadeja and Home Minister Gordhan Zadaphia) have been campaigning for the removal of relief camps in Ahmadabad (Shahibaug, Shahpur, and Ramol-Jantanagar) on the grounds that they harbour anti-social elements and are becoming a security risk to nearby Hindu residents. Exactly who is a threat to whom is evident from the attack on the camp in Dariyakhan Ghummat, Shahi Baug, by Hindu communal goons in the later half of April. Tear gas shells lobbed into the Dariyakhan Camp 'by mistake' by the police led to the death due to shock of 75 year old Fatimabibi Rehamjibhai on 25 April (The Indian Express, 26/4/2002). In the two camps in Saraspur, Ramanlal ni Chali and Shah Mohammad Roza, inmates fled after their

camp was attacked on April 24 and took shelter in Jamia Faiz-Al Noor J.M Mills compound.

These pronouncements on the Ahmadabad camps came at a time when concrete steps were being taken by some District Collectors to forcibly wind up relief camps. Mamlatdars and police officials in various districts have been threatening to close down relief camps for over a month. Through a GO dated 26/4/2002 the Dahod Collector, posted to the district just a few days previously, abruptly closed down 4 camps in Dahod district with immediate effect.

A number of Muslims do want to go back to their villages. Those with fields need to prepare for the next planting season and avoid their land being encroached upon by others. But a fundamental requirement for going back is a basic sense of security. This comes with food, with shelter, with a means of livelihood, and with the knowledge that those guilty of perpetrating the attacks against them are being prosecuted. In Gujarat today the state is unable to guarantee even one of these to the Muslims who are living in relief camps or to those who have returned to their villages. In Sanjeli, where villagers were sent back after their camp at Dahod was closed, the government has provided an escort of 24 BSF men. Yet, villagers continue to feel insecure – at the height of the attack which left almost 600 houses burnt and 16 people killed, a mob of 30,000 had surrounded the village. Even if the BSF were to save them from further attack, there is little to subsist on. Their houses have not been rebuilt. Their tools and implements, kiosks and shops have been totally destroyed. Only a few have received the limited compensation. Back in their village the victims huddle in the burnt out shells of some houses, in the midst of row upon row of desolate charred structures. The guilty roam free. This is what normalcy looks like this Gujarat summer.

There are many who do not want to return like the villagers of Anjanwa and Pandarwada who suffered grievous loss of life and betrayal by neighbours. Others will be

unable to return, since the family breadwinners have been killed or seriously injured. Where can they go - the two orphaned children who survived Sardarpura; Sultani from Eral, who was raped and widowed with two small children to raise; old and disabled Benaben of Katwara who lost all her savings for her daughter's wedding; Mohammad Javed of Kadi who lost his hand?

In any case, Sanjeli is a rare case, where BSF men were sent as security. In most cases, the state has not made simple arrangements for the protection of Muslims who go back to see their houses, survey the damage, or explore the possibility of returning. In camp after camp, there are accounts of Muslims who went back, overcoming their very legitimate fear, and were beaten up. If their houses and shops were as yet unharmed or simply looted, they were now torched to give them the message that they should not come back. The police who accompanied villagers back to their villages to see the damage and gauge the possibility of going back, repeatedly failed to protect them.

Kulsum Ghani Champaneria of village Sathamba of Bayad taluka, Sabarkantha district, went back to her village on 10 April. The tea-shop she used to run, intact till then, was burnt down and she was told to go back to the camp. Muslim villagers of Vadagam and Bhiloda of Sabarkantha district also had similar experiences. About a week ago 150 families of Sayala village in Panchmahals left the security of the Godhra relief camp and tried to return to their homes. Threatened with dire consequences, they were forced to return to the camp. (TOI, 1/5/2002) The police took Pathan Jafar Khan back to his home in Baranpura, Vadodara, to assess the damage. A mob attacked from all sides even as the report was being filed. The policemen ran and those in the Special Reserve Police tent stationed there refused to come out and help. (Frontline 10/5/2002)

It is unlikely that the state governments and district administrations are unaware of

the price paid by Muslims for returning to their villages, where they have done so. In camps in Mehmedabad, Matar, Anand we were told that the district administration and the police are asking the people to return- even conditionally. As mentioned earlier, in some villages, the conditions include dropping FIRs or the names of the accused. In other places, they have been told to stop wearing all signs of religious identity or offering namaz, if they are to be 'allowed' to come back. Almost everywhere that Muslims have gone back to their villages, it is on the basis of similarly tainted compromises. In some instances, as in Randhikpur, the villagers are battling on trying to get some justice, to get the guilty booked,

and refusing this conditional return. Such resistance is possible only if they have the option to stay on in the camps.

The state forcing closure of camps without even the semblance of rehabilitation or simple protection to victims, well before its own earlier deadline is thus not an innocent desire to establish normalcy. It is a calculated move to ensure two objectives at once- that the Muslim victims go back to villages to live on terms set by the attackers, quietly and without a fuss, subsuming their identity. This then is the bloody politics of 'peace': Golwalkar's vision of a second class status for minorities come true.

VI. Conclusion

Here then is the record of the Gujarat carnage and its aftermath in brief.

The numbers killed among the highest in any riot in recent history. Affecting the population across an entire state. Nearly 3 months after the attacks began, the number of people killed still remain unknown to the government. Or else the government chooses not to divulge the fact.

State connivance at the highest level. True, communal killings have normally not occurred on a large scale without support from state functionaries. A senior police officer commented on the Bombay riots of 1992: "There is no riot in this country that can continue its mayhem beyond 24 hours unless the state permits it." Senior police officials in Gujarat stated the same in a more obscure fashion to say that the problem lies in the fact that the police is answerable to the politicians as well as to the judiciary. But the Gujarat government made a history of sorts by transferring officials at key posts who were successful in #containing and controlling the mayhem.

Gujarat carnage is not the first where the guilty would go scot free. In riot after riot nei-

ther those who organised the killer mobs, nor the state functionaries who facilitated them have been brought to book. In fact the history of such precedents enabled the perpetration of organised killing in Gujarat of such nature and scale. But, Gujarat plans to outdo others in the sheer extent of the planning that seems to have gone into ensuring this acquittal. Prior assurance of immunity from arrest, prison and punishment given to attackers by the VHP/Bajrang Dal leaders as "Our government is in power" was translated into reality by the strategies adopted by the police after each communal attack. These strategies were smoothly and universally implemented – the registration of faulty FIRs before the victims got an opportunity to file their information, refusal to accept such information when it is brought before them, the non-collection of crucial evidence like petrol cans, weapons used to burn and kill, the refusal to register the names of those identified and their 'natural' consequence in a refusal to apprehend them.

The characteristic that makes the Gujarat carnage especially grave is the combination of intensive and focused mobilisation and organisation by the VHP/Bajrang Dal/RSS and

an elected government which is an eager facilitator. Elected representatives and ministers as also state functionaries are openly associated and active members of these organisations. Manipulation of local and structural factors, tensions and resentment, deployment of lies and half truths, control of official machinery and key posts, has led an unprecedented degree of consent for their agenda of hate. Sustained hate propaganda accelerated in the last couple of years, further intensified in the last 6 months, has successfully convinced a substantial section of the majority Hindu community that they are under threat from the Muslims. Myths and prejudices about Muslims have played a vital role in inciting Hindus and adivasis to attack the community. The depth and spread of this build-up and its close association with the state distinguishes Gujarat.

Anti-Muslim mobilisation itself has not made the carnage. It is its translation into official policies and strategies that has enabled the carnage to occur. The public pronouncements and the policies pursued after the communal attacks by those holding the highest offices in the state expose them. There has not been a single unqualified statement condemning the attacks on the Muslim people and their properties. On the contrary there are several statements justifying the killings as a backlash, a 'reaction'. The message is clear.

This refusal to condemn the carnage is implemented in policy. The government clearly does not, even after such ghastly attacks, feel the need to provide succour to survivors or even be seen to be assisting Muslims, at this juncture. This is what makes the Gujarat carnage far more sinister.

What does this portend immediately and in real terms? It means that the communal attacks continue even 3 months and much

army deployment, media and political criticism later. Simply as a brazen declaration of the complete absence of political will to stop them or to sincerely assist Muslims to get justice and to rebuild broken lives and homes. Survivors carry on in relief camps not recognised by the government – 'non recognised victims' of sorts. Food in even several recognised camps is inadequate, sanitation notional, the responsibility for organising security is left to the mercies of respective religious community. In most rural camps schooling, medical help, employment generation are unheard of. Policies formulated for the rehabilitation are such as to prevent the victims from ever being able to stand on their feet. The pitiable compensation being offered for loss of life or livelihood is among the lowest offered anywhere in the country. And Gujarat is among the states with the highest per capita income.

What is evident in all of the above is the consistent and intentional refusal of the state in Gujarat to protect the right to life and liberty of a large number of its citizens in the course of the post Godhra carnage. Amply clear also is the actual collusion with those who took away the fundamental rights of a section of citizens on the basis of their religion, in itself a denial of the right to freedom from discrimination. The state did not really fail in Gujarat — it deliberately suspended the rule of law, and violated the rights of the people and continues to do so. It has to be held accountable.

The Gujarat carnage of 2002 will probably one day, a decade or two later, become part of another forgotten chapter of the history of our people. Its victims marginalised, wanting for both justice and livelihood. Those attempting similar attacks in the future more cocksure of their success. Those who stand by the rights of the individual and a democratic social order need to reflect very carefully on what steps they must take as citizens to isolate and punish the guilty, defend the victims, and ensure such pogroms never happen again.

Annexures

Annexure 1

Accounts of incidents of communal attack in the following villages and urban localities were recorded by the PUDR team in the various relief camps. Very brief descriptions of some incidents not covered in the text are arranged alphabetically below by district. These accounts do not cover all the incidents in the place mentioned. The relief camps visited by the team are:

District	Place (number of camps visited)
Panchmahals	Godhra(2), Kalol(1), Santrampur(1), Lunawada(1), Dahod(3)
Mahesana	Kadi(1), Nandasan(1), Mandali(1), Sawala(1)
Sabarkantha	Modasa(1), Pandpur(1)
Kheda	Mehemdabad(1), Matar(1), Mehljaj(1)
Anand	Kohinoor (Anand)(1)
Ahmadabad	Chartora Kabristan (Gomtipur)(1), Kankariya Shala No.7&8 (1), Bapunagar (1)

Ahmadabad

- 1. Harniyav (relief camp, Mehemdabad)**
Attacked on 2 March, Dargah destroyed. Muslim families were protected by Thakur neighbours. There were only five Muslim families in the village that has a total population of about 20,000.
- 2. Maandal (relief camp Kadi)**
Village has 500 Muslim houses out of a total of 2000 houses. Hawaldar informed the Muslims to leave the village on 28 Feb. Then the mob, Patels from neighbouring villages attacked, 50 people were injured due to petrol bombs, stone throwing, and pellets from gunfire. 50 houses, 15 shops and one soda factory were burnt.
- 3. Sanad (relief camp, Kadi):**
There are about 125 Muslim houses in the village. Attacked on 28 Feb, two houses and one shop were burnt.

- 4. Shah Alam Toll Naka, Ahmadabad city (relief camp, Kankariya shala no. 7 & 8)**
575 people from one small cluster of Bhil hutments were in this one camp. On 28 February at about 12 noon a mob came and started attacking the houses. The hutments are located in the midst of a muslim locality. One person (45 year old Bhagaji Bhil) was injured and later died in hospital. An FIR has been lodged in the PS Dani Limbda. On 1 March again there was an attack on the cluster from multistoried houses nearby. Stones and bottles were thrown at them. Later 60 houses were burnt. The Bhils ran to the Kankariya area and have been there ever since.

Anand

- 5. Ode (relief camp, Anand)**
Ode is a Nagarpalika Kasba with about 300-350 Muslim houses. On 28 Feb 2-3 shops were burnt. Most of the people escaped to the railway station, came back on 3 March. Twenty two people were burnt alive in a room and four others near the village while trying to escape. Apart from these gruesome killings all 3 March. Twenty two people were burnt alive in a room and four others near the village while trying to escape. Apart from these gruesome killings all the houses were burnt.
- 6. Vasad (relief camp, Mehemdabad)**
28 February: One Muslim owned hotel, a mosque and a dargah were severely damaged by a mob. A tractor/ bulldozer was used to level the graveyard. The SRP came to the village. On 1 March a mob of 200-300 people from the village started an attack. The sarpanch was involved. The Muslims left their houses and the village. It appears that at about 4.30 p.m. there was a firing in Vasad in which 1 person was killed and case registered against 6 Muslims. On 2 March a Muslim driver in the state transport service was burnt to death when he went to rejoin work.

Baroda

7. Sokhada (relief camp, Mehraj)

Attacked on 28 Feb, all 150 houses of Muslims were looted and burnt by a mob from outside, which was joined by the local villagers. Sarpanch betrayed them.

Dahod

8. Katwara (relief camp, Dahod)

Attacked by adivasis repeatedly on 28 Feb, 1 and 2 March, one masjid and four houses were burnt. There is a police outpost with 3 policemen in the village but they did nothing. The police from Dahod who were on combing missions promised the adivasis that no action would be taken against them. Police has filed an FIR. Chamars gave shelter to the muslims for one and a half day were than rescued by Zainuddin Qazi from Dahod . Adivasi sarpanch and his wife helped muslims before they escaped.

9. Limkheda (relief camp, Dahod)

On 27th February told that tomorrow bandh. Took sign to agree to bandh. At night, about 500-600 persons started burning motor cycles, cars. We sat in vehicle to go. Fourteen persons were burnt at Dehrol station - four small children are orphans today. We reached people Piplod and stayed at Iqbal Haji Mohammed Dadi's house for two days. On Friday night, mob attacked and started burning wood "peethas" and surrounded us with swords. On Saturday came to Dahod.

10. Piplod (relief camp, Dahod)

Friday 1st March : Meeting at 10 a.m. attended by about 100-150 persons. Decided that at 10 p.m. will kill/burn all muslims. Don't want Muslims here. The Police Sub Inspector present when approached referring to Godhra said, "*Jaisa kiya hai, vaisa bharna padega*" (As you have done so you shall have to have to pay). Rumours were spread that Muslims from surrounding villages are going to come and loot and rape our women.
At about 3 p.m. started from Randhikpur road side, looted and burnt 15 houses. Then on

Godhra Road looted and burnt 10 houses and damaged the masjid. Five SRP personnel, 5 policemen with rifles were present . They said we don't have orders to fire. 20 trucks burnt. Out of 160 houses, only 10-12 left, rest have been burnt.

Five days after the incident, within the railway precincts Habibbhai Gulabbhai Desarwala and Ferozkhan (Pathan) were stabbed and then burnt.

Kheda

11. Godasar (relief camp, Matar)

The village has 50-60 Muslim families and 400 Hindu families. Muslim families lived in a settlement close to the river. While villages in the vicinity were being attacked, the Muslims of the village packed to leave on 1 March. Just before leaving in the evening one Hindu family which lived close to the Muslim settlement was attacked and 3 people killed. The fleeing muslims were hunted down in the fields by mobs during the night. 18 of them were killed.

12. Haldarwas

Muslims (130 houses) On 28 February in the evening , tola of 1500-2000 from outside came, with weapons and damaged the Masjid and broke four shops.

On 2 March rumour spread that 4 trucks of Muslims are coming from outside to kill. The Thakurs said we will not be able to protect you. You leave. Muslims ran away in the fields. All the shops and houses were looted and burnt. The Masjid was destroyed . Were in the wheat fields for a day and night. Rescued by the police and brought to Bapu Nagar Relief Camp on 5th March.

13. Katak Pura (relief camp, Matar)

Attacked by a mob from neighbouring villages, one masjid and two dargahs were destroyed. Sarpanch, a Patel protected them and also their houses. There were 30 muslim and about 100 Hindu families in the village.

14. Lansara Talwadi, Mehmdabad (relief camp, Mehmdabad):

Attacked on 1 March. All 8 Muslim houses

were looted and burnt, stored fodder burnt, goats and hens were stolen. Have got Rs. 1700 as compensation.. No arrests have been made. Attackers threatening villagers. Muslims own 2- 10 bighas of land but too scared to go back.

15. Lawal (relief camp, Matar)

1 March: The sarpanch told the Muslim families to flee. A masjid and a madrasa were attacked and destroyed.

16. Mangroli (relief camp, Mehlaj)

Attacked on 5 March at 10pm. Houses of all three Muslim families completely looted and destroyed. Muslims were sheltered by the Hindu neighbours.

17. Mehemdabad, locality Phata Kalav, Kachai Road (relief camp, Mehemdabad)

Attacked on 1 March by a mob from neighbouring localities, all sixteen kaccha houses of Muslim labourers were burnt. Police was present but did nothing.

18. Mehemdabad Housing society, Mehemdabad town (relief camp, Mehemdabad)

This society had 10- 15 houses of Muslims and about 400 houses of Hindus. Attacked on 1 March, afternoon. Men had gone for work, women and children fled. All belongings looted, houses were not burnt because they did not belong to the Muslims. No complaint filed, no compensation.

19. Mehemdabad town, Mahuda road (relief camp, Mehemdabad)

There were 6 Muslim jhuggis and about 40 –50 jhuggis of the Hindus. Mob attacked on 1 March and burnt the six houses of the Muslim casual labourers. People escaped, six of them by hiding in a tank. Have not gone back to their locality. Each family has got Rs 1700 as compensation

20. Pahad (relief camp, Mehemdabad)

2 March: Following a meeting a small mob launched an attack on the few Muslim houses. The Muslims escaped. The mob looted and burnt shops and looted houses.

21. Sadra (relief camp, Mehemdabad) : Sole house of a daily wage labourer, two cycles, utensils were looted. No FIR filed.

22. Vaso (relief camp, Matar)

2 March: At 12 noon a mob came from outside the village, and was helped by Hindu villagers to attack the Muslims. The Muslims ran for shelter in the wheat fields. All the houses were razed to the ground and all property looted. One person who returned was ordered to go away.

Mahesana

23. Aanundara, (relief camp, Kadi & Nandasan)

There were 95 Muslim houses out of over 2000 houses in the village. On 28 March they were informed by the Patels that attack would occur. Attack occurred at night, all the houses and a masjid were burnt. Complaint was filed with names of the attackers. FIR also was filed. But no arrests have been made.

24. Chandkheda (relief camp, Nandasan)

28 February : about 10.30-11 a.m. tola came and burnt two houses. Muslims ran away in vehicles. 5-6 children left behind. Went back and collected them, despite a tola of 2000 at some distance.

25. Khatraj (relief camp, Nandasan)

There were 45 Muslim households and 500 Hindu households. A hotel at the highway near the village was attacked by the mob on 3 March. So the Muslims (all casual labourers) left for Nandasan camp because of fear and have not gone back since then.

26. Leach (relief camp, Mandali)

Attacked on 28 Feb and 1 March, six out of eight houses, one flour mill, 4-5 shops were burnt. No FIR filed.

27. Meda Adraj (relief camp, Kadi)

1 March: A mob of 500 comprising village Hindus and those from 5 neighbouring villages attacked the village. The Muslim houses were attacked, and 2 persons, Kallu Mian Imam Mian and Hasina were hacked and burnt. The police arrived and fired, killing 3 of the attackers. Several accused were named in the FIR. 14 were in custody when we went, and 10 were absconding.

28. Paliyar (relief camp, Nandasan)

28 February : 7—80 persons armed with talwar, dharia, spears looted and burnt two houses. 4-5 persons attacked Chandmian Mastanmian Fakir - fracture, 42 stitches. Recognizes assailants.

29. Santej (relief camp, Kadi)

28 February: The household goods of the sole family of Muslim migrant workers (from UP) living in a Hindu landlord's house were looted. The village Rabaris brought them to the security of the camp.

30. Ukadi Namwada (relief camp, Kadi)

A few days after 28 February, 6 houses belonging to Muslims were set on fire and a mosque and a madrasa were demolished. Muslims given 2 hours notice to leave the village before the attack.

31. Veedaj (relief camp, Kadi)

During the Gujarat and Bharat Bandh days the Muslim owned Rajvansh hotel nearby was looted and a dargah of Rajya Peer near this village were destroyed. Only one Muslim family in the village, which was brought to the camp for security by the police.

Panchmahals

32. Allindra (relief camp, Kalol)

Manje-Pir -Dargah: Mohabbat Shah Yusuf Shah Diwan is at the Dargah and has a house next to it. He is also a Vaidya. Past six months Hindus stopped coming to him. On 28.2.2002, 100-150 persons attacked , including his next door neighbour' son Vikrambhai Parbatbhai Singh and Ranchodbhai ST conductor, and burnt the dargah and house.

33. Athambda (relief camp, Kalol)

Mustaf Yusuf Sheikh, tempo driver at Panchmahal Diary. Had gone to collect milk in dehat. He was burnt to death along with the tempo. His conductor Kiranbhai Baria resident of Athambda knows the names of the killers. Leaves behind mother, wife and two daughters- 21/2 and six months old. FIR at P.S. Kalol.

34. Derol Railway Station Village, (relief camp, Kalol)

On 27 February night 200-300 strong mob of Bajrang Dal, VHP took out rally, burnt a saw mill owned by a Muslim. On 28 Feb. a 700 strong crowd attacked, killing 4 persons in different incidents in same village. Set timberyard and Muslim houses and shops on fire. Police came during attack, but went back without intervening. Recorded as part of combined FIR in Kalol P.S. No names of accused noted in it though eyewitnesses recognise many.

35. Divda Colony (relief camp, Santrampur)

1 March: At 12.45 p.m. an abusive armed Hindu mob of 100-150 surrounded the house of Mohd. Hanif Abdul Rahim Shaikh. They set fire to the house with 7 people inside it. When they came out the mob hit Maqsud, s/o Mohd. Shaikh and burnt him alive while the rest of the family was able to hide. The local police arrived at 2.05 p.m. and drove away the victims as well as the attackers. Two shops owned by the victim was also looted and burnt. Mohd. Hanif Shaikh got an FIR registered naming the accused. No action has been taken in the case and the investigation has not proceeded. Hanif is being pressurised to withdraw his complaint.

36. Kalol, (relief camp, Kalol)

28 February: 15-20 policemen including SI RJ Patil fired at Muslims near Rabbani Masjid in Kalol town. Irfan Yusuf who had come for namaz was injured. He was taken to hospital where he was lynched by a mob of 100 people, recognised by eyewitnesses. Incident part of combined FIR in Kalol P.S (36/2002).

37. Khanpur (relief camp, Lunawada)

1 March: 2500 people collected at 10 p.m. at one end of Khanpur attacked a Muslim diesel-petrol shop, and other Muslim owned shops in the market. Then they killed retired headmaster, old Husainbhai with arrows. The mob also burnt, looted 40 houses. Ironically, one of the victims whose house was destroyed was Sanskrit teacher Mohd. Ilyasbhai, who has won the Vrihad Gujarat Sanskrit Parishad award for the Best Sanskrit Teacher the last two times.

38. Malav (relief camp, Kalol)

28 February: At about 4 p.m. a mob of about 100 attacked the village with 36 muslim households. 6 cabins/kiosks were burnt and houses were looted and the mosque attacked and broken. 17 people were named by victims in complaint letter dated 15/3/2001 given by them to the DSP.

39. Malwan, (relief camp, Santrampur)

28 February: A rally of about 250 Hindus shouting slogans went around the village where there were about 45 Muslim households. A large mob came at about 7 p.m., and broke the maulana's house, the madrasa and one more house belonging to a Muslim. The mob came back again on 1 March at about 4 p.m. and looted and burnt 12 Muslim houses. All the Muslims in the village ran away to the hills around the village. They sought police protection on 2 March and were brought to Santrampur in a vehicle sent by the Ghanchi Panch which learnt of their plight. An FIR has been lodged. 16 accused have been named by the victims in their statements.

40. Mota Sandia (relief camp, Santrampur)

27th, 28th February and 1st March nothing happened.

On 2nd March a mob of about 3000 armed with guns, dharias, talwars and lathis attacked and looted. The Muslims ran and took shelter with adivasi houses. After the looting, the mob came and threatened the adivasis. We stayed 3 days with the adivasis. Fourth day the army rescued us and brought us to the relief camp.

41. Santrampur (relief camp, Santrampur)

28 February: At about 9.30 p.m. about 150 armed Hindus with licensed guns, swords etc. (recognised by the victims) attacked the Sant area of Santrampur. Two brothers (Rasul and Hakim Husain Ramzani) were hacked with swords when they came out with sticks to protect their houses, and one of them had to go through an operation and prolonged treatment at Baroda. The mob then left. A large mob of 2500 came the next day on tempos and tractors. The Muslims all ran away, and the mob burnt the houses, a mosque, 1 madrasa and 2 dargahs.

Some of the members of the mob were recognised by the victims.

Patan

42. Chanasma (relief camp, Nandasan)

28 February: At 2 pm Bajrang Dal meeting in the village to plan which shops, houses to attack, burn. On 1 March, 400-500 persons came to Indira Nagar at 8 a.m., ran away when the police came. At 11 a.m. they came again in a larger mob of about 2000 persons, looted and destroyed houses, destroyed Masjid and burnt it. Muslims escaped to the fields. 65 year old woman Jaanbai was burnt to death by the mob. The mob discovered the Muslims as they were hiding in the Harijan houses, and sprinkled petrol on them and was just about to set them on fire when the police arrived and rescued them.

43. Khorsam (relief camp, Kadi)

28 February: As villages around Khorsam were being attacked the villagers ran away to the camp out of fear of attack.

Sabarkantha

44. Andkhol, (relief camp, Panpur)

5 Muslims from Kachh used to work as agricultural labourers. 3 of them were killed and 2 are missing.

45. Chandap (relief camp, Panpur)

1 March: Mob of 2000 carrying swords, dharias came at about 6 p.m. and started attacking the muslim houses. They broke and destroyed the houses and the mosque. The houses of the muslims were later burnt. All muslim owned shops were looted and burnt.

46. Hadmatiya, (relief camp, Panpur)

On 27 Feb. 4 persons came and started a fire which was doused. The Muslims ran away to the Harijan mohalla, and returned on 28 Feb. Around 6-7 p.m. about 5000 people came in 5 tolas. Mostly Kachhi patels shouting 'Miya bhai ko maar daalo!' The Muslim ran away to the forest, stayed there for 3 days, Darbars and Harijans helped them till they were rescued 3 days later. 50 Muslim houses were burnt and also cattle.

47. Modasa, (relief camp, Modasa)

In the GIDC Hazira Vistar area located in a Hindu area of Modasa mobs started blasting Muslim owned factories using detonators. This continued for 3 days till 2 March, even though curfew had been imposed on 28 Feb. itself. 80% of the establishments in the GIDC area in Modasa are Muslim owned. On 19 March, there was a police firing in which 3 Muslims were killed and 9 injured. On 4 April one truck and one tempo (Muslim owned) were burnt and 2 Muslim drivers were stabbed and 1 died. There was a police firing again and 1 Muslim died.

48. Panchkuada (relief camp, Kadi)

Though Muslims in other villages in Dhansura taluka were severely attacked after 27 February, Muslims in Panchkuada were relatively secure, as the village Hindus had offered them protection. However for one month after the Dhansura attacks, rumours kept circulating that an attack was imminent. On 27 March, before Holi, fearing an attack, the PI told them to leave for a more secure place, due to the possibility of attack by Hindus. Their houses were attacked after they left.

49. Prantij (officials and people in Prantij)

28 February: An armed mob from neighbouring villages gathered and attacked the shops of Muslims. A few shops of Hindus were also burnt. In the Indira Nagar area two and a half km away from Prantij 15 houses were burnt and 1 Muslim murdered. 1200 Muslims from Indira Nagar and surrounding villages are staying in a camp in Prantij due to a continuing sense of insecurity.

50. Raigarh, (relief camp, Panpur)

On 28 Feb. a meeting was held at 3.30 pm where it was decided to attack the Muslims at night. At 7.45 p.m. about 300-400 strong mob looted and burnt 10-12 shops. On 1 March there was a meeting at 9 am and at 9.45 am they started burning the remaining Muslim shops. The Muslims ran away and about 9 km away Darbars of Shajapur, Bhiloda helped them.

51. Salal (relief camp, Panpur)

28 February: Armed mob of 2000 from Salal and neighbouring villages came and started attacking the Muslims, looting the houses, breaking and destroying the mosque. They were given shelter in a rice mill and a Darbar's house in the village. The attackers burned the Muslim houses. The police came at 7 a.m. and brought them to the camp. They later learnt that one woman Zubeidaben Walibhai Memon who could not escape was burnt to death. Her body was recognised by the jewellery she was wearing.

52. Vadagam (relief camp, Panpur)

On 27 Feb. about 250-300 strong mob came and burnt 2 wooden stalls, one Maruti and one jeep. The Muslims were rescued by the DSP. On 22 March a meeting of Kachhi patels took place at 1.45 p.m. and a 4000 strong mob armed with swords, dharia, trishuls and guns attacked village Muslims. The police said that they could not protect them. The sarpanch arranged for them to reach camps.

53. Vaniyad (relief camp, Modasa)

On 28 February and 1 March the village was attacked by a mob and the 15 odd Muslim families were on the run. 55 year old Kankroliya Dawoodbhai Rasulbhai and Sulemanbhai Rasulbhai who lived on their farm about one and a half km away were killed by the mob on 1 March and their bodies thrown into a well. The police discovered the bodies when they floated up on 5 March.

Annexure 2

List of Accused in Incidents Described in Chapter 2

Following are the lists of names of the accused in different incidents as identified by the victims. Some of the names figure in various FIRs filed, some are there in the complaints sent by the victims to various authorities and some figure in the eyewitness accounts.

VILLAGE PANDARWADA

Jasubhai Patel - Taluka up-pramukh
Anilbhai Manubhai Modi - Sarpanch.
Dr. Kodarbhai Prajapati
Mansukhbhai Patel
Amrutlal Manilal Panchal - gramsevak
Rajni Manilal Panchal
Ambalal Parshottam Pandya - ex sarpanch
Raman Pitamber Joshi (Kalkatti)
Sanjay Mama
Sana Jesingh Damore
Mehta Pravinchandra Manilal
Damor Soma Puja, district delegate of BJP
Jayanti Manilal Barot
Mahendra Vakil

VILLAGE ANJANWA

1. Raisingh Pula Baria
2. Kalu Somabhai
3. Salam Abha Baria
4. Roopa Soma Sehlot
5. Balvant Jiva Baria
6. Dalia Jetha Baria
7. Dashrath Vaja Damore
8. Ratna Kalu Vaghad
9. Rama Kalu baria
10. Babu Jeeva Baria
11. Mahesh Parshottam Bhoi
12. Fata Rupa Baria
13. Uda Jeeva Baria
14. Parvat Jeeva Baria
15. Kalu Shana Baria (Veni village)
16. Deputy Sarpanch (Veni)
17. Bhathi Kal Damore (Veni)
18. Shana Anada Baria (Vankadi)
19. Kalu shana Baria (Godhar)
20. Ramsingh Punja Damore (Veni)
21. Bharat Punja Damore (Veni)
22. Dhana Rupa Shelat (Anjanwa)
23. Kalu Jyoti Damore (Veni)
24. Prvat Raisingh Khant (Veni)
25. Hardeepsinh Jadav (Metral)
26. Babu Pandore (Vena)
27. Khatra Moti Nayak (Vena)

VILLAGE DELOL

Those who led the mob in Delol on 1/3/2002 were:
Ashok Patel alias 'Don' (Ramnath village)

Prabhasingh Chouhan (Mehlool village, BJP MLA)
Pravin s/o Prabha Singh Chauhan
Another son of Prabhasingh
Jeetubhai Ramanlal Shah of Delol

Those who attacked Yusufbhai's family in Delol village on 1/3/01, followed them to the bus-stand and killed them near the river Goma
Sanjay Kumar Navnitlal Bhatt, Govt. servant
Kirit Bhikhalal Parikh
Rathod Jhinhabhai Balvantbhai
Shambhubhai Patel (of Kandej village)
Shah Jitendra Ramanlal
Neerav patel (Ramnath village)
Rakshit Patel (Ramnath village)
Ashok Don (Ramnath village)
Several others from Ramnath, Kandej, Bedia, Khadki, Nesda, Ghoda, Harkundi, Himmatpura, Jhankaripura, Harsalia and other nearby villages were recognised by eyewitnesses.

AMBIKA SOCIETY, KALOL

Names of people who attacked the tempo and killed and burnt fourteen people:
Sheetal Patel - Peoples Bank Clerk
J.P.Shah - Peoples Bank Manager, Kalol
Jaggubhai - Vijay Talkies Owner
Vijay Thakur - Khodiyar Pan Centre owner.
Two persons have been arrested in connection with the tempo attack: Sailesh Kumar Ambala and Ramesh Kumar Parmar u/s 143, 147, 148, 149, 195, 435, 436, 302, 427, 323, 504, 506/2, 153(A), 295.

VILLAGE ERAL

Several named accused of looting and attacking houses, and some named for murdering 7 of a family, and raping at least 2 women.
Narendra Singh Chandulal
Rajendra Vitthal, tehsildar
Bailalbhai Maganbhai Parmar
Indravadan Ambalal Patel - arrested u/s 302 IPC
Kanubhai Bharatbhai Parmar
Ganpat Vithal
Passhotam Gordhan
Mahesh Chandra Singh Parmar
Bhai Lal Magan
Shiva Shah

Raju Vithal – Taladi
 Dinesh Chandu Vithal
 Rameshbhai Mani Baia
 Chandra Singh Ram Singh Parmar
 Shiva Shabi Parmar
 Jitu Parmar
 Mahendra Sema Baria
 Jaswant
 Arjun Singh Ram Singh Parmar
 Subhash Bhim Singh Parmar
 Parvatman Mangal Parmar
 RajendraVithal Parmar
 Jayanti Pamar
 Ashok Chatra Singh Parmar
 Bhailal Bhagan Baria
 Arvind Vithal
 BJP president Kalol Tehsil
 Vikram Vaichak

VILLAGE BORU

The persons from the villages of Boru ki Muvadi, Boru, Bakrol and Bhatroli Bujurg named by eyewitnesses

Fatai Singh Haribhai Solanki (Boru ki Muvadi)
 Shankarbhai Chandabhai Solanki(Boru ki Muvadi)
 Balwant Singh Shanabhai Solanki (Boru ki Muvadi)
 Madhav Singh Shanabhai Solanki (Boru ki Muvadi)
 Sakrabhai Motibhai Bhoi (Bakrol)
 Chatra Singh Shana Solanki
 Dinkar Lal Shankar Lal Panchal
 Rama Daji Baria (Bhatroli Bujarg village)
 Chandra Singh Vajbhai Solanki (Boru ki Muvadi)
 Arjun Singh Vakant Singh Chauhan (Boru ki Muvadi)
 Chiman Valand (Boru ki Muvadi)
 Ramanbhai Ramabhai Baria (Boru ki Muvadi) village
 Hasmukhbhai Mistry - From Boru ki Muvadi village
 Chatra Singh Khatubhai - from Boru village
 Pramodbhai Prabhat Barot - from Boru village
 Sanabhai Fakir Bariya- from Boru village
 Dinu Shankar Panchal - from Boru village
 Yadu Kumar Navneetlal Vyas - from Boru village
 Mahendra Singh Soma (Solanki) - from Boru village

Vikram Singh Soma (Solanki) (Boru)
 Bhartbhai Chaturbhai Baria (Boru)

VILLAGE RANDHIKPUR

Rajubhai Naranbhai Lavar
 Pankaj Lavar
 Karan Jesingh Vanjara
 Mukesh Jesingh Vanjara
 Kesar Khima
 Raju Chhagna Harijan
 Lala Akhamb Raval
 Gopal Babubhai Vania, of RSS
 Bharatbhai Navi of Limkheda, of RSS
 Kamlesh Purushottam Vania
 Umesh Purushottam Vania
 Shailesh Bhatt, ex Sarpanch
 Nitesh Bhatt
 Raju Soni
 Pradip Moria
 Vijay Moria
 Lala Doctor
 Lal Vakil

Accused of rape of Bilkees

- 1 Jaswant Nai
- 2 Govind Nai
- 3 Naresh Moria - brother of Pradeep Moria

VILLAGE SANJELI

Digvijay Singh Chauhan (Bajrang Dal)
 Mukesh kumar Nand Kishore Purohit (VHP)
 Jagdish Premchand Jain (Bajrang Dal)
 Ramchandra Ghanshyam Aggrawal
 Dalsukh Bhur Singh
 Vijay Singh Dalpat
 Harshad Kumar Premchand Jain (Bajrang Dal)
 Subhash Chandra Premchand Jain
 Mangelal Premchand Jain
 Sanjay Kumar Bachubhai Soni
 'Ram' (an alias) of Suliath village
 Narwatbhai Dangi (Suliath)
 Hardeep Singh Jadav, (BJP leader, Methral)
 Sailesh Darji (Mora)
 Dr. Naveen Chandra Desai (Mora)
 Bipin Chandra Bhoi (Mora)
 Dimple Kumar Ochavllal Desai (RSS leader)
 Police Jamadar Rathod - Sanjeli outpost
 Sailesh Kalubhai Raloti

Lakhman Ramchand Prajapati
Pankaj Kumar Sagarmal Jain
Bhaktubhai Khat (village Methan)
Hirabhai Jhalaiy (Vandeli)
Jivabhai Damor (Mander)
Vichiyabhai Sarpanch (Handi)

VILLAGE POR

Natubhai Babubhai Patel (Bajrang Dal)
Jayantibhai Babubhai
Kantibhai Babubhai
Girishbhai Melabhai Prajapati
Kalpeshbhai Melabhai Prajapati
Ramanbhai Babbubhai Patel, Sarpanch
Sumanbhai Raojibhai Patel, BJP leader
Vipulbhai Pranbhai Patel, BJP leader
Makkabhai Bachhubhai Patel
Prakash Ambalal Kathiawada
Sumibhai Jayantibhai
Vipulbhai Gordhanbhai
Pankajbhai Rasiklal
Raju Lalbhai
Vinubhai Gokalbhai
Keshabhai Pashabhai Chamanbhai Pranbhai Patel
Surajbhai Ishwarbhai
Piyushbhai Chamanbhai
Bharatbhai Keshabhai
Kalpeshbhai Rameshbhai
Nileshbhai Rameshbhai
Bharatbhai Modi
Vinu Ambalal
Ramesh Ambalal
Sanjay Chaturbhai
Keshabhai Becharbhai
Jayantibhai Pareshbhai
Yogeshbhai Manibhai
Sureshbhai Patodi,
and many others from Por, and also people from
Motera, Chandkheda, Jhundal, Ambapur, and
Khoraj villages. Eyewitnesses gave a total of 95
names of Patels involved in the attack.

VILLAGE ABBASANA

Mehtaji Diwan Sang
Vanaji Mehtaji
Kantuji Mehtaji
Atuji Mehtaji
Dhamaji Ranuji

Maitaji Ranuji
Vaghuji Diwan Sang
Hapaji
Padhia Sureshbhai Chimanbhai
Kaluji Chelsang
Tinaji Chelsang
Rajuji Chelsang
Sukhaji Chelsang
Dansang and Parvatsang (Gunjala)

VILLAGE KANIJ

Darbars from the village. (No specific names
available)

TOWN KADI

Ramesh Bachubhai Patel - municipal councillor
Babu Bhaia Kachwala, of VHP
Satish Bacchubhai Patel
Kadu bhai Ummed bhai
Vasubhai Chaganbhai Patel
Rawal Laliyo Tampo
Bharat Kr. Parsottam Das Patel
Kiritbhai Chaganbhai Patel
Dinesh Chunni Lal
Rawal Bharatbhai Keshabhai
Rawal Ashok
Amrit alias Dada Patel
Patel Amrut Lal
Rawal Tikabhai Nabhabhai Patel
Rawal Dilipbhai Rameshbhai
Rawal Vijaybhai Chatur bhai
Rawal Babubhai Bhakrabhai
Rawal Bharatbhai Baldevbhai
Rawal Bharatbhai Ramabhai
Rawal Amrit bhai Kanti bhai
Rawal Kantibhai Gobindbhai
Rawal Rameshbhai Dhualabhai
Rawal Rohitbhai Rameshbhai
Rawal Kammbhai Rameshbhai
Rawal Kantabhai Shakrabhai
Rawal Vasubhai Chaganbhai
Khodabhai Kantibhai Patel
Rajubhai Kantibhai Patel
Rajubhai Becharbhai Patel
Valand Maherhai alias Jethabhai
Bhagwanbhai Sindhi
Narendrabhai Barot

Barot Narendrabhai Pannubhai – municipal
concellor
Barot Kiritbhai Ranhodhbhai
Barot Narendra Lalji
Patel Rajubhai Bechaldas
Rawal Rayabhai Mangalbhai
Patel Dineshbhai Pushottam Das
and over 86 others

VILLAGE SARDARPURA

Accused
28 persons named in FIR. Specific names not
available

VILLAGE VISNAGAR

Prahladbhai Mohan Lal Patel Ghosa - MLA
Daya Purushottam
Babubhai Purushottam
Ramesh Daya Madhabar
Vilata bhi Ghosa Patel- BJP dhara sabhya
Narayan Bhai Lallu Bhai Patel -BJP dhara sabhya,
of village Unjha
Anupji Chanduji
Mahendra Topa Patel
Ramesh Patel
Rajput Shivaji Ambuji
Jitaji Chanduji
Chaturji Kuwarji
Bhaiji Amthaji Rajput
Ramesh Prajapati
Parthiji Amthji
Jitaji Kanaji
Jhilaji Kanaji

VILLAGE KIDIYAD

Eyewitnesses and survivors from the second tempo
(No. GJ 9T 6439) fleeing from Kidiyad recognized
some of the attackers at Limbadiya Chowkri
Mahku Singh Moti Singh-contractor of Khanpur
Arvind Singh Ranjit Singh- of Isrod
Kapil Dev - owner of a milk van
Babubhai Chamar - of Jetpur near Vadagam
Nareshbhai - of Gogawada

VILLAGE MALAV TALUK KALOL DIST. PANCH MAHAL

Rasik Munubhai Patel
Mahendra Bachubhai Patel

Sanjay Ishwarbhai Patel
Parimal Chotabhai Patel
Jitu Bachubhai Patel
Raju Ishwarbhai Patel
Dilip Babubhai Shah
Harman Shanabhai Dairywala
Ullas Dahyabhai Dairywala
Bhola Shakrabhai Baria
Bhola Jethabhai Baria
Takurbhai Weldingwala
Danjibhai Salat
Mukund Ochavlal Shah
Virkabhai Zokhambhai Bharwad
Dineshbhai Kishorbhai Patel
Mayur Purushottmbhai Patel

Annexure 3

Discrepancies in the official records and the actual number of people killed

The official figure of the dead in Gujarat carnage is
an underestimate of the actual number of people
killed. This underestimation is because of serious
discrepancies in official record of the dead and the
actual number of those killed.

Even in our limited fact finding we came across
several examples of such discrepancies.
For instance, sixty seven people of village Kidiyad,
district Sabarkantha were killed, when attacked at
Limbdiya Chowkri while trying to escape in the
tempo (Tempo No. GJ 9T 6439 Tempo 407).
Names of those killed have been communicated to
the police by the survivors and are given below.
However as per the official record the number of
people killed in this incident is just eight.

1. Pathan Rasida Bibi Taju Mia(28 years)
2. Pathan Talib Husain Taju Mia(6)
3. Pathan Taqdir Husain Taju Mia(1)
4. Sindhi Lalu Mia Gullu Mia(55)
5. Sindhi Nazma Bano Lalu Mia(22)
6. Sindhi Rasida Bano Lalu Mia(18)
7. Sindhi Nabi Mia Lalu Mia(15)
8. Sindhi Lalo Bibi Sidhu Mia(38)
9. Sindhi Arif Husain Sidhu Mia(15)
10. Sindhi Ashiq Husain Sidhu Mia(12)
11. Sindhi Idal Mia Dalu Mia(48)

12. Sindhi Jena Bibi Idal Mia(40)
13. Sindhi Mustafa Bhai Idal Mia(20)
14. Sindhi Khatun Bano Idal Mia(17)
15. Sindhi Hafiza Bano Idal Mia(15)
16. Sindhi Dalu Mia Ramzan Mia(80)
17. Sindhi Femida Bano Mahmood Mia(18)
18. Sindhi Saddam Husain Mahmood Mia(10)
19. Sindhi Pinto Bhai Ayub Mia(12)
20. Sindhi Lali Bibi Bacchu Mia(40)
21. Sindhi Firoz Bhai Bacchu Mia(20)
22. Sindhi Satu Bibi Ibrahim Mia(50)
23. Sindhi Nasim Bano Iqbal Mia(8)
24. Sindhi Razia Bibi Faqir Mia(50)
25. Sindhi Saida Bibi Bhiqum Mia(28)
26. Sindhi Ashiq Husain Bhikhu Mia(5)
27. Sindhi Shabana Bano Bhikhu Mia (2)
28. Sindhi Hamida Bibi Shafi Mia(27)
29. Sindhi Sajid Bhai Shafi Mia(5)
30. Sindhi Naseem Bano Shafi Mia(2)
31. Sindhi Shabnam Bano Shafi Mia(7)
32. Sindhi Tina Bano Shafi Mia(3 months)
33. Sindhi Wahida Bibi Mohammad Husain(25)
34. Sindhi Akbar Bhai Adam Bhai(10)
35. Sindhi Sakeena Bibi Dosu Mia(75)
36. Sindhi Sayeeda Bibi Basheer Mia(35)
37. Sindhi Sadaam Husain Bashir Mia(12)
38. Sindhi Altaf Husain Bashir Mia(8)
39. Sindhi Shaheen Bano Bashir Mia(5)
40. Sindhi Muskan Bano Bashir Mia(3 months)
41. Sindhi Hanifa Bibi Isub Mia(30)
42. Sindhi Tofiq Husain Isub Mia(7)
43. Sindhi Guddi Bano Isub Mia(3)
44. Sindhi Abeda Bibi Habib Mia(35)
45. Sindhi Islam Bhai Habib Mia(1)
46. Sindhi Hafiza Bibi Rahim Mia(30)
47. Sindhi Rustam Bhai Rahim Mia(4)
48. Sindhi Imran Bhai Rahim Mia(3)
49. Sindhi Imtiaz Bhai Rahim Mia(6months)
50. Sindhi Shamina Bano Sabbir Mia(12)
51. Sindhi Mohammad Sabir Suleman Bhai(14)
52. Sindhi Marium Bibi Faqir Mia(55)
53. Sindhi Sadina Bano Faqir Mia(24) mentally and physically challenged
54. Sindhi Amu Bibi Juma Mia(45)
55. Sindhi Hafiza Bano Juma Mia(15)
56. Sindhi Ismil Mia Juma Mia(17) mentally and physically challenged
57. Sindhi Pinto Juma Mia(10)

- Guests from other villages visiting Kidiyad, killed on the tempo at Limbadiya Chokdi:
58. Sindhi Iqbal Miru Mia(15) Residence Vatavatipa Taluka Mahuda Dist. Nadiad
 59. Sindhi Mohammad Husain Mannu Bhai(45) Resident of Rehman Pura, Kheralu Dist. Mehsana
 60. Sindhi Mumtaz Bibi M Husain(35) - do -
 61. Sindhi Tina Bano Rafiq Mia(15) Residence Vatavatipa Taluka Mahuda Dist. Nadiad
 62. Sindhi Firoza Bano Tazu Mia(18) Residence Bilamana Taluka Dehgam Dist. Gandhi Nagar
 63. Sindhi Pirzada Guludeen Imam Mia(80) Resident of Karanta Khanpur Dist. Panchmahal
 64. Sayeed Zahir Bhai Imam Mia(36) Residence Pandarwada Khanpur Dist. .Panchmahal
 65. Saiyyad Ruksana Bibi Zahir Mia(32) - do -
 66. Saiyyad Sabir Husain Zahir Bhai(1) - do -
 67. Saiyyad Ameena Bibi Imam Mia(75) -do-
- Similarly the official figure of those killed in village Pandarwada, district Panchmahals, is 23, though our team managed to get names of twenty nine people of the village who were killed. Besides according to the survivors eight dead bodies could not be identified because they were burnt beyond recognition. One dead body was found from the well and could not be identified. This brings the total dead in Pandarwada to at least 38.
- Ayyub Habib Saiyyad (25)
 Abdul Abbas Saiyyad (50)
 Abbas Nathu Sheikh (30)
 Murad Mehboob Sheikh (30)
 An old man from Bala Sinor (Kheda District)
 Shaikh Bismillah Habib (20)
 Rahim Siddiq Ghanchi (65)
 Majid Abdul Sayyed(18)
 Shaikh Dulhanbibi Ashrafbhai (60)
 Shaikh Habib Ashraf (45)
 Sahikh Abbas Nathu (35)
 Shaikh Niyaz Nabi (30)
 Yasin Shebab Sayyed (38)
 Fakir Mohammaed Shaikh (40)
 Diwan Zabirsha Ayyubsha (30)
 Ghanchi Zabir Ghani (40)
 Shaikh Salim Shabbir (25)
 Ghanchi Adam Abdul (45)
 Multani Manu Shonkhan (55)

Shaikh Rafik Karigar (25)
Shaikh Shaheenbanu Rafik (24)
Shaikh Yusuf Ahmed (30)
Shaikh Zakir Dasot (22)
Shaikh Mustak Fakir Mohd (18)
Shaikh Javed Mustak (21)
Zabirbhai Vazabhai Kharidi (32)
Multan Chand Tekri (50)
Rahim (10)
Salim Abbas (35)

The PUDR team got names of 280 people killed in the incidents till 15 April included in section 3. These are only a few incidents of sixteen villages and towns of Panchmahals, Ahemdabad, Kheda, Gandhinagar, and Sabarkantha districts. This number does not even include the incidents of Ahmadabad and Baroda where the number of people killed is significantly higher. Also most of the districts of Gujarat were actually affected by the carnage. In the light of all of this this figure of 280 from 16 villages and towns indicates that the official figure of about 950 people killed is an underestimation.

Annexure 4

Translation of FIR No. 36 dated 1/3/2002, Kalol PS

The FIR clubs together three incidents that constitute separate crimes.

Kalol Police Station

FIR No. 36/02

IPC section 143,147,148,149,435,436,302,427, 323,504,506(2) and B.P. Act 135 and IPC 153(A) and 295

Time and Date of incident: 1-3-2002 during 1600 hours to 2000 hours.

Place of crime: Rabani Masjid, Botha Bazar and Nala at the corner of Ambika Society and the corner of GIDC, referral hospital CHL Kalol and at village Boru Town.

Crime informed on: 2nd March 2002, 0/50,

Accused: Crowd of Hindu community and crowd of muslim community

Text: I, R. J. Patil, senior Police Sub Inspector, Kalol Police station, the matter of my complaint is

that following the incident that took place on 27 February 2002 communal riots broke out. So in order to maintain law and order today 1-3-02 since morning I and the policemen and the SRP men were patrolling the Kalol town. At 4 o'clock near Rabbani Masjid on one hand about 5 to 6 thousand Hindu men armed with sticks and dharia and on the other hand about 2000 men of muslim community with swords, dharia, chappa and chura and stones confronted one another (amne – samne) and shouted kill, hack and started throwing stones at one another. Therefore we gave instructions on the mike to the crowd to disperse and told them that if they did not disperse, we would lathi charge them. In spite of informing them there was no effect so we threw eight cell of tear gas. This had no effect on the crowd. We took recourse to mild lathi charge. In spite of this the crowds became uncontrollable and attacked each other. Since we were present with bandobast we were forced to fire in order to do our duty. We got order from Executive magistrate and we fired one round in the air from our service revolver. Even then the crowd was uncontrollable. And this uncontrollable crowd burnt vehicles and destroyed cabins and shops and set fire to them and on the other hand the crowd of hindu community destroyed Rabani masjid and set fire to it and destroyed cabins and shops and set fire to them and burnt thelas. In order that there would be no more damage to life we were forced to fire in the air so the ASI Shana Bhai Lakha Bhai fired 21 rounds from 303 and police constable Praveen Singh Amar Singh fired 29 rounds from 303 and police constable Kishore Singh Takhat Singh fired seven rounds from 303 and police constable Udai Singh Pratap Singh fired 11 rounds from 303 and police constable Girish Bhai Kanna Bhai fired 6 rounds from 303 and police Keshan Bhai Babar Bhai fired 10 rounds from 303 and crowds of both sides dispersed. In this firing six men of muslim community were injured by bullet firing whom the people of their crowd carried and ran away. Of whom one man was badly injured, he was put into a tempo and was taken to referral hospital. The crowd chased him and the compound of the hospital burnt him along with the tempo. After that uncontrollable hindu crowd came to the corner of Ambika Society on Godhra road and

chased a tempo as a result the tempo driver lost control and hit the nala and turned upside down in the nala. The ten men in the tempo of the muslim community were burnt alive by the crowd. The name and addresses of these 10 muslim men are not known and another tempo was surrounded and stopped at the GIDC corner by the crowd of people and burnt and damaged. After that more police men came and the senior officer also came and his body guard Mathur Bhai Khatra Bhai fired two rounds with his Stan gun and threw two cell of tear gas. As a result the crowd ran here and there and dispersed.

Then information was received on Telephone from Boru village that at Boru village about two thousand hindu men of surrounding villages had collected and were burning muslim houses. So immediately I and nayab police inspector of Halol and executive magistrate sahib and a fire fighter reached Boru village at 8pm, the crowd were burning the houses of muslim community and the crowd became uncontrollable so when we gave them instructions to disperse they threw stones at the police at which many policemen were and janooni crowd might do a lot of damage to life so I got an order for firing from executive magistrate and ASI Sona Bhai Puja Bhai fired two rounds from his service revolver and armed police constable Vir Singh Man Singh fired one round and police constable Dalpat Singh Jai Singh fired three rounds from 303 and police constable Chimman Bhai fired 8 rounds eight rounds from 303 and head constable Jaswant Singh Aay Singh fired four rounds from 410. The crowd ran here and there and dispersed but the fire of the burning houses did not come under control and the houses were burnt and damaged. In this police firing no information about loss of life has been found. Therefore I registered a legal complaint against this crowd of people.

Complainant

R. J Patil in the presence
(senior police Sub Inspector) of R.J. Patil
Kalol police station

Annexure 5

Socio-Economic Factsheet on Gujarat

	Gujarat	India
Area (000 km)	196	3287
Population (in millions), 1991	41.3	846.3
Density (person per sq.km.)	211	230
Sex ratio 1991	1071	1079
Urban Population 1991	34.5	25.7
Villages	18,000	587,200
STs as % of pop	14.9	8
SCs as % of pop	7.4	16.7
Literacy M	73.1	64.1
Literacy F	48.6	39.1
Annual per capita net national/state domestic product at current prices (1995-96)	11,036	9321
Average monthly per capita expenditure in current prices (1993-94)		
Rural areas	303	281
Urban areas	454	458
Daily per capita calorie intake		
Rural	1994	2153
Urban	2027	2071
	Gujarat	India
% of villages electrified	98.8	86.8
Households using electricity		
Rural	67.5	37.1
Urban	89.7	82.8
Registered Motor vehicles per 1000 population (1995)	68	33
% of pop covered by TV	77	84.5
Birth rate 1994-96	26.4	28.1
Death rate 1994-96	8	9
Total fertility 1995	3.2	3.5

Source: Seminar, 470, October 1998.

Annexure 6

RSS Ideology and Agenda in Gujarat

Since it has been in power in Gujarat, particularly since 1998, the RSS/BJP government has taken a number of steps to apply state power to the victimization of minorities. It is important to keep in mind that there is a clear ideological basis to this agenda, and that this is the culmination of a long term

program, which the RSS would like to apply to the rest of the country. M.S. Golwalkar, who succeeded Hegdewar as Sarsanghchalak, or chief of the organisation in 1940, laid down much of its ideology in 'We or Our Nationhood Defined (1939)':

'The foreign races in Hindusthan must either adopt the Hindu culture and language, must learn to respect and hold in reverence Hindu religion, must entertain no idea but those of the glorification of the Hindu race and culture, i.e. of the Hindu nation and must lose their separate existence to merge in the Hindu race, or may stay in the country, wholly subordinated to the Hindu Nation, claiming nothing, deserving no privileges, far less any preferential treatment – not even citizen's rights'

Three quarters of a century later - when saffron mobs stopped Muslims and ordinary Hindus in Ahmadabad at spear point and forced them to say Jai Shri Ram; when the RSS stated in Bangalore that the safety of the minorities lay in the goodwill of the majority and not in the rule of law; when Vajpayee in Goa accused Muslims everywhere of causing trouble and praised Hindus for 'allowing' minorities to worship their own gods - they were only openly implementing what they have been saying in their writings all along.

When Hindutva mobs raped, burnt and killed Muslim women, men and children - torching them in tempos (Limbadiya Chowkri), electrocuting them in their houses (Sardarpura) massacring them in fields (Pandarwada), slitting foetuses from their mothers' wombs (Ahmadabad) – no doubt they had Golwalkar's dictum in mind:

'To keep up the purity of the Race and its culture, Germany shocked the world by her purging the country of the Semitic Races – the Jews. Race pride at its highest has been manifested here. Germany has also shown how well nigh impossible it is for Races and cultures, having differences going to the root, to be assimilated into one united whole, a good lesson for us in Hindusthan to learn and profit by.'

Not just 'separate and unequal' then, but better 'dead'.

Since 1998, a series of administrative measures have been taken to reduce minorities to second class status, as a prelude to establishing a fullfledged Hindu

Rashtra. In January 2000, the Gujarat government removed the ban on government servants joining the RSS, although it was later forced to retract the order. In practice, however, the RSS runs the government by remote and not so remote control – with the Chief Minister himself a former RSS Pracharak, and Home Minister Gordhan Zadaphia, a VHP leader. RSS functions like the sankalp shibir held at Ahmadabad in February 2000 are provided with full government support, like free electricity, water and land, in sharp contrast to the treatment meted out to organizations of adivasis and others fighting for their economic rights, leave alone Muslims or Christians.

During BJP rule, there have been over 40 attacks on Christian churches, houses, educational institutions and individuals by the VHP and Bajrang Dal, with the majority occurring between December 1998 and January 1999 in Dangs district. In what is now emerging as a consistent pattern of blaming the victims after ostensibly coming to offer succour, Vajpayee rounded off his visit to the Dangs by calling for a 'national debate on conversions.' As was to be expected, his speech was followed by attempts to burn down the prayer halls at Dhuda and Lahancharia villages in the Dangs. In 1999, the Director of Police (Intelligence) sent around a letter (Ref. No. D.2: Hindu-Christi/83/99, dt.2.2.99 (1058)) to all DSPs and Police Commissioners asking for a census of Christians and their activities. A similar circular was sent around about Muslims (D:2/2: Com/Muslim Activity/84/99 dt. 1/2.2.99).

In 1998, the BJP government set up a police cell to monitor inter-religious marriages. A number of pamphlets authored by the VHP or the Hindu Jagran Manch and reproduced in mainstream Gujarati papers dwell on the notion of Hindu women being abducted by Muslim men. In '98, such rumours led to communal riots in Randhikpur and Sanjeli in Dahod district. In 2002, couples in mixed marriages have been singled out, and many have been forced to live separately.

Education is another field where the RSS controlled government has attempted to intervene. Attempts were made to get all schools to subscribe to the RSS magazine Sadhana, before the order was withdrawn due to protest from minority educational institutions. Schools have to compulsorily get their

teachers trained in Sanskrit. In schools run by the Ahmadabad Municipal Corporation exams are held on Id. The Gujarat State board textbooks praise the Aryan race and the caste system, describing the varna system as ‘a precious gift of the Aryans to mankind’, while Muslims, Christians and Parsees are described as ‘foreigners’ (Social Studies, Class IX).

While urban Gujarat has traditionally had an image of cosmopolitanism – with women driving around alone on scooters late at night, and has been home to several national educational institutions of repute like IIM, the National Institute of Design, and the School of Architecture in Ahmadabad, or MS University in Baroda – there has been a visible growth of Shiv Sena style Gujarati nativism, with the demand that Gujarati students should get first priority in these institutions. In 1998, the VHP/Bajrang Dal invaded the School of Architecture, broke furniture and stabbed a male student. One horrified alumni told us that the reasoning they offered for this was that “girls wore jeans and girls and boys talked to one another.”

As in all wars where nationalist jingoism is whipped up, the Kargil war in 1999 became an opportunity for anti-Muslim sloganeering and mob attacks leading to riots at Dariapur, Dabgarwad, Vadigam, and Kalupur in Ahmadabad.. In February 2000 there were bomb attacks on the homes of Muslim families in Paldi area of Ahmadabad by BJP corporators so that no Muslims would move into the area. Everyday life under BJP/RSS rule is thus being slowly vitiated, with every sphere – worship, marriage, work, education, settlement, clothes - being subject to attempts to keep religious communities apart and assign minorities secondary status.

The most glaring indication of what was to come in 2002, however, was provided by the large scale destruction of Muslim property in 2000. The parallels between 2000 and 2002 are striking. In that case, the attack on Amarnath pilgrims by the Lashkar-e-Toyibba served as an occasion for the VHP to call a statewide bandh in protest, which was supported by the BJP government. The bandh enabled the VHP and Bajrang Dal to go on the rampage, stoning and destroying Muslim properties. Naroda road in Ahmadabad was one of the places from where violence started, with attacks on Muslim bakeries. The dargah of Hajarat Sayeed Masoom Ali was burnt and

the Mujavar of the dargah beaten. Muslims from the Municipal Labour Quarters, Naroda were forcibly evicted and shops owned by Muslims ransacked. Similar violence was witnessed in Surat, Vadodara, Modasa and other areas where Muslim businesses were burnt, looted and destroyed. The role of BJP, VHP and Bajrang Dal leaders is clearly documented, but then, as now, the police were pressurized not to register their names in FIRs and take no action against them. The 2000 violence led to significant ghettoisation as Muslims moved to safer places. The total Muslim property loss was estimated as over Rs. 50 lakh. Hindu losses were estimated at little under Rs. 4 lakh, while the damage to state property (in the form of state transport buses etc.) was about Rs. 6.5 lakhs. This was apart from 13 dead and 17 injured (from both communities).

In the light of this previous and recent history of violence sparked by a VHP/BJP bandh, the government failure to contain the violence post Godhra, and its decision to support the bandh is completely inexcusable. It is clear, on the contrary, that the government willed the genocide. The theory that this genocide was a ‘natural reaction’ and a ‘consequence’ of what happened at Godhra ignores the systematic buildup of hatred against and victimization of the minorities. Godhra was an excuse not a cause.

Sources for this section: Quami Ekta Trust, Communalism Combat et al, Saffron on the Rampage: Gujarat’s Muslims pay for Lashkar’s deeds, Mumbai 2000; Then they came for the Christians, AIFOFR, Mumbai, 1999; Teesta Setalvad, Situating the Saffronisation of Education. In Sahmat, The Saffron Agenda in Education, Delhi 200; M.S. Golwalkar, We or Our Nationhood Defined, Nagpur 1939; our own factfinding.

Annexure 7

The Immediate National Context

preparations for temple construction at ‘Ramjanmabhoomi’/Babri Masjid.

Several victims we spoke to in the camps in Panchmahals traced the beginnings of anti-Muslim feelings in their villages to the 1990s Ayodhya mobilisation. Some of the victims from Pandarwada

said that earlier both Hindus and Muslims used to celebrate all their festivals, like Moharram and Garba, together at the central chowk in their village. After 1992, the Hindus named this chowk Ayodhya Chowk. “Now we don’t go there anymore. They say it is their chowk.”

The violence that attended Advani’s Rath Yatra from Somnath in 1990, and the aftermath of the Babri Masjid demolition on December 6, 1992 as well as its consequences for Gujarat barely needs reiteration (there were more deaths in Gujarat than UP, for example). During the Kumbh Mela in January 2001, the VHP ‘Dharm Sansad’ decided that the construction of a Ram temple on the site of the demolished Babri Masjid would start on March 12 of 2002. The date was later shifted to March 15 as being astrologically more propitious. The campaign conveniently coincided with the UP elections and was seen as a major factor that would help the BJP.

A Chetavani Sant Yatra (lit. Warning that Holy Men were on the move!!) left Ayodhya on January 20 and reached Delhi on the 26th. At their meeting with the Prime Minister on the 26th, the VHP demanded 67 acres of so-called ‘undisputed land’ on which to begin construction – never mind that the sanctum sanctorum of the temple according to its architectural plan lies squarely on the disputed site. In the months preceding the March 15 deadline, groups of kar sevaks, now calling themselves ‘Ram sevaks’ began going to Ayodhya to prepare for this eventuality. While the BJP at the Centre made noises about sticking to the NDA agenda and a court verdict, several BJP MPs booked train tickets for these karevaks to go to Ayodhya on their ministerial quota. It was while one of these groups was returning from Ayodhya to Gujarat on February 27, that the Sabarmati express was burnt, followed by a systematic pogrom of Muslims across the state.

Even as the country watched the massacres in Gujarat unfold with horror, it was simultaneously subject to the spectacle of an organisation doubling up as both government and extra constitutional opposition to it. The NDA government, led by Vajpayee (himself a proud Swayamsevak), asked the RSS to ‘mediate’ between the BJP and the VHP (set up by the RSS in 1964). It was then the turn of the Kanchi Sankracharya, who speaks for the disputing Ram

Janmabhoomi Nyas, to be asked to negotiate a ‘compromise’ between the Nyas and the Babri Masjid Action Committee. VHP chief Singhal (and others like BJP President Jana Krishnamurthy, and VHP International President Pravin Togadia) veered between saying they would accept a court verdict and insisting that it was a matter of faith, agreeing to a symbolic yagna on the 15th and then asserting that it would be accompanied by a movement of the pillars to the site. As the deadline approached, the President of the Ramjanmabhoomi Nyas, Ramchandra Paramhans threatened to commit suicide on March 14 but finally let it be known that he would accept the symbolic donation of a stone in the area of Ramkot village, allegedly the village of Ram’s birth, and far enough from the disputed territory. Divisional Commissioner Gupta who had been initially designated to receive the stone on behalf of the government was replaced at the last minute by Shatrugan Singh, on the grounds that he was a bania! The government has since asked the Allahabad High Court to expedite hearings on the title suit.

Source for this section: daily newspapers and television for the months of January, February and March.

Annexure 8

A brief background to the rise of communalism in Gujarat

In this section, we try to provide a brief overview of the social and political background to the rise of the BJP and of communalism more generally in Gujarat. The Jana Sangh, the precursor of the BJP, was set up in Gujarat in 1951. By the 1960s, the RSS and Jana Sangh were able to mobilize upper caste sentiments – Rajputs, Brahmins and Vaniyas – culminating in major riots in Ahmadabad and other parts of Gujarat in 1969. The Hindu Dharm Raksha Samiti formed in 1968 was an important catalyst for the violence, and although the initiative in leading mobs and providing money to the rioters was taken by the RSS and Jana Sangh, the Congress government in power at the time failed to control the violence and was on occasion, even complicit with it. The Justice Jagan Mohan Reddy Commission of Enquiry investigating the 1969 riots in Ahmadabad remarked: “What

could be expected from law enforcing and governmental agencies is a proper appreciation of the communal atmosphere prevailing in a state... In our view on the facts disclosed by the government and other records already referred to, the law enforcing agencies could not have but known that the communal atmosphere in Ahmadabad had become tense." (see also annexure 9).

The 1974 Nav Nirman student movement was an important moment in the state's political development, involving a variety of oppositional and civic forces in protest against a corrupt government. However, it also gave the RSS and Jana Sangh visibility on a broader platform with middle class appeal. By the time of the 1981 and 1985 anti-reservation agitations, the RSS was actively involved, and there was an increase in upper caste Gujarati chauvinism in the guise of Gujarati asmita. Anti-reservation feelings shaded easily into communal tensions with riots occurring across the state between 1986 and 1988. The 1989 Ramshila Pujan involving the collection of bricks from every village, and L.K.Advani's 1990 Rath Yatra starting from Somnath led to a new low in hate politics. The demolition of the Babri Masjid was followed by riots all over Gujarat in 1993, with the worst occurring in Surat. These lasted over six months, claimed 200 lives and involved the mass rape of Muslim women.

In the 1980s, Madhavsinh Solanki, Jinnabhai Darji and Sanat Mehta forged the KHAM (Kshatriya, Harijan, Adivasi, Muslim) alliance, which helped the Congress to come back to power in both 1981 and 1985. Growing factionalism within the Congress and the compromises made by Amarsinh Chaudhary helped the BJP and RSS to gain ground. The urban upper castes were in any case the staple base of the BJP, but through the 1980s the RSS/BJP also reached out to OBCs like the Kolis (through Shankarsinh Vaghela's pro-BJP Kshatriya Samaj), to dalits (through the RSS front Samajik Samrasta Manch which promised caste equality) and adivasis (through the Vanvasi Kalyan Ashram, the Vanvasi Hindu Sangam etc.). In 1990, Chimanbhai Patel took power on a Janata Dal-BJP platform, with the Congress extending support from outside, once the BJP withdrew after Mandal. The Congress and its KHAM alliance was by now finished.

The religious polarization created around the Ramjanmabhoomi issue helped the BJP to win 20 out of 26 Lok Sabha seats in Gujarat in 1991 and sweep the Vidhan Sabha elections in both 1995 and 1998. However, the BJP is as factional as the Congress. In 1996 Shankersinh Vaghela split from the BJP and formed the Rashtriya Janata Party. This was replaced by the BJP proper in 1998, with Keshubhai Patel as chief minister. He in turn was replaced by former RSS Pracharak Narendra Modi as Chief Minister.

The growing communalization of the Gujarati polity and mind has been possible, at least in part, because of the absence of a viable left alternative. Unlike many of the other states, Gujarat has not had a strong trade union movement, in part due to the paternalism of the old mercantile class, the Mahajans. The closure of the textile mills in Ahmadabad destroyed whatever fragile working class culture existed.

At 15%, the percentage of adivasis in Gujarat is higher than the national average (8%), with most of them living along the eastern belt. The adivasi experience in Gujarat has been quite distinctive, under the impact of a strong Gandhian tradition of social reform. Their ashram shalas and temperance drives in adivasi areas, coupled with Bhagat movements and Bhajan Mandalis have created a fairly Hinduised adivasi population. There have been some adivasi struggles in recent years, for example, for minimum wages in the 1980s, or for regularisation of cultivated forest land in the Dangs in the 1990s. However, such movements or the Narmada Bachao Andolan in Gujarat have found it very difficult to make themselves heard – with the local media lining up completely behind the state government against their demands. Efforts were made by the administration to prevent the Dangi Mazdoor Union from having meetings on forest rights by putting pressure on Gandhians to deny them use of their halls, police intimidation etc. The Ambedkarite dalit movement in the state, which took the form of a militant land struggle in Saurashtra, conversion to Buddhism and the development of Dalit literature under the Dalit Panthers, was faced with the anti-reservation movement in the 1980s and there have been concerted attempts since to co-opt them into the Hindutva fold. Given state

repression and an overall climate of NRI funded religious revivalism, the space for any kind of alternative thinking has been progressively reduced.

Religious cum social expressions like Pandurang Athavale's Swadhyaya movement have also not taken stands against communalism, while many members of the Swaminarayan sect, another major religious bastion in Gujarat, have been found culpable in the 2002 genocide. Although Gujarat is also known as the co-operative state, with Amul and SEWA being touted as success stories, and there are a number of NGOs working on natural resource management etc., there is no reason to assume that all 'NGOs' are necessarily secular. For instance, RSS organisations like the Bharat Sevashram and the Hindu Milan Mandir have also been active in Gujarat since the 1970s organizing Ganesh festivals and carrying out welfare measures among the backward castes.

Source for this section: Ghanshyam Shah, The BJP's Riddle in Gujarat: Caste, Factionalism and Hindutva. In Thomas Blom Hansen and Christophe Jaffrelot, The BJP and the Compulsions of Politics in India, Delhi, 1998; Essays by Harish Khare, and Ghanshyam Shah and interview-conversation between Rameshchandra Parmar and Ashok Chaudhari, Seminar 470, October 1998.

Annexure 9

1969 Riots in Ahmadabad

Some Facts:

	<i>Hindu</i>	<i>Muslim</i>
Damage to Property (Rs. lakh)	75.86	347.38
Houses, godowns, factories, huts destroyed	671	6061
Religious places destroyed:	3	93
No.of dead:	24	430
Unidentified: 58		
No.of displaced people: 27,750		

4 government camps were set up and 7 private camps were set up by Muslim organizations. There were 20,500 victims in the government camps and 7250 in the private camps.

Some of the observations of the Commission:

The figure of the dead arrived at cannot be taken as certain. Some dead bodies were burnt without sending them to the hospital for post mortem. The maximum figure of the dead given by the police was 660, which should be taken as the minimum.

The attacks on Muslims and Muslim property were planned and organized attempts. It is therefore difficult to accept the argument of the police that it was difficult to ascertain if the attacks were preplanned or spontaneous.

The police, in spite of having complete information, allowed organised destruction of Muslim properties in some incidents, without intervening to stop the attackers. The police adopted a partisan attitude in arresting mainly the minority community individuals, in comparison with Hindu rioters when unprecedented mobs of Hindus in thousands attacked the lives and property of the Muslims. Among the arrested, the majority are Muslims. In lodging complaints also, attempts were made to weaken the cases against Hindus and tighten those against Muslims.

The Public Health Joint Secretary in charge of relief did not visit the private camps, which had about 7250 victims. The Chief Minister and his colleagues were also hesitant to visit the camps.

There was delay in calling the army.

There was delay in imposing curfew when trouble started. The state government later took a unilateral decision, without the permission of the army, to relax curfew. The state government was slow, partisan and did not take enough action to create confidence in the minority community by visiting the camps or punishing the guilty.

Some of the recommendations of the commission:

At public functions no Hindu ceremonies should be performed.

Mohalla samities involving all communities should be formed.

Radio should be used to refute rumours and for broadcasting eminent people's appeals for peace to religious communities and leaders.

A person should be given the charge of inspecting communal writings in newspapers and reporting to the concerned official

Newspapers publishing communal writings should be banned.

Religious and political leaders must observe restraint in acts and speeches during the riots.

A Riot Commissioner, of the Brigadier level army officer, be appointed for each state to coordinate law executing agencies so that incidents can be viewed neutrally, practically and stern action can be taken.

A non-governmental organization of leaders of all communities should be formed to assist and help the riot victims. All State relief should be distributed through this organization and not through any political parties who would take advantage of the calamity.

The Special Branch should be reconstituted so that the work of collecting information is not left entirely on head constables, many of whom have no subtle knowledge of discerning differences of political and social thought processes, or of presenting the correct picture. The Special Branch should make a list of individuals prone to rioting, communal minded people, the goons and the anti-social elements and update it at intervals and keep a strict watch on them and not hesitate to arrest them in time, keeping in mind the form of trouble.

There should be an increase in the number of police chowkis and stations according to the needs of the area.

There should be a similar increase in the police force on the basis of these riots.

Each police station should be adequately equipped with weapons etc

A Government Secretary level, efficient official should be appointed to conduct an inquiry into the communal biases of the police. The charge against the police is not that they used excessive force, but that they did not use enough force against the rioters or that they were partisan in using force. In this case, the order for a judicial inquiry would not diminish their morale.

The S.R.P. should be used like the B.S.F., C.R.P. or the Army, and not like the police force. Control over it should also be examined.

The Commission should be given an independent infrastructure to assist it in collecting information and properly presenting it; or there must be at least one advocate to assist the Commission, who will not favour any particular agency. .

Source for this section: The report on the Communal Riots in Ahmadabad and Other Parts of Gujarat on 18th September, 1969 and onwards. Presented to the government by Hon. Justice P. Jagan Mohan Reddy [Supreme Court], Justice Nasarvanji Vakil and Justice Akbar S. Sarela [both judges, Gujarat High Court] on 24 October 1970.

'Maaro! Kaapo! Baalo!'

***State, Society, and Communalism in
Gujarat***

People's Union for Democratic Rights

Delhi

May 2002

COVER - 4

Published by: Secretary, Peoples Union for Democratic Rights, Delhi (PUDR)
For Copies: Sharmila Purkayastha, Flat No. 5, Miranda House Staff Quarters,
Chhatra Marg, Delhi University, Delhi - 110007
Printed at: Hindustan Printers, Navin Shahdara, Delhi - 110032
Suggested Contribution: Rs. 10